The Politics of International Law

Politics and law appear deeply entwined in contemporary international relations. Yet existing perspectives struggle to understand the complex interplay between these aspects of international life. In this path-breaking volume, a group of leading international relations scholars and legal theorists advance a new constructivist perspective on the politics of international law. They reconceive politics as a field of human action that stands at the intersection of issues of identity, purpose, ethics, and strategy, and define law as an historically contingent institutional expression of such politics. They explain how liberal politics has conditioned modern international law and how law 'feeds back' to constitute international relations and world politics. This new perspective on the politics of international law is illustrated through detailed case-studies of the use of force, climate change, landmines, migrant rights, the International Criminal Court, the Kosovo bombing campaign, international financial institutions, and global governance.

CHRISTIAN REUS-SMIT is Professor and Head of the Department of International Relations in the Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies at the Australian National University. He is the author of *American Power and World Order* (2004), *The Moral Purpose of the State* (1999), co-author of *Theories of International Relations* (2001), and coeditor of *Between Sovereignty and Global Governance* (1998).

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 96

The Politics of International Law

Editorial Board

Steve Smith (Managing editor) Thomas Biersteker Phil Cerny Michael Cox A. J. R. Groom Richard Higgott Kimberly Hutchings Caroline Kennedy-Pipe Steve Lamy Michael Mastanduno Louis Pauly Ngaire Woods

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series will include a wide range of material, from undergraduate textbooks and surveys to research-based monographs and collaborative volumes. The aim of the series is to publish the best new scholarship in International Studies from Europe, North America, and the rest of the world.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

96	Christian Reus-Smit (ed.)
	The politics of international law

- 95 Barry Buzan
 From international to world society?
 English School Theory and the social structure of globalisation
- 94 K. J. Holsti
 Taming the sovereigns
 Institutional change in international politics
- 93 Bruce Cronin Institutions for the common good International protection regimes in international society
- 92 *Paul Keal* **European conquest and the rights of indigenous peoples** The moral backwardness of international society
- 91 Barry Buzan and Ole Wæver Regions and powers The structure of international security
- 90 A. Claire Cutler
 Private power and global authority
 Transnational merchant law in the global political economy
- 89 Patrick M. Morgan Deterrence now
- 88 Susan Sell
 Private power, public law
 The globalization of intellectual property rights
- 87 Nina Tannenwald
 The nuclear taboo
 The United States and the non-use of nuclear weapons since 1945
- 86 Linda Weiss
 States in the global economy
 Bringing domestic institutions back in
- 85 Rodney Bruce Hall and Thomas J. Biersteker (eds.) The emergence of private authority in global governance

(List continues at the end of book)

The Politics of International Law

Edited by Christian Reus-Smit Australian National University



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521837669 - The Politics of International Law Edited by Christian Reus-Smit Frontmatter More information

> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Palatino 10/12.5 pt. System $LAT_EX 2_{\varepsilon}$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

The politics of international law / edited by Christian Reus-Smit. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international relations: 96) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 83766 9 – ISBN 0 521 54671 0 (pb) 1. International law – Political aspects. 2. International relations. I. Reus-Smit, Christian, 1961– II. Series. KZ1250.P65 2004 341–dc22 2003065412

ISBN 0 521 83766 9 hardback ISBN 0 521 54671 0 paperback

Contents

	List of contributors Preface	ix xii
1	Introduction Christian Reus-Smit	1
2	The politics of international law <i>Christian Reus-Smit</i>	14
3	When states use armed force <i>Dino Kritsiotis</i>	45
4	Soft law, hard politics, and the Climate Change Treaty <i>Robyn Eckersley</i>	80
5	Emerging customary norms and anti-personnel landmines <i>Richard Price</i>	106
6	International law, politics, and migrant rights <i>Amy Gurowitz</i>	131
7	The International Criminal Court David Wippman	151
8	The Kosovo bombing campaign Nicholas J. Wheeler	189
9	International financial institutions Antony Anghie	217

vii

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521837669 - The Politics of International Law Edited by Christian Reus-Smit Frontmatter More information

Contents

10	Law, politics, and international governance Wayne Sandholtz and Alec Stone Sweet	238
11	Society, power, and ethics Christian Reus-Smit	272
	Bibliography Index	291 316

viii

List of contributors

ANTONY ANGHIE is Professor at the S. J. Quinnery School of Law at the University of Utah, where he teaches, among other subjects, international business transactions, international law and contracts. His research has focused principally on the relationship between colonialism and international law, and he has published a number of articles on this subject.

ROBYN ECKERSLEY is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Political Science at the University of Melbourne. She is the author of *Environmentalism and Political Theory: Toward an Ecocentric Approach* (State University of New York Press, 1992); editor of *Markets, the State and the Environment: Towards Integration* (Macmillan, 1995); author of *The Green State: Rethinking Democracy and Sovereignty* (MIT Press, 2004); and coeditor with John Barry of *The State and the Global Ecological Crisis* (MIT Press, 2004).

AMY GUROWITZ is a Lecturer at the University of California at Berkeley and a postdoctoral fellow with the Travers Program in Ethics and Government Accountability. She is a recipient of an SSRC–MacArthur Fellowship in Peace and Security in a Changing World, and the author of articles in a range of journals, including *World Politics* and the *Journal of Asian Studies*.

DINO KRITSIOTIS is Reader in Public International Law at the University of Nottingham, where he has taught since October 1994. He has served as the Rapporteur of the Theory Committee of the International Law Association (British Branch) (1998–2001) and has held visiting professorships at the University of Cape Town, the Fletcher School of Law

List of contributors

and Diplomacy at Tufts University and the University of Michigan Law School.

RICHARD PRICE is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of British Columbia. His work has focused on the development of norms of warfare and constructivist international relations theory. He is the author of *The Chemical Weapons Taboo* (Cornell University Press, 1997), and articles in a range of journals, including *International Organization*, *Review of International Studies*, and *European Journal of International Relations*.

CHRISTIAN REUS-SMIT is Professor and Head of the Department of International Relations in the Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies at the Australian National University. He is author of *American Power and World Order* (Polity Press, 2004) and *The Moral Purpose of the State* (Princeton University Press, 1999), co-author of *Theories of International Relations* (Palgrave, 2001), and co-editor of *Between Sovereignty and Global Governance* (Macmillan, 1998). His articles have appeared in a range of journals, including *International Organization*, *Millennium, European Journal of International Relations*, and *Review of International Studies*. His research interests focus on international relations theory, international history, international law, international ethics, institutional theory, and the application of social theory to the study of global politics.

WAYNE SANDHOLTZ is Professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of California, Irvine, where he has been Director of the Center for Global Peace and Conflict Studies for the past two years. His chief research interest currently is the evolution of international rules, that is, how and why norms change over time. His articles have been published in a variety of leading journals, including *International Organization, International Studies Quarterly*, and *World Politics*.

ALEC STONE SWEET is Official Fellow, Chair of Comparative Politics, at Nuffield College, Oxford. He has published extensively on comparative law and politics, and on international law and politics. His books include *On Law, Politics, and Judicialization* (Oxford University Press, 2002) (with Martin Shapiro); *The Institutionalization of Europe* (Oxford University Press, 2001) (with Wayne Sandholtz and Neil Fligstein); *Governing with Judges: Constitutional Politics in Europe* (Oxford University Press, 2000); *European Integration and Supranational Governance* (Oxford University Press, 1998) (co-edited with Wayne Sandholtz); and *The European Court of Justice and National Courts – Doctrine and*

х

List of contributors

Jurisprudence: Legal Change in its Social Context (Oxford: Hart Publishing, 1998) (co-edited with Anne Marie Slaughter and Joseph Weiler).

NICHOLAS J. WHEELER is a Reader in the Department of International Politics at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. He is co-editor of *Human Rights in World Politics* (with Tim Dunne) and author of *Saving Strangers: Humanitarian Intervention in International Society* (Oxford University Press, 2000). His research interests are theories of international society and humanitarian intervention.

DAVID WIPPMAN is Professor of Law at Cornell University, where he has been teaching public international law and human rights since 1992. In 1998–9, Wippman served as a Director in the Office of Multilateral and Humanitarian Affairs at the US National Security Council. In that capacity, he worked on war crimes issues, the International Criminal Court, economic sanctions, and UN political issues. He is the editor of *International Law and Ethnic Conflict* (Cornell University Press, 1998), and is completing a book for the American Society of International Law on humanitarian intervention.

Preface

In late 2002 an increasingly heated debate arose within the United Nations Security Council about the merits of using force to disarm and depose Saddam Hussein's regime in Iraq. The Bush Administration gave the Council an ultimatum: uphold the rule of international law, expressed in numerous Council resolutions calling on the regime to disarm, or follow the League of Nations into the dustbin of history. If the Council would not license the use of force, the United States would lead a 'Coalition of the Willing' to defend the rule of law and protect international security. Despite the immense material resources commanded by the United States, the majority of Council members remained unpersuaded. Most did not accept that the regime posed an imminent threat to international security and favoured a strategy of deterrence combined with an invigorated system of weapons inspections. They were also suspicious of American motives. It was clear to even the most casual observer that the Bush Administration was at least as interested in regime change as it was disarmament.

The Administration's position came to be seen, therefore, not as essential to upholding the rule of international law but as a threat to that rule. When the weapons inspectors returned to Iraq their reports failed to support the Administration's claims that Iraq posed an imminent threat (thus warranting Chapter 7 action), America's not-so-veiled commitment to regime change threatened the fundamental principles of sovereignty and non-intervention, and the Administration was threatening the unilateral use of force outside of the UN framework. In the end, the United States suffered its worst diplomatic defeat in fifty years when it failed to achieve a new Council resolution licensing the use of force. Its subsequent war in Iraq successfully deposed Hussein's regime

Preface

but the Bush Administration has struggled ever since to shake off an aura of illegality and illegitimacy.

This story reveals the complex interplay between politics and law in contemporary international relations. The entire process was deeply political, but law was implicated at every turn. Once the Bush Administration entered the Council process its arguments were always cast in legal terms – it was the demands of international law, so publicly flouted by the Iraqi regime, that it insisted warranted the use of force. But its interpretation of the law, and also of the regime's threat to that law, was contested by other Council members and large sectors of world society. Having lost this politico-legal debate, the Administration fell back on America's material power and acted unilaterally without the cover of international legitimacy.

This interplay between politics and law is a recurrent feature of international relations at the beginning of the twenty-first century, but our existing frameworks of understanding are poorly equipped to comprehend this phenomenon. As Chapter 1 explains, we are accustomed to thinking of politics and law as separate domains of international social life, each with their own distinctive logics. This book is an attempt to rethink the relationship between international politics and law so as to better understand the complex interconnections we see in so many issueareas. It grew out of a long-standing conversation with my friend and colleague, Paul Keal. Both of us were deeply dissatisfied with the way in which International Relations scholars discussed politics and law, with the way in which politics was reduced to an anaemic form of strategic action and law deprived of all socially-constitutive influence. The ideas that frame this book are very much the product of our conversation, and I am deeply indebted to Paul for his friendship and insight.

The project took form around a small research workshop that Paul and I organised at the Australian National University in November 2000. With financial and administrative support from the Department of International Relations in the Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, we brought together an extraordinary group of International Relations scholars and international lawyers. Most of our contributors participated in this event, although Wayne Sandholtz was unable to attend and Amy Gurowitz joined the project later. Richard Devetak, Hilary Charlesworth, and John Braithwaite also presented papers at the workshop, and Paul and I are immensely grateful for their invaluable contribution to the group's deliberations. The event would never have

xiii

Preface

occurred had it not been for the support of John Ravenhill, then Head of the Department of International Relations. Lorraine Elliott and Greg Fry also supported the project from the outset, and played crucial roles as discussants throughout the workshop. Carolyn Bull and Malcolm Cook facilitated our discussions by providing daily rapporteurs' reports on the preceding day's deliberations, and Amy Chen was invaluable in administrative support. Most of my colleagues in the department participated in the workshop and deserve thanks for their ever-reliable support and critical interventions. Finally, I would like to express my gratitude to those who not only participated in the workshop but also provided chapters for this volume. It is ultimately their efforts that have made this project so satisfying.

Steve Smith and John Haslam have supported the project from the outset, and I am immensely grateful to both for their sage advice at critical junctures in the book's evolution. Cambridge solicited reader's reports from three leading scholars, and together these were invaluable in guiding our revisions. Mary-Louise Hickey, my department's research officer, managed the editorial process and skilfully co-edited the manuscript. Without her ever-patient assistance I would have even less hair and the book even less polish. I cannot thank her enough.

Finally, I would like to thank my partner, Heather Rae. As a member of the Department, she is thanked implicitly in preceding paragraphs. This project has been part of our life for the past three years, however, and this merits special mention. It has lurked in the corridors of our life like a mischievous gremlin, frequently inspiring conversation and debate, but also demanding far more time and energy than perhaps it merits. Just as the book bears the imprint of my conversations with Paul, so too does it bear the mark of Heather's and my ongoing discourse about the relationship between politics and norms in international relations. For this and so much more I am eternally grateful.

> CHRIS REUS-SMIT Canberra August 2003

xiv