

#### The Eurozone Crisis

Topical and timely, this book offers an economically informed constitutional analysis of European responses to the crisis. It discusses the longer-term proposals on the table including rescue measures and stability mechanisms, as well as the tightening of European economic governance. The authors see the European constitution as a multi-dimensional and multi-temporal process of constitutionalisation. They examine how the crisis has catapulted the economic constitution back to the 'pacemaker' position from where it determines developments in the political and social dimension. However, now the key role is not played by the constitution of 'microeconomics', focusing on free movement and competition law, but by the constitution of 'macroeconomics', introduced in Maastricht.

**Kaarlo Tuori** is Professor of Jurisprudence and Academy Professor at the University of Helsinki. He is also Vice President of the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe and serves as a consulting expert on the Constitutional Law Committee at the Finnish Parliament.

**Klaus Tuori** is a researcher of EU constitutional law at Helsinki University. He has worked extensively within the financial market sector, focusing on asset management and sovereign debt markets. Between 1997 and 2000, he worked as a monetary policy economist at the European Central Bank designing the framework of the common monetary policy.



### Cambridge Studies in European Law and Policy

This series aims to produce original works which contain a critical analysis of the state of the law in particular areas of European Law and set out different perspectives and suggestions for its future development. It also aims to encourage a range of work on law, legal institutions and legal phenomena in Europe, including 'law in context' approaches. The titles in the series will be of interest to academics; policy makers; policy formers who are interested in European legal, commercial and political affairs; practising lawyers including the judiciary; and advanced law students and researchers.

#### Joint Editors

Professor Dr Laurence Gormley, University of Groningen Professor Jo Shaw, University of Edinburgh

#### Editorial advisory board

Professor Richard Bellamy, University College London Professor Catherine Barnard, University of Cambridge Professor Marise Cremona, European University Institute, Florence Professor Alan Dashwood, University of Cambridge Professor Dr Jacqueline Dutheil de la Rochère, Université de Paris II, Director of the Centre de Droit Européen, Paris Dr Andrew Drzemczewski, Council of Europe, Strasbourg Sir David Edward, KCMG, QC, former Judge, Court of Justice of the European Communities, Luxembourg Professor Dr Walter Baron van Gerven, Emeritus Professor, Leuven and Maastricht, and former Advocate General, Court of Justice of the European Communities Professor Daniel Halberstam, University of Michigan Professor Dr Ingolf Pernice, Director of the Walter Hallstein Institut, Humboldt University Michel Petite, Former Director-General of the Legal Service, Commission of the European Communities, Brussels Professor Dr Sinisa Rodin, University of Zagreb Professor Neil Walker, University of Edinburgh



Books in the series

EU Enlargement and the Constitutions of Central and Eastern Europe Anneli Albi

Social Rights and Market Freedom in the European Constitution: A Labour Law Perspective

Stefano Giubboni

The Constitution for Europe: A Legal Analysis

Jean-Claude Piris

The European Convention on Human Rights: Achievements, Problems and Prospects Steven Greer

European Broadcasting Law and Policy

Jackie Harrison and Lorna Woods

The Transformation of Citizenship in the European Union: Electoral Rights and the Restructuring of Political Space

Jo Shaw

Implementing EU Pollution Control: Law and Integration

Bettina Lange

The Evolving European Union: Migration Law and Policy

Dora Kostakopoulou

Ethical Dimensions of the Foreign Policy of the European Union: A Legal Appraisal

Urfan Khaliq

The European Civil Code: The Way Forward

**Hugh Collins** 

State and Market in European Union Law

Wolf Sauter and Harm Schepel

The Ethos of Europe: Values, Law and Justice in the EU

Andrew Williams

 ${\it The \ European \ Union's \ Fight \ Against \ Corruption: \ The \ Evolving \ Policy \ Towards \ Member}$ 

States and Candidate Countries

Patrycja Szarek-Mason

The Lisbon Treaty: A Legal and Political Analysis

Jean-Claude Piris

New Governance and the Transformation of European Law: Coordinating EU Social Law

and Policy

Mark Dawson



> The Limits of Legal Reasoning and the European Court of Justice Gerard Conway

International Trade Disputes and EU Liability Anne Thies

 $\label{thm:constitutional} The \ Eurozone \ Crisis: A \ Constitutional \ Analysis$ 

Kaarlo Tuori and Klaus Tuori



# The Eurozone Crisis

A Constitutional Analysis

Kaarlo Tuori

and

Klaus Tuori





### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107649453

© Kaarlo Tuori and Klaus Tuori 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printing in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Tuori, Kaarlo, 1948- author.

