

European Security Union

Dietrich / Pilniok

2025

ISBN 978-3-406-81045-9
C.H.BECK

schnell und portofrei erhältlich bei
beck-shop.de

Die Online-Fachbuchhandlung beck-shop.de steht für Kompetenz aus Tradition. Sie gründet auf über 250 Jahre juristische Fachbuch-Erfahrung durch die Verlage C.H.BECK und Franz Vahlen.

beck-shop.de hält Fachinformationen in allen gängigen Medienformaten bereit: über 12 Millionen Bücher, eBooks, Loseblattwerke, Zeitschriften, DVDs, Online-Datenbanken und Seminare. Besonders geschätzt wird beck-shop.de für sein umfassendes Spezialsortiment im Bereich Recht, Steuern und Wirtschaft mit rund 700.000 lieferbaren Fachbuchtiteln.

Dietrich/Pilniok
European Security Union

beck-shop.de
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

beck-shop.de
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

European Security Union

Law and Policies

edited by

Jan-Hendrik Dietrich

Arne Pilniok

beck-shop.de
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG
2024



Published by

Verlag C.H.Beck oHG, Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany,
email: bestellung@beck.de

Co-published by

Hart Publishing, Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, United Kingdom,
online at: www.hartpub.co.uk

and

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG, Waldseestraße 3–5, 76530 Baden-Baden, Germany,
email: [nomos@nomos.de](mailto:nemos@nomos.de)

Published in North America by Hart Publishing

An Imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing 1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA



ISBN 978 3 406 81045 9 (C.H.BECK)

ISBN 978 1 5099 6543 4 (HART)

ISBN 978 3 7560 1930 4 (NOMOS)

© 2024 Verlag C.H.Beck oHG,
Wilhelmstr. 9, 80801 München

Printed in Germany by
Beltz Grafische Betriebe GmbH
Am Fliegerhorst 8, 99947 Bad Langensalza

Typeset by
Reemers Publishing Services GmbH, Krefeld
Cover: Druckerei C.H.Beck Nördlingen



chbeck.de/nachhaltig

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Verlag C.H.Beck, or as expressly permitted by law under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to C.H.Beck at the address above.

The publisher also reserves the right to use reproductions of this work for the purpose of text and data mining.

Preface

The Member States of the European Union are moving closer together in ensuring internal and external security. To achieve this goal, the EU Security Union Strategy (COM(2020) 605 final) outlines a comprehensive framework and mission statement. However, a closer examination reveals several areas that require further clarification, particularly regarding the scope and significance of Member State sovereignty. The reservation stated in the third sentence of Art. 4(2) TEU is significantly ambiguous in terms of legal interpretation. Following the recent judgments of the European Court of Justice on data retention, it remains unclear, how far the ‘sole responsibility of the Member States’ for their ‘national security’ extends and which contradictions between Member States and the European Union could arise.

Against this backdrop, an international symposium, sponsored by the European Parliament and funded by the German Federal Ministry of the Interior and Community, was held in Brussels in June 2022. The symposium provided valuable insight into the potential and limitations of European security cooperation, leading to a more substantial discussion and a clearer understanding of the constraints placed on action by both the European Union and its Member States.

The contributions in this book are based on the outcomes of the symposium. We are grateful that we were able to attract so many renowned experts from politics, academia, administrative practice and civil society as authors. The contributions first address political approaches, structures and principles of governance in the European Security Union (Parts 1 and 2). This is contrasted in the following contributions with the role of ‘national security’ as an expression of the sovereignty of the Member States (Part 3). Part 4 is dedicated to the modes and conditions of European security cooperation, whereas Part 5 emphasizes key domains for implementing the European Security Union. Part 6 explores perspectives for developing the European Security Union. In all chapters, political, social, and historical analyses are contextualized with legal discourse. The book is thus aimed at researchers of various disciplines and a broad specialist audience in the fields of national and European administration and justice.

