

#### LAW AND NATURE

This interdisciplinary study explores the relationship between conceptions of nature and (largely American) legal thought and practice. It focuses on the politics and pragmatics of nature talk as expressed in both extralegal disputes and their transformation and translation into forms of legal discourse (tort, property, contract, administrative law, criminal law, and constitutional law). Delaney begins by considering the pragmatics of nature in connection with the very idea of law and the practice of American legal theorization. He then traces a set of specific political-legal disputes and arguments. The set consists of a series of contexts and cases organized around a conventional distinction between "external" and "internal" nature: forces of nature, endangered species, animal experiments, bestiality, reproductive technologies, genetic screening, biological defenses in criminal cases, and involuntary medication of inmates. He demonstrates throughout that nearly any construal of "nature" entails an interpretation of what it is to be (distinctively) human.

DAVID DELANEY is Visiting Assistant Professor in the Department of Law, Jurisprudence, and Social Thought at Amherst College. His publications include *Race*, *Place and the Law* (1998) and *The Legal Geographies Reader* (co-editor, with Nicholas Blomley and Richard Ford, 2001). He has also written many articles exploring the intersection of legal and geographical scholarship.



#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law; socio-legal studies; sociology and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

#### Series Editors

Chris Arup
Victoria University, Melbourne
Martin Chanock
La Trobe University, Melbourne
Pat O'Malley
Carleton University, Ottawa
Sally Engle Merry
Wellesley College, Massachusetts
Susan Silbey
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

#### Books in the Series

The Politics of Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa Legitimizing the Post-Apartheid State
Richard A. Wilson
0 521 80219 9 hardback
0 521 00194 3 paperback

Modernism and the Grounds of Law Peter Fitzpatrick 0 521 80222 9 hardback 0 521 00253 2 paperback



> Unemployment and Government Genealogies of the Social William Walters 0 521 64333 3 hardback

Autonomy and Ethnicity Negotiating Competing Claims in Multi–Ethnic States Yash Ghai 0 521 78112 4 hardback 0 521 78642 8 paperback

Constituting Democracy Law, Globalism and South Africa's Political Reconstruction Heinz Klug 0 521 78113 2 hardback 0 521 78643 6 paperback

The New World Trade Organization Agreements Globalizing Law through Services and Intellectual Property Christopher Arup 0 521 77355 5 hardback

The Ritual of Rights in Japan Law, Society, and Health Policy Eric A. Feldman 0 521 77040 8 hardback 0 521 77964 2 paperback

The Invention of the Passport Surveillance, Citizenship and the State John Torpey 0 521 63249 8 hardback 0 521 63493 8 paperback

Governing Morals A Social History of Moral Regulation Alan Hunt 0 521 64071 7 hardback 0 521 64689 8 paperback

The Colonies of Law Colonialism, Zionism and Law in Early Mandate Palestine Ronen Shamir 0 521 63183 1 hardback



# LAW AND NATURE

David Delaney





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© David Delaney 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Goudy 11/13 pt. System LATEX  $2_{\mathcal{E}}$  [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Delaney, David.
Law and nature / David Delaney.
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in law and society)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 83126 1

Science and law.
 Natural law.
 Law – United States – Philosophy.
 Title. II. Series.
 K487.S3D45 2003

340′.112 – dc21 2003043961

ISBN 0 521 83126 1 hardback



For Austin, friend, scholar, example, with much appreciation



## CONTENTS

Acknowledgments		page x
Part	I Situating nature	
1	Introduction: the pragmatics of nature and the situation	
	of law	3
2	The nature of modern political discourse: doing things	•
	with nature	28
3	The natures of scientific discourse	54
4	The natures of legal discourse	77
5	The natures of legal practice	103
Part	II Rendering nature	
6	It's a slippery slope: law and the forces of nature	141
7	Doctrinal wilderness and the path of interpretation:	
	law and wilderness	162
8	Wild justice and the endangerment of meaning:	
	law and endangered species	192
9	Puka's choice: law and animal experimentation	213
10	Fear of falling: law and bestiality	235
11	The births of nature and tradition: law and reproductive	
	technologies	271
12	Doctrinal mutations at the edge of meaning: law and	
	genetic screening	300
13	Return of the beast within: law and biological	
	criminal defenses	329
14	Controlling dreams: law and the involuntary medication	
	of prisoners	361
Part	III Judging nature	
15	Beyond "nature": the material life of the legal	397
D (		40=
References		407
Index		423

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org

ix



### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This book was written while I held a National Endowment for the Humanities Fellowship (FB-35511-99). I am very grateful to the Endowment for the support and to the proposal reviewers for helpful comments. Some of the arguments made in chapter 15 were first articulated in "Beyond the Word: Law as a Thing of This World" published in Current Legal Issues vol. 5 (Law and Geography), eds. Jane Holder and Carolyn Harrison (Oxford University Press 2003). I would also like to thank Finola O'Sullivan, Jennie Rubio, their colleagues at Cambridge University Press and the manuscript reviewers for all of their help in seeing this project through. I am especially grateful for the work that Margaret Deith did in copy-editing the manuscript and catching the omissions, mistakes and (at least some of the) incoherent passages that came to her. Any that remain are my fault. This book would not have been conceived, let alone written, had I not enjoyed the nurturing environment provided by my colleagues in Law, Jurisprudence and Social Thought: Roger Berkowitz, Jennifer Culbert, Lawrence Douglas, Nasser Hussain, Tom Kearns, Austin Sarat, Martha Umphrey, and Karen Underwood. It has been a privilege to participate with them in creating a new vision of interdisciplinary legal studies in a liberal arts setting. I would also like to express my appreciation to Amherst College, and especially to Lisa Raskin, for enabling me to flourish during my long "visit." Likewise, I am grateful to the students in my Law's Nature course for helping me to sharpen the ideas that ultimately found their way into this book. Those ideas would not have taken the form of this book were it not for Susan Silbey. Her faith in my work and her advocacy on my behalf were indispensable and are greatly appreciated. I would also like to thank Nick Blomley for his part in shaping the project of critical legal geography that was the impetus for the initial idea of exploring law's nature and for the pleasures of scholarship founded in friendship. As always my gratitude to Michele Emanatian – whose insight, wisdom, criticism, love, labor, and humor sustain my life - is boundless. And, finally, thanks to all the folks at the Fourth Street Inn.

X