

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 126



Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

```
Vol. 1 (1919-22)
                      Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,
Vol. 2 (1923-24)
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 3 (1925-26)
                      Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)
Vol. 5 (1929-30)
Vol. 6 (1931-32)
Vol. 7 (1933-34)
Vol. 8 (1935-37)
Vol. 9 (1938-40)
Vol. 10 (1941-42)
                      Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 11 (1919-42)
Vol. 12 (1943-45)
Vol. 13 (1946)
Vol. 14 (1947)
Vol. 15 (1948)
Vol. 16 (1949)
```

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                         F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
Vol. 24 (1957)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                        F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27—68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69—126 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases
                          and Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100
                         and Vols. 1—125
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
                         and C. J. Greenwood, C.M.G., Q.C.
```



> Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 126

Edited by

SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

C. J. GREENWOOD, CMG QC

Professor of International Law, London School of Economics and Political Science Bencher of Middle Temple

A. G. OPPENHEIMER

Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

KAREN LEE

Assistant Editor

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Fellow of Girton College, University of Cambridge





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521829908

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN-13 978-0-521-82990-8 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-82990-9 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	XV
Digest (main headings)	xvii
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 126	xix
Table of Treaties	xxxi
Reports of Cases	1
Index	801



PREFACE

The present volume includes decisions given under Chapter 11 of the North American Free Trade Agreement in *Feldman* v. *United Mexican States* (interim decision on preliminary jurisdictional issues, award on merits, and decision on the correction and interpretation of this award), *Pope and Talbot Inc.* v. *Government of Canada* (damages and costs) and *S. D. Myers Inc.* v. *Government of Canada* (damages and costs) together with the judgments of the Canadian courts on applications for judicial review in *Feldman* and *Myers*. The jurisprudence of international tribunals is further reflected in the decisions relating to the proceedings concerning the MOX Plant and in the judgments of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea in *The Volga* and *Land Reclamation* cases. Also reported are decisions from United Kingdom courts in the *A*, *X and Y, Abbasi, CND* and *KAC* cases.

As usual this volume has been the work of many, to all of whom the Editors wish to express their gratitude. Professor Greenwood prepared the summaries of the United Kingdom cases. Ms Karen Lee, Assistant Editor, prepared the summaries of the *Pope and Talbot* and *Myers* cases, the Tables of Cases and Digest, and performed invaluable work in seeing the volume through the press. Summaries were also contributed by Dr Joanna Gomula Crawford (*Feldman*), Mr Samuel Wordsworth (arbitral decisions relating to the MOX Plant), Mr Joshua Brien, LLM (ITLOS *MOX Plant Case* and *The Volga*) and Ms Kylie Evans, LLM (*Land Reclamation*). Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, and Mrs Diane Ilott, Fellows of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, compiled the Table of Treaties and the Index and checked the copy respectively. Mr Adrian Lee read the proofs.

Finally, we would like to extend our thanks to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, TechBooks, and their staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAUTERPACHT RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

C. J. GREENWOOD

Law Department, London School of Economics and Political Science

August 2004



EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

Decisions of International Tribunals

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or *ad hoc* arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public



x

Cambridge University Press 0521829909 - International Law Reports, Volume 126 Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht, C. J. Greenwood, A. G. Oppenheimer and Karen Lee Frontmatter More information

EDITORIAL NOTE

international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

Decisions of National Tribunals

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

Editorial Treatment of Materials

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.



EDITORIAL NOTE

Presentation of Materials
The material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. The source
of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square
brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is
also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body

of the text indicate the pagination of the original report.

Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

Consolidated Index and Tables

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004.

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org

хi



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

A, X and Y and Others v. Home Secretary 585

Abbasi and Juma Case 685

Attorney-General (Canada) v. SD Myers Inc.; United Mexican States (Intervener) 553

CND Case 727

Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the OSPAR Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Final Award) [Arbitral Tribunal] 334

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1) 1, 9, 26, 123

Kuwait Airways Corporation v. Iraqi Airways Co. ("Perjury Action") 758

Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor (Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures) 487

MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) 257 (note), 259, 310, 334

MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Orders Nos 3 and 4) [Arbitral Tribunal] 310 MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures) [International Tribunal for the Law of the Seal 259

Myers, SD, Inc. v. Government of Canada 161, 167, 226, 252 (note)

OSPAR Case 334

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada 127, 131, 156

R (Abbasi and Juma) v. Foreign and Commonwealth Secretary and Home Secretary 685

R (Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament) v. Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Foreign and Commonwealth Secretary and Defence Secretary 727

SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada 161, 167, 226, 252 (note)

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa 536

The Volga (Russian Federation v. Australia) (Application for Prompt Release) 433



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Arbitral Tribunal constituted under Annex VII of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) (1982)

2003

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Order No 3) 310, 314 The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Order No 4) 310, 332

Arbitral Tribunal constituted under the Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic (OSPAR Convention) (1992)

2003

Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the OSPAR Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Final Award) 334

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

2001

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures) 259

2002

The Volga (Russian Federation v. Australia) (Application for Prompt Release) 433

2003

Case Concerning Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor

(Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures) 487

NAFTA Chapter 11 Arbitration Tribunals (ICSID Arbitration Additional Facility Rules)

2000

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1) (Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues) 1, 9

2002

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1) (Award on the Merits) 1, 26

2003

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1) (Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award) 1, 123

NAFTA Chapter 11 Arbitration Tribunals (UNCITRAL Rules)

2001

SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada (Procedural Order No 18) 161, 252 (note)

2002

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada (Award on Damages) 127, 131



xvi

TABLE OF CASES

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

Canada

2003

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa 536

2004

Attorney-General of Canada v. SD Myers Inc.; United Mexican States (Intervener) 553

United Kingdom, England

2002

A, X and Y and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department 585, 589, 631 Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada (Final Award on Costs) 127, 156

- SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada (Second Partial Award on Damages) 161, 167
- SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada (Final Award on Costs) 161, 226
- Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for the Home Department 685
- Regina (Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament) v. Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for Defence 727

2003

Kuwait Airways Corporation v. Iraqi Airways Co. ("Perjury Action") 758



DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air | International Tribunals

Aliens Jurisdiction

Arbitration Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Canals Nationality

Claims Recognition

Comity Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

Conciliation Reprisals and Countermeasures

Consular Relations Rivers

Damages Sea.

Diplomatic Relations Sources of International Law

Economics, Trade and Finance Space

Environment State Immunity

Expropriation State Responsibility

Extradition State Succession

Governments States

Human Rights Territory

International Court of Justice Terrorism

International Criminal Law Treaties

International Organizations War and Armed Conflict

xvii



DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 126

	1.	
А	liene	

Immigration and deportation — Alien suspected of terrorist activity — Whether subject to deportation — Whether liable to detention if deportation not practicable — Discrimination — Objective differences between aliens and nationals — Whether justifying differences in treatment — Customary international law regarding detention of aliens in time of war and national emergency — England, Special Immigration Appeals Commission and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

A, X and Y and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

Arbitration

Admissibility of claims — Ancillary and additional claims — NAFTA Article 1102 — NAFTA Article 1120(2) — Article 48 of the Additional Facility Arbitration Rules — Omission to rely on claim in notice of arbitration — Claims pre-dating NAFTA's entry into force — Course of action continuing after NAFTA's entry into force — Interpretation and correction of award — Interpretation and supplementary decision — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB (AF)/99/1)

Challenge — Arbitration tribunal constituted under North American Free Trade Agreement ("NAFTA"), Chapter 11 — Arbitral award — Mexico applying to set aside arbitral award — Proceedings in Canadian courts — Canada, Ontario Superior Court of Justice

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa

Challenge to award — Arbitration tribunal constituted under North American Free Trade Agreement ("NAFTA"), Chapter 11 — UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules — Arbitral awards in *SD Myers Inc.* v. *Government of Canada* — First Partial Award on Liability — Second Partial Award on Damages —

585

Page

536

1



XX

DIGEST OF CASES

Arbitration (cont.)

Final Award on Costs — Canada liable for breach of NAFTA obligations — Respondent awarded damages and costs — Canada applying to set aside NAFTA Chapter 11 arbitration awards — Canada, Federal Court

Attorney-General of Canada v. SD Myers Inc.; United Mexican States (Intervener)

553

Disclosure of confidential information — Adverse inference from failure to provide information — Article 34 of UNCITRAL Model Law — NAFTA Article 2105 — Canada, Ontario Superior Court of Justice

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa

536

North American Free Trade Agreement ("NAFTA"), Chapter 11 — UNCITRAL arbitration — Award on Merits of Phase 2 — Tribunal finding Canada in breach of Article 1105 — Canada liable to Investor for resultant damages — Effect of NAFTA Free Trade Commission's interpretation of Article 1105 — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada

127

North American Free Trade Agreement ("NAFTA"), Chapter 11 — UNCITRAL arbitration — Investor commencing arbitration proceedings under NAFTA, Chapter 11 — Whether Canada violating Articles 1102, 1105, 1106 and 1110 of NAFTA — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada

161

1

Claims

Nationality of claims — Standing — Nationality and permanent residence — Definition of nationals — NAFTA Article 201 — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB (AF)/99/1)

Procedure — Time limits — Meaning of "making a claim" — NAFTA Article 1117 — Receipt of claim by ICSID Secretary-General — Suspension of period of limitation — "Discouraging" a claim not a factor in suspension of period of



DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

limitation — Extension of time limits by estoppel — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1)

1

Comity

International cooperation — Duty to cooperate to prevent pollution of marine environment — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982, Part XII — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

Case Concerning Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor (Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures)

487

Consular Relations

Protection of nationals — Applicable law — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963 — Whether superseding bilateral convention between United Kingdom and United States of America — Right of consular access — Whether United Kingdom entitled to consular access to British citizen detained by United States authorities at Guantanamo Bay — Right to legal representation — England, Court of Appeal

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for the Home Department

685

Damages

Appropriate primary measure of compensation — Scope of recovery — Review of principles concerning assessment of compensation — Appreciation of evidence — Interpretation of applicable law — Quantification of compensation — Value of lost and delayed net income streams — Methodology of quantification — Interest — Costs — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada

161

Whether Investor entitled to damages under Article 1105 — Heads of damages — Whether recoverable — Final award on



xxii

DIGEST OF CASES

Damages (cont.)

costs — Articles 38 and 40 of the UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada

127

Economics, Trade and Finance

Investment protection — Denial of justice — Access to domestic courts — NAFTA Article 1110 — National treatment — Non-discrimination — NAFTA Article 1102 — Like circumstances — Less favourable treatment of foreign investors — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1)

1

Investment protection — NAFTA Chapter 11 — National treatment — Non-discrimination — NAFTA Article 1102 — Less favourable treatment of foreign investors — Canada, Ontario Superior Court of Justice

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa

536

Environment

Marine environment — Preservation of marine and coastal environment — Maritime access to coastline — Effect of land reclamation works on marine environment — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

Case Concerning Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor (Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures)

487

Expropriation

NAFTA Article 1110 — Expropriation through taxation — Tax rebates for export of cigarettes — "Creeping" expropriation — Governmental regulatory activities — Expropriation and regulation — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No ARB(AF)/99/1)

1



DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

Human Rights

Right to liberty — Discrimination — Detention of aliens suspected of involvement in terrorism — Detention limited to persons who cannot be deported — Whether discriminatory — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 15(1) — Extent of right to derogate from Convention — Notice of derogation — Nature of public emergency threatening the life of the nation — Whether measures taken strictly required by the exigencies of the situation — Other human rights treaties — England, Special Immigration Appeals Commission and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

A, X and Y and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

585

Scope of application of human rights treaties — Whether obligations of State under human rights treaty confined to legal space of that State — Whether extending to detainees held by another State — Detainees' rights — Legal representation — Questioning of suspects — Whether a human right to diplomatic protection by State of nationality — England, Court of Appeal

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for the Home Department

685

International Tribunals

Applicable law — Permanent Court of Arbitration — Arbitration under Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic, 1992 ("OSPAR Convention") — Tribunal applying OSPAR Convention — Duty to apply other principles of international law but claim had to be based upon OSPAR — Permanent Court of Arbitration

Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the OSPAR Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Final Award)

334

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — Applicable law — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Relationship between International Tribunal and domestic courts and administration — Decision of the



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

International Tribunals (cont.)

International Tribunal under Article 292 — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The Volga (Russian Federation v. Australia) (Application for Prompt Release)

433

Jurisdiction — Admissibility — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS") — Annex VII tribunal — Scope of jurisdiction — Whether restricted to alleged violation of UNCLOS — Other international court seised of case — Whether tribunal should defer to other court — Suspension of proceedings — Whether precluding exercise of provisional measures jurisdiction — Permanent Court of Arbitration

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Orders Nos 3 and 4)

310

Provisional measures of protection — Criteria — Urgency — Need for measures to preserve rights of either party — Equality between parties — Prevention of serious harm to the marine environment — Permanent Court of Arbitration

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Orders Nos 3 and 4)

310

259

Provisional measures of protection — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — Applicable law — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS") — Ireland and United Kingdom both States Parties to UNCLOS — Request by Ireland for the establishment of an Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal — Request by Ireland for the indication of provisional measures under UNCLOS Article 290(5) pending constitution of Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures)

Provisional measures of protection — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS"), Article 290 — Requirements for order of provisional measures — Jurisdiction — UNCLOS Articles 283 and 288 — Obligation to exchange views regarding settlement of dispute by negotiation or other peaceful means —



DIGEST OF CASES

XXV

No precondition of exhaustion of diplomatic negotiations before dispute referred to Tribunal — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

Case Concerning Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor (Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures)

487

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

Application for judicial review of arbitral award — Annulment of award by national court — Article 34 of UNCITRAL Model Law — Jurisdiction to apply provisions not raised during arbitral proceedings — NAFTA Article 210 — Deference to arbitral award — International commercial arbitrators — Review of findings of fact — Article 34(2) and 34(3) of UNCITRAL Model Law — ICSID Article 53 — Breach of public policy — Article 34(2)(b)(ii) of UNCITRAL Model Law — Canada, Ontario Superior Court of Justice

United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa

536

Application for judicial review of NAFTA Chapter 11 arbitration awards — Court's jurisdiction for judicial review — Article 34 of Commercial Arbitration Code 1985 — Grounds for judicial review — Whether arbitral awards dealing with dispute not contemplated by NAFTA Chapter 11 — Whether arbitral awards exceeding scope of arbitration agreement in Part B of Chapter 11 — Whether arbitral awards contravening public policy of Canada — Principle of non-intervention in an arbitral award within jurisdiction of Tribunal — Canada, Federal Court

Attorney-General of Canada v. SD Myers Inc.; United Mexican States (Intervener)

Canadian municipal law — Judicial review of NAFTA award in Canadian courts — Canada making application to Federal Court of Canada — Canada seeking to set aside First Partial Award — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

SD Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada

161

553

In general — Whether rights arising between States on plane of international law enforceable in municipal courts — Treaties — Charter of the United Nations — Resolutions of United Nations



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law (cont.)

Security Council — Whether forming part of United Kingdom law — Justiciability — Whether courts of one State entitled to determine rights and obligations of another State under international agreements — Whether decisions regarding foreign policy subject to judicial review — England, High Court, Divisional Court

Regina (Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament) v. Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for Defence

727

In general — Whether rights arising between States on plane of international law enforceable in municipal courts — Treaties — Whether forming part of United Kingdom law — Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 1949 — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Consular conventions — Justiciability — Whether courts of one State entitled to determine rights and obligations of another State under international agreements — Whether decisions regarding foreign policy subject to judicial review — England, Court of Appeal

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for the Home Department

685

Treaties — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Human Rights Act 1998 — Whether right to derogate more limited under Act than under Convention — Customary law — Application by national courts — England, Special Immigration Appeals Commission and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

A, X and Y and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

585

Sea

Exclusive Economic Zone ("EEZ") — Arrest of vessel — UNCLOS Articles 73 and 292 — Procedure for ensuring prompt release of vessels and crew — International concern over illegal fishing in the Southern Oceans — Patagonian toothfish — Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources — Coastal State jurisdiction — Exercise of sovereign rights of coastal State — Volga flying flag of Russian Federation — Illegal fishing in EEZ of Australian Territory of Heard and McDonald



DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

Islands — Arrest of *Volga* outside EEZ — Seizure of vessel, equipment and fish — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The Volga (Russian Federation v. Australia) (Application for Prompt Release)

433

Marine environment — Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic, 1992 ("OSPAR Convention") — Obligations regarding exchange of information — Scope of obligation — Confidential information — Permanent Court of Arbitration

Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the OSPAR Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Final Award)

334

Marine environment — UNCLOS — Environmental effects of the MOX nuclear plant and of international movements of radioactive materials — Obligation to cooperate in taking measures to protect and preserve the Irish Sea — Precautionary principle — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures)

259

Marine environment — UNCLOS — Protection of marine environment — Use of provisional measures jurisdiction — Permanent Court of Arbitration

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Orders Nos 3 and 4)

310

Territorial sea — Provisional measures — Claim to territorial sea as basis for prescription of provisional measures — Insufficient basis for ordering provisional measures — Interests — Right to natural resources within territorial sea — Estuary — Semi-enclosed sea — Right to integrity of marine environment — Right to be consulted with respect to major land reclamation works — Possible impact on maritime transit rights — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

Case Concerning Land Reclamation by Singapore in and around the Straits of Johor (Malaysia v. Singapore) (Request for Provisional Measures)

487



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

Sea (cont.)

UNCLOS — Article 290(5) — Conditions to be satisfied for prescription of provisional measures under Article 290(5) — Whether prima facie basis for the jurisdiction of the Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal — Whether urgent necessity for prescription of provisional measures pending the constitution of Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal — Irreparable prejudice — Serious harm to the marine environment — Requirement of urgency not satisfied — Power of International Tribunal to prescribe provisional measures different in whole or in part to those requested — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures)

259

State Immunity

Jurisdictional immunity — Separate entity — State-owned airline — When entitled to immunity — Acts performed in response to governmental instruction — Whether commercial acts — Procedure — Issue of immunity tried as preliminary issue — Fraud — Perjured evidence tendered to Court at hearing on immunity — Decision on immunity based on incorrect findings of fact — Action to set aside — England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Commercial Court)

Kuwait Airways Corporation v. Iraqi Airways Co. ("Perjury Action")

758

Terrorism

Definition — Anti-terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001 — Terrorism as threat to international peace and security — Role of the courts in controlling executive and legislative action in the field of terrorism — England, Special Immigration Appeals Commission and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

A, X and Y and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

585

Treaties

Interpretation — North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 — Article 1105 — NAFTA Free Trade



DIGEST OF CASES

xxix

Commission issuing interpretation of Article 1105 — Commission's interpretation issued subsequent to Award on Merits of Phase 2 — Whether Commission's interpretation valid exercise of Commission's power — Whether binding on arbitration tribunal — Whether operating retroactively — Validity of arbitration tribunal's Award on Merits under Article 1105 — Whether tribunal's interpretation of Article 1105 compatible with Commission's interpretation — Nature and content of customary international law — Whether Canada violating Article 1105 — NAFTA Arbitration Tribunal

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada

127

Interpretation and application — North American Free Trade Agreement ("NAFTA") — Chapter 11 — Objectives of NAFTA — Purposive interpretation — Article 2.01 of NAFTA — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Article 31 — Principles of international law — Application of NAFTA — NAFTA Chapter 11 and Chapter 12 rights and obligations — Whether mutually exclusive — Canada, Federal Court

Attorney-General of Canada v. SD Myers Inc.; United Mexican States (Intervener)

553

Interpretation and application — Object and purpose of treaty — Context of provision — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Article 73(2) — Meaning of the expression "reasonable bond or other financial security" — Examination by the International Tribunal of level and elements of the bond set by Australia — Whether circumstances of seizure of vessel relevant to assessment of bond — Whether a "good behaviour bond" requiring use of vessel monitoring system ("VMS") reasonable — Whether additional non-financial conditions of bond reasonable — Assessment of gravity of alleged offences — Whether international concern over illegal fishing relevant to assessment of gravity and to level of bond — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The Volga (Russian Federation v. Australia) (Application for Prompt Release)

433

Interpretation and application — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 ("UNCLOS") — Compulsory procedures for settlement of disputes — UNCLOS Articles 281



XXX

DIGEST OF CASES

Treaties (cont.)

and 282 — Whether applicable — Relationship between Article 282 and compulsory dispute settlement procedures under other treaties — Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic, 1992 ("OSPAR Convention") — Treaty Establishing the European Atomic Energy Community, 1957 ("Euratom Treaty") — Treaty Establishing the European Community, 1957 ("EC Treaty") — Commencement of dispute settlement procedures under the OSPAR Convention not precluding resort to compulsory dispute settlement under UNCLOS — Provisions of other treaties not relevant to dispute concerning the interpretation and application of UNCLOS — UNCLOS Article 282 not applicable — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Request for Provisional Measures)

259

War and Armed Conflict

Prisoners of war — Terrorism — Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 1949 — Whether applicable to terrorist suspects detained by United States of America after capture in Afghanistan — England, Court of Appeal

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for the Home Department

685

Resort to force — Enforcement action — United Nations Security Council resolutions on Iraq — Resolutions 678 (1990), 687 (1991) and 1441 (2002) — Whether authorizing resort to force without a further decision of the Security Council — Whether question justiciable in a United Kingdom court — England, High Court, Divisional Court

Regina (Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament) v. Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Secretary of State for Defence

727



TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Multilateral treaties are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. References to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations and Sources printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Table of Treaties to Volumes 1-125.

1945	
June 26	Statute of the International Court of Justice (9 Hudson 510; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; USTS 993; 145 BFSP 832; 1 Peaslee 1322; 3 Bevans 1179; 1945 CanTS 7; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 215n; JOF 13 January 1946; 59 Stat 1031) Chapter II
	Art. 36(2)
	Art. 41
1947	
Oct. 30	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) (55 UNTS 194; 148 BFSP 759; Cmd 7258 and 8048; TIAS 1700; 61 Stat (5) A3 (6) 1365; 4 Bevans 639; ATS 23 (1948); 1947 CanTS 27; 8 SATS 5 (1949); 1 Vert A 11; 1 Peaslee 706; 2 IELR 729 (extracts)) Part II Art. III
1949	
Aug. 12	Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Geneva Convention III) (75 UNTS 135; 157 BFSP 284; UKTS 39 (1958); TIAS 3364; 6 UST 3316; Roberts and Guelff, Documents on the Laws of War, 3rd edn 243)

xxxi

1045



xxxii	TABLE OF TREATIES
1950 Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (213 UNTS 221; UKTS 71 (1953), Cmd 8969; 156 BFSP 915; ETS 5; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 24; 1 Peaslee 354; 2 Vert A 20; 1 HRR 65; JOF 4 May 1974; 1 EYB 316; 1974 RTAF 28) ¹ Art. 5(3)
Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Fourth Protocol (16 December 1963) (213 UNTS 328; ETS 46; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 54) 625 Art. 3 627
Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Seventh Protocol (22 November 1984) (ETS 117; 7 EHRR 1; 24 ILM (1985) 435; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 57)
1951 July 28	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees (Geneva Convention) (189 UNTS 150; UKTS 39 (1954), Cmd 9171; 158 BFSP 499; ATS 5 (1954); NZTS 2 (1961); JOF 29 October 1954; 3 Vert A 28; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 61) Chapter I Art. 1(F)
1952 May 10	International Convention relating to the Arrest of Sea-going Ships (Brussels Convention) (439 UNTS 193; UKTS 47 (1960), Cmnd 1128; 159 BFSP 368; 42 Vert A 583)476
1954 Sept. 28	Convention on Status of Stateless Persons (360 UNTS 130; 161 BFSP 372; UKTS 41 (1960), Cmnd 1098)

¹ See also European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950) as amended by Protocol 11, effective as of 1 November 1998, for cases subsequent to 1998 amendment.



	TABLE OF TREATIES XXX	iii
	Art. 9	
1957 Mar. 25	Treaty Establishing the European Atomic Energy Community (Euratom) (298 UNTS 167; UKTS 1 (1973), Cmnd 5179-II, 162; 163 BFSP 302; 5 EYB (1957) 455)	
Mar. 25	Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community (Treaty of Rome) (163 BFSP 206; 4 EYB (1956) 412; 298 UNTS 11; UKTS 15 (1979), Cmnd 7480; JOF 2 February 1958; 1958 RTAF 5; 12 Vert A 134) Art. 220	20
1958 Apr. 29	Geneva Convention on Fishing and Conservation of the Living Resources of the High Seas (559 UNTS 285; UKTS 39 (1966), Cmnd 3028; 17 UST 138; TIAS 5969; ATS 12 (1963); JOF 24 December 1970; 1970 RTAF 119; 52 AJIL (1958) 851; 53 ILS 213; 1 Churchill 353)	64
1963 Apr. 24	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (596 UNTS 261; UKTS 14 (1973), Cmnd 5219; 21 UST 77; 3 IndJIL 221; 57 AJIL (1963) 993; TIAS 6820; 1963 UNJYB 109; JOF 18 April 1971; 1971 RTAF 34; 40 Vert A 542) Art. 36	-6 30
1966 Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (UN Doc. A/Res. 2200 (XXI); UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; JOF 30 June 1981; 50 Vert A 683; 6 ILM (1967) 368; 1966 UNJYB 178; 1966 YBHR 442; 30 ZaöRV 365; Brownlie, Basic Documents in International Affairs, 3rd edn 270; 999 UNTS 171; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 94) Art. 3	-6 21 00



xxxiv	TABLE OF TREATIES
Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Optional Protocol (First) (UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; 6 ILM (1967) 383; 1966 UNJYB 193; Annex to UNGA Res. 2200 (XXI), Supp. 16, p. 49; 1966 YBHR 450; 8 Jo. ICJ 78; 30 ZaöRV 394; Brownlie, <i>Basic Documents in International Affairs</i> , 3rd edn 292; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 5th edn 107)
1969	
May 23	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (UKTS 58 (1980), Cmnd 7964; 1969 UNJYB 140; 63 AJIL (1969) 875; 8 ILM (1969) 679; 9 IndJIL 288; 29 ZaöRV 711; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 122) Art. 1(g) 402 Art. 26 243 Art. 31 363, 368-9, 373-4, 475, 572 Art. 31(3)(b) 368, 735 Art. 31(3)(c) 368, 398, 399, 401 Art. 32 139, 363-4 Art. 32(2)(b) 402, 471
Nov. 22	American Convention on Human Rights (PAULTS 36; 9 ILM (1970) 673; 65 AJIL (1971) 679; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 5th edn 141) Art. 7(5)
1972 Feb. 15	Convention for the Prevention of Marine Pollution by Dumping from Ships and Aircraft (Oslo Convention) (UKTS 119 (1975), Cmnd 6228; 932 UNTS 3 (1972); JOF 21 May 1974; 2 Ruster and Sima, <i>International Protection of the Environment</i> 530)
1974 June 4	Convention for the Prevention of Marine Pollution from Land-based Sources (Paris Convention) (13 ILM (1974) 352)
197 7 June 10	Libya–Tunisia, Special Agreement for the Submission of the Question of the Continental Shelf between the Two Countries to the International Court of Justice (ICJ Rep. (1982) 18; 67 <i>ILR</i> 4; 18 ILM (1979) 49) Art. 1
1980 May 20	Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources (UKTS 48 (1982), Cmnd 8714: TIAS 10240: 19



	TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxv
	ILM (1980) 841; 33 UST 3476)	464 464
1982 Dec. 10	Convention on the Law of the Sea (21 ILM (1982) 1261; Misc 11 (1983), 8941; 1833 UNTS 3 (1994); Brownlie, Basic Documents in International Affairs, 3rd edn 129) Part I, Introduction Art. 1(1)(4)	95-6
	Part II, Section 1 Art. 2	511
	Art. 15	
	Art. 56(1)(a)	462 .462
	Art. 73(2)	84-6 483
	Part VIII Art. 121(3) Part IX	
	Art. 122	326,
	Part XII	
	Art. 193	518
	Part XII, Section 2 Art. 197	7-18
	Part XII, Section 4 Art. 204	502 7-18
	497, Part XII, Section 5 Art. 207	511