The publication is the work of many helping hands. We would like to thank all the authors for their contribution to this project and their wonderful, patient collaboration. We are also particularly grateful to *Jutta Keller-Herder* and *Dietmar Marschollek* from the Federal Ministry of the Interior and Community. They played a key role in making both the above-mentioned symposium and this handbook possible. Without their support, neither would have been realised. Further thanks are due to *Thomas Klich* and *Jonathon Watson* of C.H.Beck Publishers for their careful guidance and advice on this project. Finally, we would like to thank *Ute Reusch* for language editing and translations as well as our research assistants *Steffen Zanger* and *Jannik Luhm* for their organizational support of the book.

Berlin and Bielefeld
April 2024

Jan-Hendrik Dietrich
Arne Pilniok

beck-shop.de
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

Table of contents

Preface	V
Abbreviations	XVII
Contributors	XXI

PART I POLITICAL APPROACHES

§ 1 The European Security Union between Member State interests and necessities of European integration (<i>Schwarzelihr-Sutter</i>).....	1
§ 2 Crime doesn't stop at the border post – European security in a multi-level system (<i>Barley</i>)	5
§ 3 Building a strong and effective Security Union (<i>Onidi</i>).....	9

PART II STRUCTURE AND PRINCIPLES

§ 4 Governance of the European Security Union (<i>Pilniok</i>)	13
A. Guaranteeing security: a joint undertaking	18
B. The European Security Union: a legal and political objective.....	20
C. The EU constitutional law framework for the EU's guarantee of security...	24
I. EU competences for guaranteeing security	24
1. Competences for realizing the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice.	24
2. Specific security-related competences.....	27
3. Security-related cross-cutting competences	29
4. The external dimension of competences for internal security	31
5. Competences for external security	33
II. Regulation of the exercise of competences in EU constitutional law	34
1. 'National security' as a limit to the exercise of the Union's powers...	34
2. Fundamental rights guarantees	36
III. Rule-of-law requirements under primary EU legislation in relation to Member States' security authorities	38
D. The EU's security architecture	39
I. EU institutions.....	40
1. European Council and Council of the European Union	40
2. European Commission	42
a) College and Directorates-General.....	42
b) High Representative and European External Action Service.....	44
3. European Parliament.....	45
4. Court of Justice of the European Union	45
II. EU agencies in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	47
1. Europol.....	48
2. Eurojust	50
3. Frontex	51
4. CEPOL	54

Table of contents

5. European Union Drugs Agency.....	54
6. European Union Agency for Asylum	55
7. eu-LISA	56
8. European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights	56
9. Other agencies	57
10. Horizontal networks within the EU security architecture	57
III. Other EU bodies involved in guaranteeing security	58
1. European Public Prosecutor's Office	59
2. European Defence Agency	60
3. European Union Institute for Security Studies	60
E. Modes of governance in the Security Union.....	61
I. Integration by means of institutionalization, cooperation and mutual learning.....	61
1. Institutionalization of EU security agencies	61
2. Cooperation between the security authorities.....	62
3. Mutual observation and learning	64
II. Integration by means of harmonizing security law	65
1. Harmonization of criminal law.....	65
2. Harmonization of threat prevention and regulatory law	66
3. Harmonization of security-related data protection law	67
4. Soft law.....	67
III. Integration by means of information systems	68
1. Interoperable personal data files in the composite security administration	68
2. Institutionalization of other information systems.....	73
IV. Integration by means of financing the guarantee of security	73
1. Funding Member States' security resources	74
2. Funding security research	76
3. Funding security-related projects in third countries	76
F. Outlook: trends in the Security Union	77
PART III	
NATIONAL SECURITY AND SOVEREIGNTY OF MEMBER STATES	
§ 5 National security and sovereignty of Member States – an introduction	
(Sule)	79
A. Overview	79
B. Common legal approach to deepening EU Security cooperation.....	80
I. Central common values as a precondition	80
II. National and EU legal provisions on security	81
1. National law	81
2. EU law	82
C. Member States' 'red lines': competence issues arising from the term 'national security'	83
I. Practical issues flowing from a conflict around competence.....	83
II. Need to outline the scope of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU.....	84
1. Definition of 'national security'	84
a) Formal definition of 'national security'	84
b) Substantive definition of 'national security'	84
2. Consequences of the definition: Member States' courts' responses	86
D. Conclusion	87

Table of contents

§ 6 Rule-of-law provisions in primary law and Member States' security agencies (<i>Terhechte</i>)	89
A. Introduction	90
B. The increasing importance of EU rule-of-law guarantees	91
I. A Union based on the rule of law	91
II. Formal und substantive EU rule-of-law guarantees	92
C. Rule-of-law guarantees and the Security Union	93
I. Foundations of the Security Union in primary EU law	93
II. The context of freedom and security	94
III. Member States' security authorities within the system of the AFSJ	95
IV. Police cooperation as an example	95
D. Member States' security authorities and EU rule-of-law guarantees	95
I. Acting within the scope of the Treaties	96
II. General enforcement principles of EU law	96
III. EU rule-of-law guarantees between full commitment and relaxation	96
E. Exceptions	97
I. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU as a general exception in relation to security policy	97
II. Art. 72 TFEU in relation to the AFSJ	98
III. Exemptions to the Single Market Programme	98
IV. Special structure of the Common Foreign and Security Policy/Common Security and Defence Policy	98
F. Conclusions	99
§ 7 The national security assumption under Art. 4 TEU and its interdependence with secondary legislation requirements and limits for the Member States' intelligence agencies (<i>Rüfß</i>)	101
A. Introduction	101
B. Secondary-legislation requirements and limits for intelligence agencies – primary-law aspects	102
I. Preliminary remarks	102
II. Focus on intelligence agencies in the following examination of national security and intelligence agencies	103
III. Binding nature of laws and values on the intelligence services of the Member States in the community of laws and values	103
IV. Scope of concrete primary-legislation requirements	104
1. Lack of powers to establish a European intelligence agency	104
2. Lack of explicit primary-legislative powers to regulate Member States' intelligence services	105
3. Interim findings	106
V. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU	106
C. Impact of the absence of sector-specific powers of regulation at EU level ..	107
I. Availability of a national security reservation and consequences of the Member States' involvement in EU lawmaking?	107
1. Indirect assumption of Member States' 'responsibility' within the meaning of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU?	107
2. Interim findings	109
II. Application of secondary legislation not specifically enacted to regulate it also in relation to the intelligence services?	109
1. Possible conflict scenarios	109
2. General primacy of EU law including in the case of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU?	109

Table of contents

III. Scope of the reservation.....	110
1. Special status of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU compared to the exemption clauses to the EU fundamental freedoms	110
2. Competence reservation and secondary legislation; significance of the derogation for the intelligence services	114
3. Specific fields.....	114
a) Data protection	114
b) Binding force in the context of use of the JHA databases and legal consequences	115
c) EU funding for intelligence service interfaces and legal consequences	117
D. Summary	117
§ 8 The non-integrable core area of national security? On the function and scope of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU (<i>Leino-Sandberg</i>)	119
A. Introduction	119
B. The backdrop to Art. 4(2) TEU	121
I. National security and horizontal principles	121
II. 'In particular, national security remains the sole responsibility of each Member State.'	123
C. Security in the EU Treaties: it's all about framing?	126
I. Freedom, security and justice	126
II. Internal market and (public) security	129
III. When security crosses boxes: horizontal matters	133
IV. Common foreign and security policy	135
D. 'No other choice'	137
§ 9 Sovereigns in chains? Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU and EU law constraints on the use of AI in national security contexts (<i>Buchheim</i>)	139
A. Giving content to Member States' national security reserve	140
B. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU in a nutshell: overlapping powers, duties to coordinate, instruments of coordination	141
I. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU in the context of the treaties' conception of competitive federalism	141
1. General functioning of Union competences	141
2. Specific reasons that support this reading of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU ...	142
II. Functions and normative demands of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU	143
III. Instruments for managing competence overlap: the example of the GDPR.....	144
1. Choice of instrument: regulation v directive.....	145
2. Determining the scope of EU legislation (scope exceptions)	145
3. Opening clauses.....	145
4. Permissive standards	146
5. Enhancing national security policy	146
C. The case of AI regulation: EU law constraints on Member States' use of AI in the context of national security policy	146
I. EU data protection law frameworks as indirect AI regulation.....	147
1. General data protection law: ample discretion in security matters	147
2. Specific EU data protection frameworks	149
a) The data processing side of Member States' procedural autonomy	149
b) The case of telecommunications data	150

Table of contents

c) Tighter EU interventions in the field of security cooperation and networks.....	151
d) Overall security-focused thrust of EU interventions	152
II. Direct AI regulation: constraints on Member States' security policy imposed by the proposed AI Act.....	153
1. Instrumental choice: direct regulation of Member State procedure ...	153
2. Broad definition of AI as a constraint on Member States' national security policy	154
3. Scope I: exception for military AI use.....	154
4. Scope II: general exception for national security matters	154
5. Discretion in virtue of classification	155
6. Discretion in virtue of implementation.....	156
7. Forbidden AI practices: permissive standard-setting	157
8. Summary: not anything goes, but everything's possible in the field of AI.....	158
D. EU AI Regulation and Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU: sovereigns in sovereignty-respecting chains	159
 § 10 ECJ in the <i>ultra vires</i> trap? French perspectives after the <i>Quadrature du Net</i> ruling (Warusfel)	161
A. Introduction	161
B. ECJ jurisdiction to assess national security for the purposes of EU law	162
I. Art. 4(2) TEU cited to justify potential lack of jurisdiction on the part of the Court of Justice.....	162
II. Recognition of national security subject to review by an EU judge	163
II. The constructive echo of European case-law by the <i>Conseil d'État</i>	164
1. Refusal to carry out an <i>ultra vires</i> review	164
2. The reservation regarding the constitutional identity of France	165
III. A persistent disagreement regarding the use of data in action to combat serious crime	167
1. A theoretical divergence regarding the scope of national security.....	167
2. A subsequent questioning of the compromise approved by the <i>Conseil d'État</i>	169
 PART IV	
COOPERATION IN THE EUROPEAN SECURITY UNION	
 § 11 Dynamics of cooperation, soft ways to legal harmonization – an introduction (Sehl)	171
A. When it comes to national security... sensitive issues in relation to Member States' sovereignty and EU integration	171
I. Reserved power and different security cultures.....	172
II. Transnational threats from outside and inside the EU	174
III. Modes of cooperation: a question of trust.....	174
IV. Information sharing: a boost for security cooperation	175
B. Dynamics of cooperation: soft ways to harmonization?.....	175
I. Sharing intelligence as an endurance test	176
II. How a new type of threat to fundamental rights could lead to a European security benchmark on surveillance	176
C. Cooperation as a pathway in sensitive areas of common EU policy fields..	177

Table of contents

§ 12 Between coordination, harmonization and centralization – modes of (inter)action in the European Security Union (Moser).....	179
A. Introduction	180
B. The European Security Union in a nutshell.....	182
I. Policy context.....	182
II. Law and governance	183
C. Modes of (inter)action	185
I. Coordination	186
II. Harmonization.....	187
III. Centralization.....	189
D. Case studies: navigating modes of action in border management and cybersecurity.....	191
I. Frontex	191
II. ENISA	194
E. Conclusions	198
§ 13 The institutional dimension of the EU Security Union: the EU agencies (Schöndorf-Haubold).....	199
A. The EU security architecture: introductory remarks on its process of differentiation.....	200
B. The EU security architecture: stocktaking	203
I. Security agencies.....	204
1. European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Cooperation (Europol).....	204
a) Legal bases and structure	204
b) Tasks	206
aa) Limited competence and prioritization.....	206
bb) Information collection point.....	206
cc) Operational functions, specifically participation in JITs	207
dd) Data evaluation and analysis.....	208
2. European Border and Coast Guard Agency (Frontex)	208
a) Legal bases and structure	208
b) Objectives and tasks	210
aa) Mandate.....	210
bb) Basic responsibilities.....	210
cc) Border management and return teams.....	210
dd) New operational powers.....	211
c) Fundamental rights protection	211
3. European Union Agency for Criminal Justice Cooperation (Eurojust)	213
a) Legal bases and structure	213
b) Objectives and tasks	214
4. EPPO	215
a) Jurisdiction	215
b) Organization and structure	216
c) Performance of tasks	217
5. European Police College/European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Training (CEPOL)	217
6. European Union Agency for the Operational Management of Large-Scale IT Systems in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice (eu-LISA).....	219