The Eurozone crisis : a constitutional analysis / Kaarlo Tuori, Klaus Tuori. pages cm. – (Cambridge studies in European law and policy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-05655-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-64945-3 (paperback)

Constitutional law-European Union countries.
Financial crises-European Union countries.
Monetary policy-European Union countries.
European Union countries-Economic policy.
Tuori, Klaus, author.
Title. KJC4445.T86 2013

337.1′42-dc23

2013032793

ISBN 978-1-107-05655-8 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-64945-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### **Contents**

Series editors' preface Preface		page ix xi
Pa	rt I Setting the scene	1
1	Introduction: framework of the analysis	3
2	Two layers of the European economic constitution	13
3	Towards the crisis: an economic narrative	61
4	Responses to the crisis	85
Part II Constitutional mutation		117
5	Constitutionality of European measures	119
6	Realignment of the principles of the macroeconomic constitution	181
7	Democracy and social rights	205
Part III What next?		249
8	Initiatives on the table	251
References Index		267 279

vii





# Series editors' preface

This new contribution from Kaarlo Tuori and Klaus Tuori, offering an innovative constitutional analysis of the Eurozone crisis, is an important addition to the series Cambridge Studies in European Law and Policy. Combining expertise on law, theory and economics, the authors are able to open our eyes to the many aspects of the Eurozone crisis and its ramifications for societies and polities. They want to take us beyond thinking about the crisis merely as a financial crisis, a crisis of the banking sector or a threat to public debt, and to give it a broader public order and constitutional perspective. The Eurozone crisis goes to the very heart of the European constitutional order, understood in a multiperspectival manner to incorporate both the legal order sustained by the EU treaties, and also the systems of the Member States. The Eurozone crisis thus entreats us to consider also issues of democracy and transparency, as well as issues about the values which underpin our societies in the early twenty-first century including issues around security in its widest sense. Tuori and Tuori, through a historically and conceptually grounded analysis, show how these issues are intimately linked to each other. We warmly welcome this volume to the series.

> Jo Shaw Laurence Gormley





## Preface

This is a book about relations: relations between constitutional law and economy, but also between different dimensions of the constitution and different layers of the economic constitution. These relations transfer and transform the effects of shocks introduced by the economic crisis, and, by the same token, testify to the interconnectedness of the constitutional system. Often enough, relations take the form of open-ended dialogues. We hope to make a modest contribution to these dialogues by pointing to some hitherto neglected connections and repercussions.

The German ordoliberal school has pursued the ambitious project of combining legal and economic scholarship; much more ambitious, we would argue, than the law and economics movement of recent decades. Law and economics have mainly been content with buttressing legal reasoning with policy arguments drawn from an economic assessment of alternative readings of law. In contrast, ordoliberals have sought cooperation between law and economics at a deeper, conceptual level. In this cooperation both partners are supposed to learn from each other. Thus, lawyers are not merely at the receiving end, as is their lot in law and economics.

For ordoliberals, the need of a dialogue between lawyers and economists arose from the perceived necessity of an *ordo* – a legal and institutional framework – for the functioning of the economic system. A central means for facilitating dialogue consisted of common concepts which had their place in both law and economics. One of these key concepts – if not the very key concept – was 'economic constitution'.

