Constitutional Law in Germany

Herdegen / Masing / Poscher / Gärditz

2025 ISBN 978-3-406-81608-6 C.H.BECK

schnell und portofrei erhältlich bei beck-shop.de

Die Online-Fachbuchhandlung beck-shop.de steht für Kompetenz aus Tradition. Sie gründet auf über 250 Jahre juristische Fachbuch-Erfahrung durch die Verlage C.H.BECK und Franz Vahlen.

beck-shop.de hält Fachinformationen in allen gängigen Medienformaten bereit: über 12 Millionen Bücher, eBooks, Loseblattwerke, Zeitschriften, DVDs, Online-Datenbanken und Seminare. Besonders geschätzt wird beck-shop.de für sein umfassendes Spezialsortiment im Bereich Recht, Steuern und Wirtschaft mit rund 700.000 lieferbaren Fachbuchtiteln.

GERMAN LAW ACCESSIBLE

Herdegen/Masing/Poscher/Gärditz Constitutional Law in Germany





Constitutional Law in Germany

Edited by

Matthias Herdegen

Johannes Masing

Ralf Poscher

Klaus Ferdinand Gärditz



2024





beck.de

ISBN Print: 978 3 406 81608 6

© 2024 Verlag C.H.Beck oHG Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München Druck und Bindung: Beltz Grafische Betriebe GmbH Am Fliegerhorst 8, 99947 Bad Langensalza

Satz: Fotosatz Buck Zweikirchener Straße 7, 84036 Kumhausen Umschlag: Druckerei C.H.Beck Nördlingen



chbeck.de/nachhaltig

Gedruckt auf säurefreiem, alterungsbeständigem Papier (hergestellt aus chlorfrei gebleichtem Zellstoff)

Alle urheberrechtlichen Nutzungsrechte bleiben vorbehalten. Der Verlag behält sich auch das Recht vor, Vervielfältigungen dieses Werkes zum Zwecke des Text and Data Mining vorzunehmen.

Preface

When the publisher C. H. BECK approached us with the idea of publishing a handbook of constitutional law, we reacted with a mixture of spontaneous interest and scepticism. Do we not have plenty of handbooks and commentaries on German constitutional law? What would be the added value of one more handbook? That we agreed to take on the project was not least due to our ambition to not just publish a German, but also an English version. Prior to this handbook, there was no contemporary comprehensive presentation of German constitutional law in English. So we decided to seize the opportunity and to capitalise on C. H. Beck's interest in a new handbook to bridge this gap.

Another equally important reason for embarking on this project lies in the transnational perspective of the handbook. Although presentations of German constitutional law can no longer ignore the transnational context, another gap remains: There is a lack of an account that systematically includes these references and seeks to represent German constitutional law internationally with a view to transnational dialogue. For us editors, this transnational perspective on constitutional law has two aspects.

On the one hand, it refers to the inter- and supranational- and comparative-law influences on German constitutional law. Especially in recent constitutional jurisprudence, it has become clear that the Basic Law can no longer be understood as a kind of self-contained regime, but is part of a multi-level system of inter- and supranational regulations, in which it must constantly re-define its place and take account of the interrelations within the multi-level system. Inter- and supranational references are often accompanied by a comparative-law perspective, as comparative law analyses of the constitutional practice of Member States have a direct significance for the understanding of international treaties and supranational regimes.

On the other hand, the Basic Law has an impact in the comparative and international sphere. Transnationalisation is not a one-way street. Just as German constitutional law practice and constitutional law doctrine have opened up to international influences, other constitutional systems have also followed developments in German constitutional law – in some cases with great attention – and sometimes integrated them in the sense of an adaptive reception. In addition, a lively interest in German constitutional law and its scholarly appraisal and conceptualisation can be observed in the transnational discussion of constitutional theory. It is a central objective of this handbook to respond to this aspect of increased receptivity in transnational discussions and constitutional development. By attempting a self-distancing view of German law and placing legal practice and jurisprudence in a transnational context, the contributions are intended to facilitate access to German constitutional law for foreign readers. With the handbook, the editors and authors want to foster a process in which German constitutional law, jurisprudence, and scholarship find their proper place in the international academic discourse.

With its two editions, the handbook pursues an ambitious aim, i.e., to showcase German constitutional research authored by some of the most accomplished German constitutional scholars. This ambition also informs the the way the editors and authors see their mission. The individual contributions, beyond presenting a concise and objective overview of the development in the different areas of German constitutional law, reflect the dedicated stance of each author on the subject matter. Therefore, the handbook deliberately unfolds a broad spectrum of different legal policy perspectives.

Our project, which extends into the international sphere, has drawn much support from distinguished foreign colleagues who have in depth external perspective on German constitutional law. We were fortunate to be able to win over a circle of outstanding – and committed – foreign advisors from all over the world for the project. The editors and authors owe them essential suggestions that are important for an informed comparison of other constitutional systems and thus also for the accessibility of the contributions from the perspective of the foreign readership of the handbook. The members of this advisory group provided advice and assistance to the editors at two meetings that served to conceptualise the handbook (Cologne and Berlin) and then to all authors during three meetings (Berlin, Cadenabbia, and Munich) to discuss the contributions. We would like to thank them most sincerely, also on behalf of our authors, for their tireless and altruistic commitment, which has often gone far beyond their input at these meetings. We have benefited greatly from their suggestions and proposals.

We would also like to thank our authors. By attempting to place the contributions in a transnational perspective, we have embarked on a new and, as became apparent, not easy path together. We are pleased that we were able to reflect on and discuss this with all the authors as well as our foreign advisors on the basis of rough drafts. However, we are even more thankful to our authors for committing to provide an English adaption of their contributions. This is a commitment that went far beyond what could be expected and reflects a joint ambition to contribute to the further opening of German constitutional law to international debate.

We would also like to thank the sponsors who made the conferences, the organisational, and the editorial support possible, namely the German Research Foundation, the Fritz Thyssen Foundation, the Friedrich Ebert Foundation, the Konrad Adenauer Foundation, the German Foundation for International Legal Cooperation (IRZ), and the Carl Friedrich von Siemens Foundation. Our thanks also go to Dr. Rolf-Georg Müller, Dr. Wolfgang Czerny, Ms. Saskia Henze-Wiskow and Ms. Elisabeth Becker from the publishing house C. H. BECK – especially for their advice, their unswerving, patient support, and their constant assistance.

A special thank you is due to Niklas Burkart. He has accompanied the project as a research assistant from the beginning. With stoic calm, great commitment, and thoughtfulness, he not only provided editorial support, but also increasingly took charge of the workflows and processes in an effective, energetic, and even-keeled manner that one would only expect from a much more senior colleague. We could not have wished for better support on our side. Many thanks go in the same way to Niklas Simon, who took over this task from Mr. Burkart for the last year of preparing the edition and carried it out with the same commitment and skill.

Special thanks also go to Luc von Danwitz, Rafael Beauregard-Lacroix, and Lucas Mies. Their support in editing the English versions of the contributions was invaluable. They provided our authors with detailed feedback not only on linguistic issues and matters of style, but also with important suggestions for making the texts more accessible to foreign readers.

Finally, we would like to thank all the other staff members of our chairs and departments who also provided important organisational or editorial assistance for finalising the English version of the handbook. During the crucial final phase, Christian Thönnes coordinated the efforts at the different locations by Çiğdem Bektaş, Johanna Bücker, Rebekka Hans, Jann Köster, David Linkerhägner, Sarah Norman and Moritz Schulze, who all deserve our thanks and special mention.

Bonn/Freiburg in May 2024



Authors

Prof. Dr. Matthias Bäcker LL.M. (§ 28)

Johannes Gutenberg University Mainz

Prof. Dr. Pascale Cancik (§ 14)

University Osnabrück

Prof. Dr. Dr. Wolfgang Durner LL.M. (§ 26)

Rhenish Friedrich Wilhelms University of Bonn

Prof. Dr. Martin Eifert LL.M. (§ 18)

Justice at the Federal Constitutional Court Humboldt University Berlin

Prof. Dr. Klaus Ferdinand Gärditz (§ 4, § 13)

Rhenish Friedrich Wilhelms University of Bonn

Prof. Dr. DDr. h.c. Matthias Herdegen (§ 1, § 27)

Rhenish Friedrich Wilhelms University of Bonn

Prof. Dr. Peter Michael Huber (§ 6)