Table of contents

a) Large-scale IT systems	219
b) Organization and structure	221
c) Objective: to establish an overarching security agency data network	221
II. Security networks and communications infrastructure: the example of ETIAS	223
1. Information systems used in EU security law: an overview	223
2. Wide-ranging networks: the example of ETIAS	224
3. The role of the agencies in the ETIAS information network	225
C. The law relating to the EU security agencies: the direction of development	226
I. Establishing a genuine European border police force	227
II. Expanding Europol's mandate on information processing	228
III. Establishing a security information architecture	229
D. Outlook and evaluation	230
 § 14 Towards EU standards on control and oversight of intelligence agencies (Cameron)	233
A. Introduction	233
B. The control and oversight 'landscape'	235
C. Judicial and independent bodies	238
I. General comments	238
II. Authorization	239
III. Post hoc functions of courts	241
D. Prosecutors	242
E. Data protection authorities	242
F. Concluding remarks	244
 PART V OPERATIONALIZING THE EUROPEAN SECURITY UNION § 15 Operationalizing the European Security Union – an introduction (Conrad). 247	
A. Introduction	248
B. The Union's security has an intergovernmental and an institutional dimension	249
I. Intergovernmental cooperation to ensure external security and support internal security	249
II. Supranational dimension of an 'EU Security Union' based on Treaty competences	250
III. The European Security Union: no executive powers, but initiation, support and coordination of Member States' policies and action	252
C. The Fifth Progress Report on the implementation of the EU Security Union Strategy – the framework for this chapter	254
I. Protecting critical infrastructure in the EU against physical and digital attacks	254
II. Enhancing the EU's cybersecurity	256
III. Countering hybrid threats, fighting foreign interference and enhancing EU cyber defence	257
IV. Fighting terrorism and radicalization	261
1. The fight against terrorism	261
2. Combating radicalization that leads to violent extremism and terrorism online and offline	262

Table of contents

V. Fighting organized crime.....	263
VI. Organized crime	263
VII. Ensuring the security of EU borders and supporting law enforcement and judicial cooperation	265
VIII. The internal-external security nexus: security in the EU neighbourhood and in partner countries	268
D. What remains to be done?	269
E. Subsequent chapters	270
 § 16 Cybersecurity in the European multi-level governance system (<i>Wischmeyer</i>)	275
A. Introduction	276
B. The cybersecurity problem – and how regulation can fix it.....	279
I. From the ends of cybersecurity...	279
II. To the means: three layers of cybersecurity regulation	280
C. The European Union's response to the cybersecurity problem	281
I. EU cybersecurity regulation – an overview	282
II. Inconsistencies and gaps in EU cybersecurity regulation	283
III. The EU Treaties as an obstacle to comprehensive and coherent cyber- security regulation?	285
D. Outlook: towards an effective multi-level cybersecurity governance system	287
 § 17 Hybrid threats as a challenge to the European Union and its Member States (<i>Tilikainen</i>)	289
A. Introduction	289
B. The emergence of hybrid threats in the EU's political discourse	290
C. Towards shared control of the information space	293
D. Institutional framework for coordinated response	296
E. Building resilience	298
F. Tools for preventing hybrid threats and responding to them	300
G. Conclusions	304
 § 18 Intelligence cooperation in the European Union (<i>Dietrich</i>)	307
A. Introduction	308
B. Key terms	309
I. Intelligence.....	309
II. Intelligence cooperation.....	311
1. Intelligence cooperation as a prerequisite for national security	312
2. Intelligence cooperation, intelligence cycle and multi-source intelli- gence	313
3. From 'need to know' to 'need to share'	314
4. Informal and institutionalized partnerships in bilateral and multi- lateral cooperation	314
C. Intelligence cooperation in Europe	317
I. EU intelligence cooperation between political ambition and bureau- cratic reality	317
II. The primary legislative setting	319
1. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU – limiting the exercise of powers in the area of 'national security'	319
2. Intelligence cooperation on account of the duty to provide assistance in the spirit of solidarity pursuant to Art. 222 TFEU?	322

Table of contents

3. Intelligence cooperation as part of ‘Permanent Structured Cooperation’ within the meaning of Art. 42(6) and Art. 46 TEU	323
4. Intelligence cooperation as ‘Enhanced Cooperation’ in accordance with Art. 326 et seqq. TFEU	325
III. EU intelligence structures.....	326
1. Single Intelligence Analysis Capacity (SIAC)	326
a) EU Intelligence and Situation Centre (EU INTCEN)	327
b) EU Military Staff Intelligence Directorate (EUMS INT)	329
2. European Union Satellite Centre (EU SATCEN)	330
IV. Intelligence cooperation beyond the EU.....	331
C. Conclusions	333
 § 19 Integrated border management: evolving tasks and division of labour between the EU and Member States (<i>Bossong</i>)	335
A. Introduction	337
B. The concept of IBM	341
I. European understandings of IBM and the creation of Frontex	342
II. IBM in the Treaty of Lisbon	344
III. IBM and the subsequent evolution of the European Border and Coast Guard	346
IV. Additional use of Art. 77(2)(d) TFEU to expand the EU’s role in border security	349
C. Additional critique and developments	350
D. Conclusions	353
 § 20 Paradigm shifts: from siloed databases to interoperability of EU large scale information systems (<i>Quintel</i>)	355
A. Introduction	356
B. The road from separated silos to interconnected systems	359
I. The underlying databases	359
II. Interoperability of EU large-scale information systems	367
1. The interoperability components	368
2. Development and maintenance of the interoperable system	370
3. Access to the interoperability components by national authorities	371
4. Access to the interoperability components by national law enforcement authorities	372
5. The role of EU Agencies in the interoperable system	374
C. Interoperable risk detection, automated data matching and AI-based functionalities	377
I. Problems related to data quality	378
II. Algorithmic testing and inherent biases	379
III. The use of AI Act-based technologies	383
D. Data protection concerns in connection with interoperable information exchanges at different levels	386
I. EU data protection rules in different contexts	387
II. Supervision of multi-level data flows	390
E. Conclusion and outlook	391

Table of contents

PART VI
PERSPECTIVES

§ 21 On the future of security cooperation in the European Union (Zanger)	395
A. Introduction	396
B. Disruptive trends.....	398
I. Technological progress.....	398
1. Adjusting to a changing reality	399
2. Opportunities to innovate	399
3. Challenges.....	399
II. The link between internal and external security	400
1. Accelerating globalization/international dependencies	401
2. Geopolitical competition	401
3. Securitization of migration and asylum	402
4. Decline in transnational terrorism	402
III. Executive aggrandisement	403
1. Member States' backsliding.....	403
2. European executive detours	404
C. The future of European security cooperation	405
I. Roles and responsibilities	405
II. Legislative and policy agenda	407
1. Primary law	407
2. Secondary law	407
a) Implementation roadmap.....	408
b) Empowerment of EU Agencies	409
c) CJEU case law	410
D. Conclusion.....	410

Beck-shop.de
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG