

#### EXPLORING TORT LAW

Tort law provides individuals or groups redress for wrongful harm to every dimension of life from physical injury to property damage to personal insult. Over past decades no body of law within the civil justice system has experienced greater ferment than the law of torts. This edited collection comprises new scholarship from many of today's most influential contributors to the evolving law of torts. Topics include provocative analyses of original tort-type norms; punitive damages, proportional liability; the political-legal dynamics of the Restatement process; landmark modern torts decisions; the future of collateral source rules relative to various types of insurance; the role of risk information in assignment of seller liability; privity and freedom of contract; the vitality of negligence and duty rules, and optimal rules for vicarious liability. The collection closes with chapters from civil code nation authorities on the European view of causation in toxic harm suits and on collective rights and actions in South America and in Europe.

M. Stuart Madden is Distinguished Professor of Law at Pace University School of Law. His primary teaching and scholarly interests are in the areas of torts, environmental torts, and products liability. He is an elected member of the American Law Institute and serves on various policy advisory groups and scholarly advisory boards. He has lectured internationally on tort and accident prevention subjects and has given testimony before both Houses of Congress on tort reform issues.



# **EXPLORING TORT LAW**

Edited by

M. Stuart Madden

Distinguished Professor of Law Pace University School of Law





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521851367

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Exploring tort law / edited by M. Stuart Madden. p. cm.

ISBN 0-521-85136-x (hardcover) – ISBN 0-521-61680-8 (pbk.) 1. Torts – United States. 2. Torts. I. Madden, M. Stuart, 1948– II. Title.

> KF1250.A2.E97 2005 346.7303 – dc22 2005004259

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85136-7 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-85136-x hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-61680-5 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-61680-8 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my precious wife, Maria, with all of my love.



# **CONTENTS**

Contributors		page ix
Pre	eface	xi
INTRODUCTION M. Stuart Madden		1
	CTION I. TORT LAW IN THE NEW MILLENNIUM: PAST AS OLOGUE	
1	TORT LAW THROUGH TIME AND CULTURE: THEMES OF ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY  M. Stuart Madden	11
2	PAST AS PRELUDE: THE LEGACY OF FIVE LANDMARKS OF TWENTIETH-CENTURY INJURY LAW FOR THE FUTURE OF TORTS  Robert L. Rabin	52
	CTION II. COMPENSATION AND DETERRENCE IN THE DEERN WORLD	
3	TWENTY-FIRST-CENTURY INSURANCE AND LOSS DISTRIBUTION IN TORT LAW Kenneth S. Abraham	81
4	BEYOND MASTER—SERVANT: A CRITIQUE OF VICARIOUS LIABILITY Jennifer H. Arlen and W. Bentley MacLeod	111
SEC	CTION III. DUTY RULES, COURTS, AND TORTS	
5	THE DISINTEGRATION OF DUTY  Ernest J. Weinrib	143
	vii	



viii	Contents	
6	MANAGING THE NEGLIGENCE CONCEPT: RESPECT FOR THE RULE OF LAW James A. Henderson, Jr.	187
7	REBUILDING THE CITADEL: PRIVITY, CAUSATION, AND FREEDOM OF CONTRACT  Richard A. Epstein	228
8	CONTROLLING THE FUTURE OF THE COMMON LAW BY RESTATEMENT  Jane Stapleton	262
9	INFORMATION SHIELDS IN TORT LAW  David G. Owen	295
10	THE COMPLEXITY OF TORTS – THE CASE OF PUNITIVE DAMAGES  Guido Calabresi	333
11	THE FUTURE OF PROPORTIONAL LIABILITY: THE LESSONS OF TOXIC SUBSTANCES CAUSATION  Michael D. Green	352
SEC	TION IV. TORTS IN A SHRINKING WORLD	
12	CAUSATION IN PRODUCTS LIABILITY AND EXPOSURE TO TOXIC SUBSTANCES: A EUROPEAN VIEW Federico Stella	403
13	COLLECTIVE RIGHTS AND COLLECTIVE ACTIONS: EXAMPLES OF EUROPEAN AND LATIN AMERICAN CONTRIBUTIONS Juan Carlos Henao	426
Inde	ex	483



# **CONTRIBUTORS**

## Kenneth S. Abraham

Robert E. Scott Distinguished Professor of Law, University of Virginia School of Law

## Jennifer Arlen

Norma Z. Paige Professor of Law, NYU School of Law

## Guido Calabresi

Judge, United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit; Sterling Professor of Law Emeritus and Professorial Lecturer, Yale Law School

## Richard A. Epstein

James Parkar Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law, University of Chicago, The Law School

## Michael D. Green

Bess and Walter Williams Distinguished Chair in Law, Wake Forest University School of Law

#### **Juan Carlos Henao**

Permanent Professor, Universidad Externado de Colombia; Guest Professor, Universities of Paris 3 (Iheal), Cergy-Pontoise and Montpellier; Lecturer, Institut d'Etudes Politiques of Paris

## James A. Henderson, Jr.

Frank B. Ingersoll Professor, Cornell Law School

## W. Bentley MacLeod

Professor of Economics and Law, University of Southern California

#### M. Stuart Madden

Distinguished Professor of Law, Pace University School of Law

ix



x Contributors

#### David G. Owen

Carolina Distinguished Professor of Law, University of South Carolina

## Robert L. Rabin

A. Calder Mackay Professor, Stanford Law School

## Jane Stapleton

Ernest E. Smith Professor, University of Texas School of Law; Professor of Law, Research School of Social Sciences and the Australian National University, Canberra

## Federico Stella

Professor of Criminal Law, Universita' Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan

## Ernest J. Weinrib

University Professor and Cecil A. Wright Professor of Law, University of Toronto



## **PREFACE**

This collection originated in a colloquium held at Pace University School of Law in November 2003. The title of the colloquium and the title originally envisioned for this collection was The Future of Torts. The scholars invited to give papers at this gathering include many of the leading torts scholars in the United States, with contributions also from scholars from Australia, Canada, Colombia, and Italy. Each was asked to prepare a paper responding in some way to the question of what will be the future directions of tort law. All, with the exception of the University of Milan's Federico Stella, were able to present their papers at the School of Law, and the eleven invited papers, together with that of Prof. Stella, were each of the highest quality, innovative, and provocative.

However, by the time the participants completed their final papers some months later, two things had become clear. First, and a point mentioned by some early on, it is unlikely that any volume today could fulfill the promise entailed in a title The Future of Torts. Moreover, even if such an ambitious title could be validated by the work of some individual author or authors, no one could reasonably expect that a group of such highly individualistic scholars as convened here would cleave harmoniously to any single objective, even one so deceptively simple as that of viewing torts prospectively.

The inevitable and desirable result is that this collection of some of the finest torts scholarship that has found recent publication was renamed Exploring Torts, a title that more accurately represents the work product. The chapters, derived from the colloquium papers, emphasize a large proportion of the themes that engage the attention of persons pursuing the study and evaluation of modern tort themes.

EXPLORING TORTS is published with the expectation that it will find interested audiences among jurists, scholars, attorneys, and students, including students studying law, political science, and philosophy. With specific



xii Preface

reference to law students, the editor and the publisher believe that this volume might well suit upper-level torts, jurisprudence, or law and philosophy offerings.

Principally, however, we hope that you will find it stimulating and enjoyable to read the scholarship of many of the finest torts thinkers and writers of this era.

Appreciation is due several persons the help of whom has been instrumental to this project: Faculty Assistant Mary Stagliano, Kay Longworth and Carol DelBalzo of the School of Law staff, Marie Newman, Professor of Law and Librarian, and also Vickie Gannon, Circulation Librarian, Marilyn Belo, Maryam Afif and Michael Stalzer, my Research Assistants, and my wife, Maria Madden.

M. Stuart Madden White Plains, New York 2005