Adhering to the general dialogical style if not the substantive tenets of ordoliberals, our book is a product of cooperation between legal

хi



xii PREFACE

scholarship and economics. One of us is a constitutional lawyer and legal theorist, the other both an economist and a lawyer with a professional background at the ECB during the years of preparing for introduction of the common currency. To facilitate mutual dialogue and learning, and to guarantee textual coherence, we chose to co-author all the chapters; the reader, though, may, if he or she so wishes, make more or less educated guesses as to who has been responsible for drafting which parts of the manuscript. We present a constitutional scrutiny of the Eurozone crisis which includes economic analyses as well. We justify the place of economic analyses in our constitutional discussion with a theoretical view of constitutions in general and the European constitution in particular. We employ a relational notion of constitution and argue that a constitution must be examined through the interrelation between constitutional law and its object of regulation. Here we find the concept of economic constitution highly relevant.

We acknowledge the ordoliberal origins of this concept, but we do not subscribe to the contents the ordoliberals assigned to it. For ordoliberals the economic constitution signified a fundamental decision in favour of a market economy, based on free competition. We detach the concept from its link to a specific model of the economy and simply define it through the interrelation between constitutional law and economy. In the European economic constitution we distinguish between two layers: the microeconomic constitution, centred around free movement and competition law and introduced by the Treaty of Rome (1958), and the macroeconomic constitution, centred around aggregate economic objectives and economic policies, and introduced by the Treaty of Maastricht (1993). In its constitutional aspect, the Eurozone crisis must be examined primarily as a crisis of the Maastricht macroeconomic constitution. Yet, in our discussion we continually recall the interdependence of the two layers of the European economic constitution.

We follow our programme of mingling economic with legal analysis by, first, reconstructing the economic assumptions which underpinned the Maastricht principles of the macroeconomic constitution; and, second, by examining the economic background of the present crisis, especially how the underlying economic assumptions have stood the test of reality. We conclude that many of the assumptions have been invalidated; that this has led to a teetering of some of the vital principles of the Maastricht macroeconomic constitution; and that this, in turn, has launched a significant constitutional mutation, some aspects



PREFACE xiii

of which were consecrated in the *Pringle* ruling of the Court of Justice of the European Union in November 2012. The economic analyses do not constitute an external introduction to but, rather, an integral element of the constitutional discussion.

Our notion of constitution, emphasising the interaction of constitutional law and its societal object of regulation, is an important aspect, but not the only aspect, of the general approach we term 'relational analytic'. We also point to the relationships linking the economic constitution to other dimensions of the European constitution, such as the political and social constitutions. An essential part of the Eurozone crisis as a constitutional crisis consists of its repercussions for democracy and social rights.

Our objective of treating economic analysis as an integral part of constitutional investigation has led us to consult our colleagues not only in law but in economics as well. We have greatly benefited from comments by Joxerramon Bengoetxea, Niilo Jääskinen, Sixten Korkman, Tuomas Ojanen, Allan Rosas, Tuomas Saarenheimo, Suvi Sankari, Jukka Snell, Pedro Teixeira and Vesa Vihriälä. We have learned a lot but, of course, remain solely responsible for the views put forth in this book.

Things in Europe have moved fast, although we have been able to complete our manuscript in a period of relative calm. We have been able to follow developments up to June 2013.

We have received financial support for our work from the Finnish Academy, through the Centre of Excellence 'Foundations of European Law and Polity', and the Wihuri Foundation (Klaus Tuori). The quite rapid production of the manuscript would not have been possible without the invaluable help of our research assistants Anna-Maria Rehbinder and Mikko Hakkarainen, and our linguistic adviser Christopher Goddard. During completion of the manuscript, one of us was sitting on the porch of his summer house in Loppi in Central Finland while the other was sailing in the waters between Finland and Sweden; Anna-Maria was fine-tuning the footnotes and the typography in Mumbai; Christopher was checking the language at his forest home near Riga; and our very helpful editor Helen Frances was waiting for the end result in Cambridge. A wonderful example of positive globalisation!

We dedicate this book to the Helsinki CoE 'Foundations of European Law and Polity' and to all our colleagues there. The Centre, financed by the Finnish Academy, has provided an extremely stimulating environment for our research.