

Accountability of Armed Opposition Groups in International Law

Who is accountable under international law for the acts committed by armed opposition groups? In today's world the great majority of political conflicts involve non-state actors attempting to exert a political influence (such as overthrowing a government or bringing about secession). Notwithstanding their impact on the course of events, however, we tend to know little about these groups, and even less about how to treat their actions legally.

In this award-winning scholarship, Liesbeth Zegveld examines the need to identify legally the parties involved when internal conflicts arise, and the reality of their demands for rights. Her study draws upon international humanitarian law, human rights law and international criminal law to consider a fundamental question: who is accountable for the acts committed by non-state actors, or for the failure to prevent or repress these acts?

This study will be of interest to academics, postgraduate students and professionals involved with armed conflict and international relations.

LIESBETH ZEGVELD practises as an international and criminal lawyer. In 1998, she received a Fulbright Scholarship to do research at New York University and the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights in Washington, DC. For her dissertation on armed opposition groups she received the degree 'cum laude' and the Netherlands' Human Rights Award, 2000. She is the co-author, with Frits Kalshoven, of the third edition of Constraints on the Waging of War: an Introduction to International Humanitarian Law (ICRC 2001).



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

This series (established in 1946 by Professors Gutteridge, Hersch Lauterpacht and McNair) is a forum of studies of high quality in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal subdisciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelationship.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is increasingly affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are increasingly dealt with by substantive harmonization of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitration, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law. In many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

Professor Sir Robert Jennings edited the series from 1981. Following his retirement as General Editor, an editorial board has been created and Cambridge University Press has recommitted itself to the series, affirming its broad scope.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law (CSICL)

GENERAL EDITORS

Professor James Crawford SC FBA
Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law and Director,
Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge
Member of the International Law Commission

Professor John S. Bell FBA Professor of Law Faculty of Law University of Cambridge



EDITORIAL BOARD

Professor Hilary Charlesworth, University of Adelaide
Professor Lori Damrosch, Columbia University Law School
Professor John Dugard, Universiteit Leiden
Professor Mary-Ann Glendon, Harvard Law School
Professor Christopher Greenwood, London School of Economics
Professor David Johnston, University of Edinburgh
Professor Hein Kötz, Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg
Professor Donald McRae, University of Ottawa
Professor Onuma Yasuaki, University of Tokyo
Professor Reinhard Zimmermann, Universität Regensburg

ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Professor Sir D. W Bowett QC
Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC
Professor Sir Robert Jennings QC
Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC
Professor Sir Eli Lauterpacht QC
Professor Kurt Lipstein QC
Judge Stephen Schwebel

A list of the books in this series can be found at the end of this book



Accountability of Armed Opposition Groups in International Law

Liesbeth Zegveld





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa http://www.cambridge.org

© Liesbeth Zegveld 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002 Reprinted 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Swift 10/13 pt. System LATEX $2_{\mathcal{E}}$ $_{\text{[TB]}}$

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 81130 9 hardback



Contents

	Table of treaties and declarations	page ix
	Table of cases	xiii
	Table of other documents	xviii
	List of abbreviations	xxvii
	Introduction	1
	PART 1 THE NORMATIVE GAP	
1	Legal restraints on armed opposition groups as such	9
	Common Article 3 and Protocol II	9
	Other rules of humanitarian law	26
	Human rights law	38
	International criminal law	55
2	Substantive obligations of armed opposition	
	groups as such	59
	Humane treatment of prisoners	59
	Protection of civilians	75
	Underdevelopment of the law	92
	PART 2 THE ACCOUNTABILITY GAP	
3	Accountability of group leaders	97
	Crimes	99
	Command responsibility of group leaders	111
	Criteria for accountability of group leaders	121
	Limited prospects for prosecution	131
4	Accountability of armed opposition groups as such	133
	Evidence for accountability of armed opposition groups	134

vii



viii	CONTENTS	
	Attributing acts to armed opposition groups	152
	Successful armed opposition groups	155
	Finding a suitable forum	157
5	Accountability of the state for acts of armed	
	opposition groups	164
	Applicable law	166
	The obligation of the state to take action	180
	The pertinence of territorial control	207
6	The quest for accountability	220
	Group versus individual accountability	220
	Group versus state accountability	224
	Conclusion	229
	Bibliography	231
	Index	242



Table of treaties and declarations

- 1907 Hague Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land, reprinted in Schindler and Toman, Laws of Armed Conflicts 57 103, 114
- 1945 Charter of the Nuremberg Tribunal, reprinted in Schindler and Toman, *Laws of Armed Conflicts* 826 (Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of the Major War Criminals of the European Axis) 55, 56, 98, 105, 106
- 1945 Charter of the United Nations, reprinted in Brownlie BDIL 1 2, 4, 88, 144
- 1945 Statute of the International Court of Justice, reprinted in Brownlie BDIL 438 4, 26
- 1946 Charter for the International Military Tribunal for the Far East, Special Proclamation of the Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers of 19 January 1946, reprinted in: Department of State Bulletin, Vol. XIV, No. 349 (10 March 1946) 98
- 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 31 44, 108, 109, 178, 185, 186, 189, 197, 219, 221
- 1949 Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (Geneva Convention I) 75 UNTS 31 111
- 1949 Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea (Geneva Convention II) 75 UNTS 85 111
- 1949 Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Geneva Convention III) 75 UNTS 135 29, 38, 69, 70, 71, 111

ix



X TABLE OF TREATIES

- 1949 Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Geneva Convention IV) 75 UNTS 287 29, 65, 66, 67, 71, 103, 104, 111, 200
- 1950 Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 326 39, 45, 161, 162, 166, 167, 168, 170, 171, 173, 180, 184, 186, 191, 198, 204, 209, 216
- 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 64 180
- 1954 Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, reprinted in Schindler and Toman, *Laws of Armed Conflicts* 661 27, 28, 36, 81, 93, 146, 147, 148, 177, 185, 197
- 1961 European Social Charter, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 363
- 1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 114 43, 44
- 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 125 38, 39, 43, 44, 45, 50, 64, 66, 70, 149, 161, 166, 168, 172, 173, 179, 180, 181, 183, 184, 185, 187, 198, 210–11, 216
- 1969 American Convention on Human Rights, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 495 39, 40, 41, 45, 47, 50, 61, 159, 160, 161, 166, 167, 177, 180, 184, 198, 212, 216
- 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, reprinted in Brownlie BDIL 388 30, 45, 209, 212, 215, 216
- 1975 UN Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from being Subjected to Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, UN General Assembly Res. 3452 (XXX) 149
- 1977 Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I) 16 ILM 1391 (1977) 17, 18, 27, 29, 32, 33, 34, 35, 38, 65, 66, 73, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 80, 82, 102, 114, 115, 120, 122, 124, 128, 129, 130, 194
- 1977 Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II) 6 ILM 1442 (1977) 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21, 22, 25, 26, 29, 30, 33, 34, 37, 42, 50, 51, 52, 53, 57, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 67, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 80, 83, 85, 86, 87, 89, 91, 92, 93, 99, 100, 101, 102, 103, 105, 112, 117, 136, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148,



TABLE OF TREATIES

хi

- 157, 158, 166, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 180, 184, 187, 189, 198, 199, 200, 206, 207, 218, 221, 225
- 1984 Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 38 178, 179, 180
- 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child, reprinted in Brownlie BDHR 182 63
- 1990 San José Agreement on Human Rights (El Salvador Frente Farabundo Marti para la Liberacion Nacional (FMLN)), UN Doc. A/44/971, S/21541, Annex 49–50, 51, 186, 212
- 1992 Declaration on the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance, UN General Assembly Res. 47/133 198, 206
- 1993 Statute of the International Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of the Former Yugoslavia Since 1991, reprinted in Brownlie BDIL 456 107, 109, 112, 113, 115, 116, 117, 118, 119, 120, 121, 124, 125, 128, 130, 131, 200, 222
- 1994 Statute of the International Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Genocide and Other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Rwanda and Rwandan Citizens Responsible for Genocide and Other Such Violations Committed in the Territory of Neighbouring States Between 1 January 1994 and 31 December 1994, 33 ILM 1602 (1994) 100, 107, 109, 112, 114, 115, 116, 117, 118, 119, 120, 121, 124, 125, 128, 130, 131, 136, 200, 222
- 1996 Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Mines, Booby-Traps and Other Devices as Amended on 3 May 1996 (entry into force 3 December 1998), 35 ILM 1206 (1996) (Protocol II to the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which may be Deemed to be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects) 26, 36, 85, 86, 146, 147, 177, 184, 185, 187, 188, 197, 212, 218
- 1997 Convention on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on their Destruction (entry into force 1 March 1999), 36 ILM 1507 (1997) 27, 177, 184, 185, 188, 197
- 1998 Statute of the International Criminal Court, 37 ILM 999 (1998) 55, 57, 58, 98, 101, 103, 104, 105, 106, 108, 109, 111, 113, 117, 119, 120, 124, 127, 128, 130, 141, 142, 200, 221, 222



XII TABLE OF TREATIES

1998 United Kingdom Human Rights Act 1998, 38 ILM 464 (1999)
1999 Second Protocol to the Hague Convention of 1954 for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, text available on www.icrc.org/ihl (visited, 1 January 2001) 27, 28, 82, 146, 147, 177, 185, 189, 197



Table of cases

International Court of Justice

- Case Concerning the Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina *versus* Federal Republic of Yugoslavia) Application of 20 March 1993 178
- Corfu Channel Case (UK *versus* Albania) (Judgment of 9 April 1949) (Merits) 1949 ICJ Rep. 4 209
- Difference Relating to Immunity From Legal Process of a Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights (Advisory Opinion of 29 April 1999) 1999 ICJ Rep. 62 214
- Gabcíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary *versus* Slovakia) (Judgment of 25 September 1997) 37 ILM 162 (1998) 211, 212
- Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (Advisory Opinion of 21 June 1971) 1971 ICJ Rep. 16 209
- Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons (Advisory Opinion of 8 July 1996) 35 ILM 809 (1996) 19, 26, 85, 227
- Military and Paramilitary Activities In and Against Nicaragua (Nicaragua *versus* US) (Judgment of 27 June 1986) (Merits) 1986 ICJ Rep. 14 10, 13, 19, 20, 24, 174
- Reservations to the Convention on Genocide (Advisory Opinion of 28 May 1951) 1951 ICJ Rep. 15 108
- United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Teheran Case (US *versus* Iran) (Judgment of 24 May 1980), 1980 ICJ Rep. 3 182, 183
- Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (Germany versus US) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures, 3 March 1999), 37 ILM 810 (1998) 214

xiii



XIV TABLE OF CASES

European Court of Human Rights

Akkoc *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 10 October 2000) 193 Çakici *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 8 July 1999) (not yet published) 171 Ergi *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 28 July 1998) 81 Reports (1998-IV) at 1751 168, 190, 192, 194, 199, 204

HLR versus France (Judgment of 29 April 1997) 36 Reports (1997-III) at 745 167

Kaya versus Turkey (Judgment of 19 February 1998) 204

Kilic versus Turkey (Judgment of 28 March 2000) 193

Kurt *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 25 May 1998) 74 Reports (1998-III) at 1152 170. 204

Loizidou *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 23 March 1995) (Preliminary Objections) Ser. A 310 (1995) 209

Platform 'Ärzte Für Das Leben' (Judgment of 21 June 1988) Ser. A 139 (1988) 167, 182, 195

Yasa *versus* Turkey (Judgment of 2 September 1998) 88 Reports (1998-VI) at 2411 193, 198, 203

X and Y versus Netherlands (Judgment of 26 March 1985) Eur. Ct. HR Ser. A 91 (1985) 185

European Commission of Human Rights

W. versus United Kingdom, Appl. 9348/81, 32 DR 190 (1983) 191, 195, 199

X versus Ireland, Appl. 6040/73 (Decision of 20 July 1973) 16 YB ECHR 388 (1973) 185

Yasa *versus* Turkey, Appl. 22495/93, Report of the Commission (8 April 1997) 88 Reports (1998-VI) 193, 204

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Las Palmeras (Judgment of 4 February 2000) 161 Velásquez Rodríguez *versus* Honduras, Ser. C 4 (1988) 167, 171, 182, 184, 196, 198

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Rep. No 26/97, Case No 11.142 (Colombia) (30 September 1997) 10 Tablada Case, Rep. No 55/97, Case No 11.137 (Argentina) (30 October 1997) 10, 41, 61, 136, 137, 138, 146, 160



TABLE OF CASES

XV

International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

- Aleksovski Case, Prosecutor *versus* Aleksovski, Case No. IT-95-14/1-T (25 June 1999) 98–9, 106, 113, 116, 119, 120, 122, 123, 126, 127, 129, 130, 131, 142, 223
- Aleksovski Case, Prosecutor *versus* Zlatko Aleksovski, Case No. IT-95-14/1-A (24 March 2000) (Appeal) 116
- Blaškić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Tihomir Blaškić, Decision on the Defence Motion to Strike Portions of the Amended Indictment Alleging 'Failure to Punish Liability', Case No. IT-95-14-PT (4 April 1997) 129
- Blaškić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Tihomir Blaškić, Case No. IT-95-14-T (3 March 2000) 104
- Celebici Case, Prosecutor *versus* Zejnil Delalic, Zdravko Mucic, Hazim Delic, Esad Landzo, Case No. IT-96-21-T (16 November 1998) 24, 31, 100, 101, 103, 110, 111, 117, 118, 119, 121, 122, 125, 126, 127, 129
- Furundžija Case, Prosecutor *versus* Anto Furundžija, Case No. IT-95-17/1-T (10 December 1998) 100, 112, 205
- Furundžija Case, Prosecutor *versus* Anto Furundžija, Case No. IT-95-17/1-A (21 July 2000) (Appeal)
- Karadzić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Radovan Karadzić and Ratko Mladic, Review of Indictment Pursuant to Rule 61 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, Case No. IT-95-5-R61 & No. IT-95-18-R61 (11 July 1996) 110. 117
- Kordić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Dario Kordić, Mario Cerkez, Decision on the Joint Defence Motion to Dismiss the Amended Indictment for Lack of Jurisdiction Based on the Limited Jurisdictional Reach of Articles 2 and 3, Case No. IT-95-14/2-PT (2 March 1999) 20–1, 104, 129
- Kupreskić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Kupreskić et al., Case No. IT-95-16-T (14 January 2000) 23, 60, 91
- Martić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Milan Martić, Review of Indictment Pursuant to Rule 61 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, Case No. IT-95-11-R61 (8 March 1996) 90, 91
- Milosović Case, Prosecutor *versus* Slobodan Milosovic, Milan Milutinovic, Nikola Sainovic, Dragoljub Ojdanic, Vlajko Stojilkovic, Decision on Review of Indictment and Application for Consequential Orders (24 May 1999) 117
- Nikolić Case, Prosecutor *versus* Dragon Nikolić, Review of Indictment Pursuant to Rule 61 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, Case No. IT-94-2-R61 (20 October 1995) 107



XVI TABLE OF CASES

Tadić Case, Decision on the Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction, Case No. IT-94-1-AR72 (2 October 1995) 19, 20, 21, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 34, 36, 61, 62, 77, 80, 81, 100, 101, 102, 104, 105, 107, 135, 144, 147, 148

Prosecutor versus Duško Tadić, Case No. IT-94-1-T (7 May 1997) (Merits) 60, 105, 107, 112

Prosecutor versus Duško Tadić, Case No. IT-94-1-A (15 July 1999) (Appeal on Merits) 35, 103, 112, 123

International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

Akayesu Case, Prosecutor *versus* Jean-Paul Akayesu, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T (2 September 1998) 11, 16, 19, 21, 100, 105, 108, 135, 136, 143, 145

Kayishema Case, Prosecutor *versus* Clément Kayishema and Obed Ruzindana, Case No. IT-95-14-PT & No. ICTR-95-1-T (21 May 1999) 16, 61, 75, 105, 110, 118, 121, 122, 123, 124, 128, 129

Musema Case, Prosecutor *versus* Musema, Case No. ICTR-96-13 (27 January 2000) 75, 105, 165

Rutaganda Case, Prosecutor *versus* Rutaganda, Case No. ICTR-96-3 (6 December 1999) 100

European Court of Justice

A. Racke GmbH & Co. *versus* Hauptzollamt Mainz, Case C-162/96 (Judgment of 16 June 1998), [1998-6] ECR, I-3655 215

Human Rights Committee

A. and H. Sanjuan Arevalo *versus* Colombia, Comm. No. 181/1984 (View adopted on 3 November 1989) Official Records of the Human Rights Committee 1989/90, Vol. II, at 392–4 171, 172

Committee against Torture

GRB versus Sweden, Comm. 83/1997, CAT/C/20/D/83/1997 (View adopted on 15 May 1998) 179

Mexican General Claims Commission

US versus Mexican General Claims Commission, Youmans Claim, US versus Mexico (1926), 4 RIAA 110 155



TABLE OF CASES XVII

National Courts

USA versus Pohl 116

US *versus* Wilhelm von Leeb et al. (the High Command Case), Trials of War Criminals before the Nuremberg Military Tribunals under Control Council Law No. 10 1946–9, Vol. XI, at 543–4 (Washington DC, US Government Printing Office, 1950) 124

Yamashita Case, Trial of General Tomoyuki Yamashita (US Military Commission, Manila, 8 October – 7 December 1945), United Nations War Crimes Commission, 4 Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals, 1, 88 (1945) 98



Table of other documents

Human Rights Committee

General Comment 6/16 (27 July 1982) on Article 6 of the International Covenant, reproduced in A/37/40, Annex V 180, 181, 198

General Comment 20/44 (3 April 1992) on Article 7 of the Covenant, reproduced in A/47/40, Annex VI 185, 206

Decision of the Human Rights Committee on State Succession to the Obligations of the Former Yugoslavia under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, reprinted in 15 EHRR, 233 (1992) 149

Concluding Observations on Sri Lanka, CCPR/C/79/Add.56 (3 October 1995) 199

Concluding Observations on Algeria, CCPR/C/79/Add.95 (4 August 1998) 169, 189, 199

Summary Records of the 19th Sess., CCPR/C/SR.442-444 (summer 1983)

Summary Records of the 29^{th} Sess., CCPR/C/SR.716 (8 April 1987) 201 Summary Records of the 42^{nd} Sess., CCPR/C/SR.1067 (summer 1991) 185

Summary Records of the 54th Sess., CCPR/C/SR.1436 (28 June 1995) 196 Yearbook of the Human Rights Committee 1983–84, Vol. II., CCPR/4/Add.1 195, 199

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Nicaragua, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.45, Doc. 16 rev.1 (17 November 1978)

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in the Republic of Colombia, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.53, Doc. 22 (30 June 1981) 160

xviii



TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

xix

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in the Republic of Nicaragua, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.53, Doc. 25 (30 June 1981)

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in the Republic of Guatemala, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.61, Doc. 47, rev.1 (5 October 1983) 189

Second Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Colombia, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.84 (4 October 1993) 39, 62, 69, 158, 185, 192, 195

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.85, Doc. 28, rev. (11 February 1994) 205, 212

Third Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Colombia, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.102, Doc. 9, rev.1 (26 February 1999) 11–12, 16, 20, 21, 32, 36, 41, 54, 61, 65, 67, 75, 76, 79, 80, 81, 82, 84, 85, 145, 155, 158, 160, 196, 206

Annual Reports 1971–81, in Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Ten Years of Activities 1971–1981 (1982) 170, 180, 199

Annual Report 1992–3, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.83 Doc. 14, corr.1 (12 March 1993) 47, 159

Annual Report 1996, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.95, Doc. 7, rev. (14 March 1997) 47, 62, 64, 69, 90, 169

Committee against Torture

General Comment on the Implementation of Article 3 in the Context of Article 22 of the Convention Against Torture, A/53/44, Annex IX (1998)

UN Security Council

Res. 733 on Somalia (23 January 1992)¹ 88

Res. 788 on Liberia (19 November 1992) 32, 139

Res. 794 on Somalia (3 December 1992) 11, 32, 88, 113

Res. 808 on the Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (22 February 1993) 20, 111

Res. 812 on Rwanda (12 March 1993) 11

Res. 814 on Somalia (26 March 1993) 32, 138

Res. 993 on Georgia (12 May 1993) 31

Res. 837 on Somalia (6 June 1993) 113

Res. 851 on Angola (15 July 1993) 77, 88

Res. 955 on the Establishment of the Rwanda Tribunal (8 November 1994) 111

Res. 968 on Tajikistan (16 December 1994) 67

¹ The text of resolutions of the UN Security Council is available on www/un.org.



XX TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

Res. 972 on Liberia (13 January 1995) 32

Res. 1001 on Liberia (30 June 1995) 32

Res. 1076 on Afghanistan (22 October 1996)

Res. 1193 on Afghanistan (28 August 1998) 11, 48, 104, 113, 150

Res. 1212 on Angola (3 December 1998) 48

Res. 1261 on Children in Armed Conflict (25 August 1999) 63

Res. 1265 on the Protection of Civilians in Armed Conflict (17 September 1999)

Res. 1315 on the Establishment of a Special Court for Sierra Leone (14 August 2000) 37

Res. 1325 on Women, Peace and Security (31 October 2000) 68

Final Report of the Commission of Experts for Yugoslavia Established Pursuant to Security Council Resolution 780 (1992) S/1994/674, Annex (27 May 1994) 100, 118

Final Report of the Commission of Experts for Rwanda Established Pursuant to Security Council Resolution 935, S/1994/1405, Annex (1994) 105, 107, 109

UN General Assembly

Final Declaration and Programme of Action of the 1993 World Conference on Human Rights, A/Conf.157/23, reprinted in 32 ILM 166 (1993) Res. 174 (II) on the Establishment of the International Law Commission, A/519, at 105 ff. (1947)

Res. 2444 (XXIII) Respect for Human Rights in Armed Conflicts (19 December 1968), reprinted in Schindler and Toman, *Laws of Armed Conflicts* 199 31, 32, 76, 78

Res. 2675 (XXV) Basic Principles for the Protection of Civilian Populations in Armed Conflicts (9 December 1970), reprinted in Schindler and Toman, *Laws of Armed Conflicts* 203 31, 32, 76, 77, 78, 80, 87, 90, 91

Res. 40/32 Basic Principles on the Independence of the Judiciary (29 November 1985) 72

Res. 40/146 Basic Principles on the Independence of the Judiciary (13 December 1985) 72

Report of the Preparatory Committee, United Nations Diplomatic Conference of Plenipotentiaries on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court, A/CONF.183/2/Add.1 (14 April 1998) 56

Working Group on General Principles of Criminal Law, United Nations Diplomatic Conference of Plenipotentiaries on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court, A/Conf.183/C.1/WGGP/L.5/Rev.2 (3 July 1998) 57



TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

xxi

UN Commission on Human Rights

- Res. 1984/52, 'Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador' (14 March 1984)²
- Res. 1986/39, 'Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador' (12 March 1986)
- Res. 1988/65, 'Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador' (8 March 1988) 63
- Res. 1989/67, 'Question of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms in Afghanistan' (8 March 1989) 67, 69, 88, 90
- Res. 1989/68, 'Question of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms in El Salvador' (8 March 1989) 81, 145
- Res. 1990/53, 'Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan' (6 March 1990) 77
- Res. 1990/75, 'Consequences of Acts of Violence Committed by Irregular Armed Groups and Drug Traffickers for the Enjoyment of Human Rights' (7 March 1990) 46
- Res. 1990/77, 'Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador' (7 March 1990) 48
- Res. 1991/29, 'Consequences on the Enjoyment of Human Rights of Acts of Violence Committed by Armed Groups that Spread Terror Among the Population and by Drug Traffickers' (5 March 1991) 43, 46
- Res. 1991/75, 'Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador' (6 March 1991) Res. 1992/42, 'Consequences on the Enjoyment of Human Rights of Acts of Violence Committed by Armed Groups that Spread Terror Among the Population and by Drug Traffickers' (28 February 1992) 46
- Res. 1993/48, 'Consequences on the Enjoyment of Human Rights of Acts of Violence Committed by Armed Groups that Spread Terror Among the Population and by Drug Traffickers' (9 March 1993) 46
- Res. 1993/60, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sudan' (10 March 1993) 46
- Res. 1993/66, 'Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan' (10 March 1993) 22, 65, 91
- Res. 1993/71, 'Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions' (10 March 1993) 199
- Res. 1993/83, 'Effects of Armed Conflicts on Children's Lives' (10 March 1993)
- Res. 1994/39, 'Question of Enforced Disappearances' (4 March 1994) Res. 1994/46, 'Human Rights and Terrorism' (4 March 1994) 48, 181

 $^{^2}$ The text of resolutions of the UN Commission on Human Rights is available on www/unhcr.ch.



XXII TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

Res. 1995/74, 'Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan' (8 March 1995) 48, 66

Res. 1995/77, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sudan' (8 March 1995) 33, 65, 69

Res. 1996/47, 'Human Rights and Terrorism' (19 April 1996) 42

Res. 1996/73, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sudan' (23 April 1996) 88

Res. 1997/42, 'Human Rights and Terrorism' (11 April 1997) 48

Res. 1997/47, 'Assistance to Somalia in the Field of Human Rights' (11 April 1997) 150

Res. 1997/59, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sudan' (15 April 1997) 11, 88

Res. 1998/59, 'Assistance to Somalia in the Field of Human Rights' (17 April 1998) 139

Res. 1998/67, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sudan' (21 April 1998) 11, 22, 145

Res. 1998/70, 'The Question of Human Rights in Afghanistan' (21 April 1998) 150

Res. 1999/1, 'Situation of Human Rights in Sierra Leone (6 April 1999) 104, 139

Res. 1999/18, 'The Situation of Human Rights in the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro), the Republic of Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina (23 April 1999) 11

Res. 1999/65, 'Fundamental Standards of Humanity' (28 April 1999) 46 Res. 2000/18, 'Situation of Human Rights in the Democratic Republic of the Congo' (18 April 2000) 37, 87

Res. 2000/69, 'Fundamental Standards of Humanity' (27 April 2000) 46 Summary Records of the $2^{\rm nd}$ Sess., E/CN.4/SR.431 (1947) and E/CN.4/AC.1/SR.34 (1948)

Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, E/CN.4/1435 (26 January 1981) 209

Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador of the Special Representative for El Salvador, J. A. Pastor Ridruejo, E/CN.4/1502 (18 January 1982) 202

Report by the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, S. Amos Wako, E/CN.4/1983/16 (31 January 1983) 69

Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador of the Special Representative for El Salvador, J. A. Pastor Ridruejo, E/CN.4/1984/25 (19 January 1984) 11, 33, 202

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador of the Special Representative, J. A. Pastor Ridruejo, E/CN.4/1985/18 (1 February 1985) 11, 13, 145



TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS XXIII

- Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan of the Special Rapporteur, F. Ermacora, E/CN.4/1985/21 (19 February 1985) 11, 13, 29, 48
- Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in El Salvador of the Special Representative, J. A. Pastor Ridruejo, E/CN.4/1987/21 (2 February 1987) 81
- Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, S. Amos Wako, E/CN.4/1988/22 (19 January 1988) 64
- Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, S. Amos Wako, E/CN.4/1989/25 (6 February 1989) 175
- Report on the Situation in Afghanistan by the Special Rapporteur, F. Ermacora, E/CN.4/1989/24 (16 February 1989) 150, 211
- Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan by the Special Rapporteur, F. Ermacora, E/CN.4/1990/25 (31 January 1990) 79
- Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, S. A. Wako, E/CN.4/1991/36 (3 February 1991) 42
- Report of the Special Rapporteur on Torture, N. S. Rodley, E/CN.4/1992/17 (27 December 1991) 48
- Report by the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, Bacre Waly Ndiaye, E/CN.4/1994/7 (7 December 1993) 88, 181, 190, 201, 206
- Report of the Special Rapporteur on Question of Torture, N. S. Rodley, E/CN.4/1994/31 (6 January 1994) 12, 42
- Report of the Special Rapporteur for Sudan, Gáspár Bíró, E/CN.4/1994/48 (1 February 1994) 42
- Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan by F. Ermacora, E/CN.4/1994/53 (14 February 1994) 211
- Report of Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, Bacre Waly Ndiaye, E/CN.4/1995/61 (14 December 1994) 175, 194
- Joint Report of the Special Rapporteur on Question of Torture, N. S. Rodley, and the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, Bacre Waly Ndiaye, E/CN.4/1995/111 (16 January 1995) 11, 145, 192, 202
- Report of the Special Rapporteur for Sudan, Gáspár Bíró, E/CN.4/1995/58 (30 January 1995) 22
- Report of the Special Rapporteur for Sudan, Gáspár Bíró, E/CN.4/1996/62 (20 February 1996) 68
- Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan of the Special Rapporteur, Choong-Hyun Paik, E/CN.4/1996/64 (27 February 1996) 214



XXIV TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

Statement of the Chairman on Chechnya, E/CN.4/1996/177 (24 April 1996) 67

Report of the Meeting of Special Rapporteurs/Representatives Experts and Chairpersons of Working Groups of the Special Procedures of the Commission on Human Rights and the Advisory Services Programme, E/CN.4/1997/3 (30 September 1996) 39, 42, 45

Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, Bacre Waly Ndiaye, E/CN.4/1997/60/Add.1 (23 December 1996) 48, 64, 77, 175, 200

Final Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Afghanistan of the Special Rapporteur, Choong-Hyun Paik, E/CN.4/1997/59 (20 February 1997) 154, 211

Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement, Report of the Representative of the Secretary-General, F. M. Deng, E/CN.4/1998/53/Add.2 (11 February 1998) 49, 52

Interim Report of the Special Representative on Children in Armed Conflict, O. A. Otunnu, E/CN.4/1998/119 (12 March 1998) 63

UN Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities

Res. 1994/26, 'Minimum Humanitarian Standards' (26 August 1994)³ 49 Report of the Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, L. Joinet, Study on Amnesty Laws and their Role in the Safeguard and Promotion of Human Rights, E/CN.4/Sub.2/1985/16 (21 June 1985) 206

UN High Commissioner for Human Rights

Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Kosovo, HC/Kosovo (7 September 1999)

UN Secretary-General

Report 'Respect for Human Rights in Armed Conflicts', A/7720 (20 November 1969) 15

Report 'Respect for Human Rights in Armed Conflicts', A/8052 (18 September 1970)

³ Text available on www.unhcr.ch.



TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

XXV

Report 'Respect for Human Rights in Armed Conflicts', A/83/70 (2 September 1971)

Report of the UN Secretary-General on the Situation in Somalia, Recommending the Establishment of UNOSOM, S/23829, and add. 1–2 (21 April 1992) 139

Report of the Secretary-General Pursuant to Paragraph 2 of Security Council Resolution 808 (1993), S/25704 (3 May 1993) 20, 55, 113

Report Pursuant to Paragraph 5 of Security Council Resolution 955 (1994), S/1995/134 (13 February 1995) 100

'Analytical Report on Minimum Humanitarian Standards', E/CN.4/ 1998/87 (5 January 1998) 12, 42–3, 45, 46, 52, 54, 109, 143, 144, 227

Report 'Fundamental Standards of Humanity', E/CN.4/1999/92 (18 December 1998) 46, 47, 200

Report on the Protection of Civilians in Armed Conflict, S/1999/957 (8 September 1999) 63

Report 'Fundamental Standards of Humanity', E/CN.4/2000/94 (27 December 1999) 46

Human Rights Division of the United Nations Observer Mission in El Salvador (ONUSAL)

First Report, A/45/1055, S/23037 (16 September 1991) 50, 145 Second Report, A/46/658, S/23222 (15 November 1991) 17, 51, 63, 69, 77, 78, 85, 153, 187

Third Report, A/46/876, S/23580 (19 February 1992) 70, 71, 72, 78, 82, 85, 86, 153, 186, 187

International Law Commission

Draft Code of Offences against Peace and Security of Mankind, A/2693 (1954), reprinted in *ILCYb* 1950, Vol. II, at 11 107, 175

Draft Articles on State Responsibility provisionally adopted by the Commission on first reading, A/51/10 (1996) 133

Draft Code of Crimes against the Peace and Security of Mankind, A/51/10, Supp. No. 10 (1996) 100, 106, 107, 109, 111, 118, 125, 200

Draft Articles on State Responsibility provisionally adopted by the Drafting Committee on second reading in 1998, A/CN.4/L.569 (4 August 1998) 133, 153, 154, 155, 156, 166, 181, 182, 212, 213, 215, 217, 226

First Report of the Special Rapporteur on State Responsibility, J. Crawford, A/CN.4/490/Add.5 (22 July 1998) 133, 156, 157, 182



XXVI TABLE OF OTHER DOCUMENTS

ILCYb 1962, Vol. II (Law of Treaties) 30, 50ILCYb 1975, Vol. II (Commentary to Draft Articles on State Responsibility) 157, 176ILCYb 1979, Vol. II (Commentary to Draft Articles on State Responsibility)

General Assembly of the Organization of American States

Res. 'Consequences of Acts of Violence Perpetrated by Irregular Armed Groups on the Enjoyment of Human Rights', AG/RES.1043, (XX-0/90) (1990), reproduced in *Inter-American Yearbook on Human Rights* 1990, at 352–4 40

Res. 'Respect for International Humanitarian Law', AG/RES. 1335 (XXV-0/95) (9 June 1995), reproduced in: *Inter-American Yearbook on Human Rights* 1995, at 970–2

Other

1995 Turku Declaration on Minimum Humanitarian Standards (adopted at a meeting of experts convened in Turku/Åbo, Finland, 1990), revised version reprinted in (1995) 89 AJIL 218–23 48, 49, 55, 200



Abbreviations

AI Amnesty International

AJIL American Journal of International Law

Am. UJ Int'l L. & Pol'y American University Journal of International Law

and Policy

Ann. SDI Annuaire Suisse de Droit International

Appl. Application

Brownlie BDHR I. Brownlie (ed.), Basic Documents on Human

Rights (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 3rd edn,

reprint 1994) (1992)

Brownlie BDIL I. Brownlie (ed.), Basic Documents in

International Law (Clarendon Press, Oxford,

4th edn. 1995)

BYIL British Yearbook of International Law

Comm. Communication

Denv. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y Denver Journal of International Law and Policy

Doc. Document

DR Decisions and Reports of the European Commission

of Human Rights

ECR European Court Reports. Reports of the Court

of Justice of the European Communities

EHRR European Human Rights Reports

EJIL European Journal of International Law

EPIL Encyclopedia of Public International Law

Eur. Ct. HR European Court of Human Rights

Ga. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Georgia Journal of International and Comparative

Law

GYIL German Yearbook of International Law

HV Humanitäres Völkerrecht

xxvii



XXVIII LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICJ Rep. International Court of Justice, Reports of Judgments,

Advisory Opinions and Orders

ICLQ International and Comparative Law Quarterly ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross

ILC International Law Commission

ILCYb Yearbook of the International Law Commission

ILM International Legal Materials

Inter-Am. Ct. HR Inter-American Court of Human Rights IRRC International Review of the Red Cross Israel YBHR Israel Yearbook on Human Rights Mich. J. Int'l L. Michigan Journal of International Law

Mil. L. Rev. Military Law Review MLJ Manitoba Law Journal

n. note

NILR Netherlands International Law Review

NJB Nederlands Juristenblad

NQHR Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights

NWR Naval War Review

NYIL Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
NYUJ Int'l L & Pol. New York University Journal of International Law

and Politics

ONUSAL United Nations Observer Mission in El Salvador

para. paragraph pr. preamble

RBDI Revue Belge de Droit International

Rep. Report

Reports of Judgments and Decisions. Publication

of the Case Law of the European Commission and Court of Human Rights (as from 1996).

Res. Resolution

RIAA Reports of International Arbitral Awards

Ser. Series

UN United Nations
US United States
vol. volume

Yale LJ. Yale Law Journal

YB ECHR Yearbook of the European Convention of Human

Rights

YIHL Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law YB ILC Yearbook of the International Law Commission