

EUROPEAN AND US CONSTITUTIONALISM

European constitutionalism is not merely an intra-European phenomenon but it can also be compared to other major forms of constitutionalism. Over the past decade or so issues have emerged which seem to indicate that European constitutional theory and practice is becoming aware that it has developed certain rules and possesses certain characteristics which distinguish it from US constitutionalism and vice versa. This book explores whether such differences can be found in the five areas of 'freedom of speech', 'human dignity', 'duty to protect', 'adjudication' and 'democracy and international influences'. The authors of this book are constitutional scholars from Europe and the United States as well as from other constitutional states, such as Canada, Israel, Japan, Peru and South Africa.

GEORG NOLTE is Professor of Law at the University of Munich. From 1999 until 2004 he was Professor of Law at the University of Göttingen and in 2003–4 he was a Visiting Fellow at All Souls College, Oxford.



EUROPEAN AND US CONSTITUTIONALISM

Edited by GEORG NOLTE





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521854016

> > © Council of Europe 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85401-6 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-85401-6 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

| Preface | page | ix |
|-----------|------|-----------------|
| 1 10/1100 | puge | $\iota \Lambda$ |

PART I Introduction 1

1 European and US constitutionalism: comparing essential elements 3

GEORG NOLTE

PART II Freedom of speech 21

- 2 Freedom of speech in Europe 23
 ROGER ERRERA
- 3 Freedom of expression adjudication in Europe and the United States: a case study in comparative constitutional architecture 49

FREDERICK SCHAUER

Comment 70
LORRAINE WEINRIB

Comment 75

WINFRIED BRUGGER

v



> vi CONTENTS PART III Human dignity 83 The concept of human dignity in European and US constitutionalism 85 GIOVANNI BOGNETTI 5 'Human dignity' in Europe and the United States: the social foundations 108 IAMES O. WHITMAN Comment 125 EYAL BENVENISTI Comment 128 HUGH CORDER PART IV The protective function 135 The protective function of the state 6 137 DIETER GRIMM The protective function of the state in the United States 7 and Europe: the constitutional question 156 FRANK I. MICHELMAN Comment 181 HEIKE KRIEGER PART V Adjudication 195 Constitutional adjudication in Europe and the United States: paradoxes and contrasts 197 MICHEL ROSENFELD



CONTENTS vii

Comment 239

JEFFREY JOWELL

Comment 249

LÁSZLÓ SÓLYOM

Comment 255

CÉSAR LANDA

PART VI Democracy and international influences 261

9 Democracy and international influences 263

LECH GARLICKI

10 The two world orders 280

JED RUBENFELD

Comment 297

ARMIN VON BOGDANDY

Comment 301

YASUAKI ONUMA

Index 305



PREFACE

This book is the fruit of an intense collaboration between the European Commission for Democracy through Law (the 'Venice Commission') and academia. The Venice Commission is the Council of Europe's advisory body on constitutional matters. Established in 1990, the Commission has played a leading role in the adoption of constitutions that conform to the standards of Europe's constitutional heritage. It contributes to the dissemination of the European constitutional heritage while continuing to provide 'constitutional first-aid' to individual states. The Venice Commission also plays a role in crisis management and conflict prevention through constitution building and advice.

The Venice Commission is composed of independent experts. The members are senior academics, particularly in the fields of constitutional or international law, supreme or constitutional court judges or members of national parliaments. Acting on the Commission in their individual capacity, the members are appointed for four years by the participating countries. All Council of Europe member states are members of the Venice Commission; in addition, Kyrgyzstan joined the commission in 2004. Argentina, Canada, the Holy See, Israel, Japan, Kazakhstan, the Republic of Korea, Mexico, the United States and Uruguay are observers. South Africa has a special cooperation status similar to that of the observers. The European Commission and OSCE/ODIHR participate in the plenary sessions of the Commission.

The work of the European Commission for Democracy through Law aims at upholding the three underlying principles of Europe's constitutional heritage: democracy, human rights and the rule of law which represent the cornerstones of the Council of Europe. Accordingly, the Commission works in the four key areas of constitutional assistance, elections and referendums, cooperation with constitutional courts, and transnational studies, reports and seminars.

In May 2003, the Commission organized a seminar in Göttingen, Germany, on 'European and American Constitutionalism'. This seminar



X PREFACE

was held in collaboration with the Institute of International Law, University of Göttingen, and Yale Law School. In addition to the Council of Europe, the Volkswagen Foundation provided generous funding. After the conference all speakers revised and completed their papers in the light of the discussions in Göttingen.

Many people deserve to be thanked for their contributions. Apart from the authors, these are Professors Jeffrey Jowell, University College London, and Jed Rubenfeld, Yale Law School, for their support during the preparatory phase of the conference; Ms Caroline Martin and Ms Caroline Godard from the Council of Europe for all their organisational work; Ms Anna-Jule Arnhold, Mr Helmut Aust, Ms Nina Naske, and Mr Florian Prill, all University of Göttingen, for patiently and diligently checking the footnotes and putting them into the correct format; Ms Roslyn Fuller, University of Göttingen, for enthusiastically and professionally dealing with all the language aspects of the text; and, finally, as ever, Ms Christiane Becker, University of Göttingen, for being the friendly, competent and determined manager of the whole enterprise.

Georg Nolte