Justice (ret.) at the Federal Constitutional Court
Ludwig Maximilian University Munich

Prof. Dr. Matthias Jestaedt (§ 22)

University of Freiburg

Prof. Dr. Jens Kersten (§ 11)

Ludwig Maximilian University Munich

Prof. Dr. Oliver Lepsius LL.M. (§ 12)

University of Münster

Prof. Dr. h.c. Johannes Masing (§ 2, § 15)

Justice (ret.) at the Federal Constitutional Court University of Freiburg

Prof. Dr. Christoph Möllers LL.M. (§5)

Humboldt University Berlin

Prof. Dr. DDr. h.c. Angelika Nußberger (§ 20)

University of Cologne

Former Vice President of the European Court of Human Rights International Judge at the Constitutional Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina

Authors

Member of the Venice Commission

Prof. Dr. Ralf Poscher (§ 3, § 17)

Director at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Crime, Security and Law, Freiburg

Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Ute Sacksofsky M.P.A. (§ 19)

Goethe University Frankfurt a.M.

Prof. Dr. Margarete Schuler-Harms (§ 25)

Helmut Schmidt University/University of the German Federal Armed Forces

Prof. Dr. Angelika Siehr LL.M. (§ 9)

University of Bielefeld

Prof. Dr. Antje von Ungern-Sternberg M.A. (§ 21)

University of Trier

Prof. Dr. Uwe Volkmann (§ 16)

Goethe University Frankfurt a.M.

Prof. Dr. Christian Waldhoff (§ 10)

Humboldt University Berlin

Prof. Dr. Astrid Wallrabenstein (§ 7)

Justice at the Federal Constit<mark>utio</mark>nal Court Goethe University Frankfurt a.M.

Prof. Dr. Joachim Wieland LL.M. (§8, §24)

German University of Administrative Sciences Speyer

Prof. Dr. Hinnerk Wißmann (§ 23)

University of Münster

International Advisory Group

The development of this handbook was accompanied by a circle of international legal scholars who provided essential impulses to the contributions at various academic conferences through their advice and by pointing out and adding external perspectives to the German discussion. Members of this circle were:

Prof. Dr. Vincenzo Baldini (Italy)

University of Cassino and Southern Lazio

Prof. Dr. Olivier Beaud (France)

Paris-Panthéon-Assas University

Prof. Dr. Giovanni Biaggini (Switzerland)

University of Zurich

Prof. Dr. Pedro Cruz Villalón (Spain)

Autonomous University of Madrid
Former President of the Spanish Constitutional Court
Former Advocate General at the European Court of Justice

Prof. Dr. Bernhard Ehrenzeller (Switzerland)

University of St. Gallen

Justice (ret.) at the State Court of the Principality of Liechtenstein

Prof. Dr. William Ewald (USA)

University of Pennsylvania

Prof. DDr. Dr. h.c. Christoph Grabenwarter (Austria)

Vienna University of Economics and Business President of the Constitutional Court of Austria

Prof. Daniel Halberstam (USA)

University of Michigan

Prof. Dr. Shu-Peng Hwang, LL.M. (Taiwan)

Rhenish Friedrich Wilhelms University of Bonn Academia Sinica Taipei (until 2022)

Prof. Dr. Olivier Jouanjan (France)

Paris-Panthéon-Assas University

Prof. Dr. Gō Koyama (Japan)

Keiō-University Tokyo

Prof. Russell A. Miller (USA)

Washington and Lee University Head of the Max Planck Law Network

Prof. Dr. András Sajó (Hungary)

Central European University
Former Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

The Rt. Hon. Sir Konrad Schiemann P.C. LL.B. (United Kingdom)

Former Judge of the European Court of Justice Former Lord Justice of Appeal

Prof. Dr. Yeong-Chin Su (Taiwan)

National Chengchi University Former Vice President of the Constitutional Court of Taiwan

Christian Vigouroux (France)

Former Vice President of the Council of State

Prof. Dr. Erika de Wet, LL.M. (South Africa/Netherlands)

University of Graz
University of Pretoria (until 2019)

Prof. Dr. Andrzej Wróbel (Poland)

Kozminski University

Former Judge of the Constitutional Tribunal of Poland Former Judge of the Supreme Court of Poland

DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

Pref	face	V
Edit	tors	VI
Aut	hors	IX
Inte	ernational Advisory Group	X1
On	the English-language edition of this handbook	XXI
Ger	rman Constitutional Law from a Transnational Perspective	XXV
	PART I	
	FOUNDATIONS (§ 1 – § 4)	
	§ 1 The Basic Law in the Context of Western Constitutionalism	
	(Matthias Herdegen)	
B	The constitution as a fundamental order in Western constitutionalism Elements of Western constitutionalism The constitution as a regulatory framework with a special status Functions of the constitution Contents of a constitution Stability and elasticity of the constitution Constitutional interpretation Constitutionalisation of the legal system International transfers of constitutional contents The Constitution as part of a systemic network Outlook: challenges for the constitutional model	23 24 32 33 38 41 43 44
	§ 2 Constitution and Multi-Level Governance under Conditions of Internationalisation	
	(Johannes Masing)	
B. '	Introduction	55 57 63
D. '	The unacknowledged departure from the concept of constitution as comprehensive model of legitimation and order	109

$\S\,3$ The Basic Law as a Constitution of Proportional Balance

(Ralf Poscher)

A.	The law as a regime of balancing	127
	Constitutional law as the regime of balancing for the political process	130
	The principle of proportionality	134
	Other balancing elements under the Basic Law	165
E.	Summary	179
	§4 Constitutional Development and Constitutional Jurisprudence	
	(Klaus Ferdinand Gärditz)	
		107
	Concept of constitutional development	187
	Constitutional development between political setting and interpretation	190
	Sources of constitutional development	206
	Constitutional development and eternity clause	224 226
	Constitutional development between continuity and discontinuity	229
	Ageless constitutional law?	246
G.	rigeress constitutional law	240
	PARTII	
	GUIDING CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLES (§ 5 - § 8)	
	Decit Silopide	
	DIE EACHDEIGE	
	DIE FACHB Democracy ANDLUNG	
	(Christoph Möllers)	
٨	•	254
	Preliminary reflections	254
	Constitutional law	255 286
	Conclusion: democracy in German constitutional law	290
υ.	Conclusion: democracy in German constitutional law	290
	§6	
	The Principle of a State governed by the Rule of Law (Rechtsstaat)	
	(Peter M. Huber)	
A.	Historical Roots	294
В.	The Rechtsstaat as a Constitutional Principle	298
	The Rechtsstaat in the Constitutional Order of the Basic Law	312
	The Rechtsstaat under the Influence of European Law	317
	Different Notions of the Rule of Law in the European Legal Space	322
F.	Threats and Challenges to the Rechtsstaat/Rule of Law	329

§ 7 The Social State

Astrid	Wallraben	stein)
--------	-----------	--------

В. С.	The Social State of the Federal Republic of Germany The Social State as a constitutional principle The Social State in constitutional jurisprudence The Social State as a site of discourse	335 350 358 381	
	§ 8 The Federal State		
	(Joachim Wieland)		
В. С.	Unity in Diversity: The Federal State as an Organizational Form of State Order	386 389 406 413	
	PART III ORGANISATION OF THE STATE (§ 9 – § 15)		
	§ 9 The State as an Association of People: Nationality, European Citizenship and Migration		
A. B.	Guiding questions, concepts, and functions of nationality	424	
C.	and analysis of the correlations	429	
D.	migration	459 486	
	§ 10 The law of political parties, electoral law, and parliamentary law		
	(Christian Waldhoff)		
B. C. D.	The 'democracy constitution' Political party law Electoral law Parliamentary law Characteristics of the Basic Law's 'democracy constitution'	491 493 512 524 540	

§11 Parliamentary Government

(Jens Kersten)

В. С.		544 550 555 566 574 576
	Constitutional Itigation	580
Η.	Reform	580
	§ 12	
	Law and Legislation (Oliver Lepsius)	
	•	
В. С.	Functions of laws	583 592 599 620
	Legislation: constitution and procedures	630
B. C. D. E.	Public Law's Emphasis on Legal Remedies Organization of the judicial power Functions and responsibilities of the judicial power Legal remedies and the guarantee of justice Procedural safeguards in court Conclusion: A story of loss, or of success?	641 654 669 673 682 687
	§ 14 Administration and Self-Government	
	(Pascale Cancik)	
A. B. C. D.	Introduction	692 693 706 716 722 735

§ 15 The Federal Constitutional Court

(Johannes Masing)

B.	The Federal Constitutional Court in the political system	741 758 785
	PART IV FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (§ 16 – § 23)	
	§ 16 General Ideas and Principles	
	(Uwe Volkmann)	
B.C.D.E.F.G.	The theory of fundamental rights The basis of fundamental rights The substance of fundamental rights The Subjects of fundamental rights The normativity of fundamental rights The functions of fundamental rights The doctrine of fundamental rights The limits of fundamental rights The application of fundamental rights S17 Human Dignity (Ralf Poscher)	803 805 809 813 818 822 827 833 836
	History of ideas	845
	Human dignity as a legal guarantee	848 855
	Doctrinal aspects of human dignity under the Basic Law	860
§ 18 Personal freedom		
	(Martin Eifert)	002
B. C. D.	Introduction The post-war constitution implemented by a powerful constitutional court guarantees comprehensive personal freedom Art. 2(1) GG as a guarantee of the free development of personality General freedom of action The General Right of Personality	892 892 904 914 921

§ 19 Equality

(Ute Sacksofsky)

	Introduction	937
	Foundations	938
	The General Principle of Equality in Art. 3(1) GG	944
υ.	Specific equality rights (Art. 3(2) and (3) GG)	956
	§ 20	
	Communication-Related Freedoms	
	(Angelika Nußberger)	
A.	Constitutionalisation in historical context	981
В.	Resolving multipolar conflicts of fundamental rights	995
C.	Differences between the various forms of communication	1003
	text	1012
L.	tutional human rights protection system	1016
	§21	
	Constitutional law on religion	
	(Antje von Ungern-Sternberg)	
A.	Introduction: Challenges	1020
В.	An overview of relevant standards	1020
C.	Historical development	1024 1029
	Theoretical debates concerning religion, state and law	1029
	Conflicts regarding the individual right to freedom of religion	1034
	Themes of institutional constitutional law on religion	1049
	\$22	
	Marriage, Family and Child-Rearing	
	(Matthias Jestaedt)	
A.	The particularities of the Grundgesetz's protections in constitutional com-	10.62
B	parison	1062 1070
	Marriage and the family	1070
	Parents and upbringing	1087
	The constitutionalisation of the legal order as exemplified by marriage, the	
	family and child-rearing	1107

§ 23 Fundamental rights and Economics

(Hinnerk	Wißmann)
----------	----------

B. C. D.	Economics and labour as a subject of constitutional law Enabling economic dynamism Securing economic positions State neutrality and state activity Conclusion: Designing and shaping an economic constitution	1113 1114 1133 1140 1148
	PART V PARTICULAR CONSTITUTIONAL AREAS (§ 24 – § 28)	
	§ 24 The Fiscal Constitution	
	(Joachim Wieland)	
В. С.	Characteristics and History of the Fiscal Constitution The Tax State – Revenues of the State Borrowing – Debt Brake State Expenditures – Connectivity, Laws on Money Grants, Financial Assistance	1154 1157 1168 1172
E. F.	Budgetary Constitution – Parliament's Right to Decide on the Budget Auditing	1176 1180
	§ 25 The media constitution (Margarete Schuler-Harms)	
B. C. D.	Introduction	1182 1184 1188 1198
E.	The media constitution of the future	1205
	§ 26 Environmental constitutional law	
	(Wolfgang Durner)	
B. C. D. E. F.	What is 'environmental constitutional law'?	1222 1223 1229 1234 1240 1244 1248

$\$\,27$ Foreign Relations Powers and Deployment of the Armed Forces

	Foreign relations powers	1253 1277
	§ 28 The Security Constitution	
	(Matthias Bäcker)	
B. C. D. E. F.	Principles. The jurisdictional and organisational framework of the security architecture Surveillance measures of the security authorities. The information regime of the security authorities. Coercive measures of the police and the public prosecution office Europeanisation and internationalisation of the security architecture. Conclusion: "Over-constitutionalisation" of security law?	1294 1309 1315 1329 1334 1341 1345
Tal	ble of Cases	1347
Inc	beck-shop.de	1457
	DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG	