

LAND USE LAW FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

This book surveys the global experience to date in implementing land use policies that move us further along the sustainable development continuum. The international community has long recognized the need to ensure that ongoing and future development is conducted sustainably. While high-level commitments toward sustainable development such as those included in the Rio and Johannesburg Declarations are politically important, they are irrelevant if they are not translated into reality on the ground. This book includes chapters that discuss the challenges of implementing sustainable land use policies in different regions of the world, revealing problems that are common to all jurisdictions and highlighting others that are unique to particular regions. It also includes chapters documenting new approaches to sustainable land use, such as reforms to property rights regimes and environmental laws. Other chapters offer comparisons of approaches in different jurisdictions that can present insights that might not be apparent from a single-jurisdiction analysis.

Nathalie J. Chalifour is an assistant professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of Ottawa in Ontario, where her teaching and research interests fall in the areas of environmental law, property law, and international environmental law and policy. She holds a Doctorate of Law and a Master of Law from Stanford University, where she completed a research fellowship as a Fulbright Scholar. She has written numerous works in the field of environmental law and policy, including book chapters on environmental taxation and articles on the nexus between international trade rules and forest conservation. Professor Chalifour is contributing editor of the looseleaf service *The Canadian Brownfields Manual* (2005).

Patricia Kameri-Mbote is an associate professor of Law and Chair of the Department of Private Law, Faculty of Law at the University of Nairobi. She holds a Doctorate in Law and a Master of Law from Stanford University, a Master of Law in Law and Development from Warwick University, and a Postgraduate Diploma in Women's Law from the University of Zimbabwe. Her teaching and research interests fall in the areas of environmental law, law, science and technology, intellectual property rights, land law, and feminist jurisprudence. She has published widely in the areas of international environmental law, biotechnology, women's rights, and property rights.

Lin Heng Lye is an associate professor in the Faculty of Law at the National University of Singapore and Deputy Director of the Faculty's Asia-Pacific Centre for Environmental Law. She chairs the University's interdisciplinary Executive Committee for the Masters in Environmental Management program and is Visiting Associate Professor at the Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies. She holds Master's degrees in Law from Harvard University and the University of London and an LLB from the University of Singapore. She is an Advocate and Solicitor of the Supreme Court of Singapore and was Vice-Dean and Director of the Law Faculty's graduate programs. Her teaching and research interests lie in property law and environmental law.

John R. Nolon is a professor of Law at Pace University Law School. He received his JD degree from the University of Michigan Law School, where he was a member of the Barrister's Academic Honor Society. Professor Nolon has been appointed Visiting Professor of Environmental Law at the Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies and named Director of the Joint Center of Land Use Studies formed by Yale and Pace University Law School. He served on the Editorial Advisory Board of the National Housing and Development Reporter and is a member of the Editorial Board of The Land Use and Environmental Law Review. He has worked extensively on sustainable development in South America as a Fulbright scholar.



Land Use Law for Sustainable Development

Edited by

NATHALIE J. CHALIFOUR

University of Ottawa

PATRICIA KAMERI-MBOTE

University of Nairobi

LIN HENG LYE

National University of Singapore

JOHN R. NOLON

Pace University

with a Message from Kofi A. Annan, Secretary-General of the United Nations





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www. cambridge. org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521862165

© IUCN Academy of Environmental Law 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

ISBN-13 978-0-521-86216-5 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-86216-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Lis	t of Contributors	page ix
Message from Kofi A. Annan, Secretary-General, United Nations		xiii
For	eword by Charles Odidi Okidi and Nicholas Adams Robinson	XV
Ack	nowledgments	xix
Nat	roduction halie J. Chalifour, Patricia Kameri-Mbote, Lin Heng Lye, John R. Nolon, Charles Odidi Okidi	1
Imp	allenges of Environmental Law – Environmental Issues and Their plications to Jurisprudence o Morishima	6
	E. INTERNATIONAL ISSUES AND LEGAL RESPONSES TO STAINABLE LAND MANAGEMENT	
1	Is Conservation a Viable Land Usage? Issues Surrounding the Sale of Ivory by Southern African Countries Ed Couzens	27
2	Climate Change and Land Use in Africa David R. Hodas	45
3	Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation: Exploring the Role of Land Reforms in Africa H. W. O. Okoth-Ogendo	60
4	The Integration of Landscape into Land Use Planning Policy in Relation to the New European Landscape Convention Michel Prieur	71
5	EIA Legislation and the Importance of Transboundary Application Lana Roux and Willemien du Plessis	89
	O. NATIONAL APPROACHES TO LAND USE PLANNING FOR STAINABLE DEVELOPMENT	
Afri	ica	
6	Community Rights to Genetic Resources and Their Knowledge: African and Ethiopian Perspectives Mekete Bekele	111

٧



νi

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86216-5 - Land Use Law for Sustainable Development Edited by Nathalie J. Chalifour, Patricia Kameri-Mbote, Lin Heng Lye and John R. Nolon Frontmatter More information

> **CONTENTS** 7 Easements and Wildlife Conservation in Kenya 120 Nyokabi Gitahi 8 Land Tenure, Land Use, and Sustainability in Kenya: Toward Innovative Use of Property Rights in Wildlife Management 132 Patricia Kameri-Mbote The Development of Environmental Law and Its Impact on Sustainable Use of Wetlands in Uganda 161 Emmanuel Kasimbazi 10 EIA and the Four Ps: Some Observations from South Africa 181 Michael Kidd 11 From Bureaucracy-Controlled to Stakeholder-Driven Urban Planning and Management: Experiences and Challenges of Environmental Planning and Management in Tanzania 197 W. J. Kombe 12 Strategies for Integrated Environmental Governance in South Africa: Toward a More Sustainable Environmental Governance and Land Use Regime 219 Louis I. Kotzé 13 Environmental Law and Sustainable Land Use in Nigeria 240 Muhammed Tawfiq Ladan 14 The Role of Administrative Dispute Resolution Institutions and Processes in Sustainable Land Use Management: The Case of the National Environment Tribunal and the Public Complaints Committee of Kenya 253 Albert Mumma 15 Managing the Environmental Impact of Refugees in Kenya: The Role of National Accountability and Environmental Law 266 George Okoth-Obbo 16 Environmental Impact Assessment Law and Land Use: A Comparative Analysis of Recent Trends in the Nigerian and U.S. Oil and Gas Industry 281 Bibobra Bello Orubebe 17 Managing Land Use and Environmental Conflicts in Cameroon 304 Nchunu Sama Asia 18 Environmental Law Reform to Control Land Degradation in the People's Republic of China: A View of the Legal Framework of the PRC-GEF Partnership Program 315 Ian Hannam and Du Oun 19 Urbanization and Environmental Challenges in Pakistan 334 Parvez Hassan 20 ASEAN Heritage Parks and Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation 352 Kheng-Lian Koh 21 Land Use Planning, Environmental Management, and the Garden City as an Urban Development Approach in Singapore 374 Lin Heng Lye 22 The Law and Preparation of Environmental Management Plans for Sustainable Development in Thailand 397

Sunee Mallikamarl and Nuntapol Karnchanawat



CONTENTS		vii	
Nepal's Legal Initiatives on Land Use for Sustainable Development Amber Prasad Pant	417		
tralia			
Environmental Law and Irrigated Land in Australia Karen Bubna-Litic	433		
Environmental Impact Assessment: Addressing the Major Weaknesses Michael I. Jeffery	451		
n America			
Protection of Natural Spaces in Brazilian Environmental Law José Rubens Morato Leite, Heline Sivini Ferreira, and Patryck de Araújo Ayala	471		
Land Use Planning in Mexico: As Framed by Social Development and Environmental Policies Gabriella Pavon and Jose Juan Gonzalez	484		
Argentina's Constitution and General Environment Law as the Framework for Comprehensive Land Use Regulation Juan Rodrigo Walsh	503		
th America			
Ecological Economics, Sustainable Land Use, and Policy Choices Nathalie J. Chalifour	526		
The 2004 U.S. Ocean Report and Its Implications for Land Use Reform to Improve Ocean Water Quality Linda A. Malone	555		
Historical Overview of the American Land Use System: A Diagnostic Approach to Evaluating Governmental Land Use Control John R. Nolon	581		
? Y	611		
	Nepal's Legal Initiatives on Land Use for Sustainable Development Amber Prasad Pant tralia Environmental Law and Irrigated Land in Australia Karen Bubna-Litic Environmental Impact Assessment: Addressing the Major Weaknesses Michael I. Jeffery In America Protection of Natural Spaces in Brazilian Environmental Law José Rubens Morato Leite, Heline Sivini Ferreira, and Patryck de Araújo Ayala Land Use Planning in Mexico: As Framed by Social Development and Environmental Policies Gabriella Pavon and Jose Juan Gonzalez Argentina's Constitution and General Environment Law as the Framework for Comprehensive Land Use Regulation Juan Rodrigo Walsh th America Ecological Economics, Sustainable Land Use, and Policy Choices Nathalie J. Chalifour The 2004 U.S. Ocean Report and Its Implications for Land Use Reform to Improve Ocean Water Quality Linda A. Malone Historical Overview of the American Land Use System: A Diagnostic Approach to Evaluating Governmental Land Use Control	Nepal's Legal Initiatives on Land Use for Sustainable Development Amber Prasad Pant tralia Environmental Law and Irrigated Land in Australia Karen Bubna-Litic Environmental Impact Assessment: Addressing the Major Weaknesses Michael I. Jeffery In America Protection of Natural Spaces in Brazilian Environmental Law José Rubens Morato Leite, Heline Sivini Ferreira, and Patryck de Araújo Ayala Land Use Planning in Mexico: As Framed by Social Development and Environmental Policies Gabriella Pavon and Jose Juan Gonzalez Argentina's Constitution and General Environment Law as the Framework for Comprehensive Land Use Regulation Juan Rodrigo Walsh th America Ecological Economics, Sustainable Land Use, and Policy Choices Nathalie J. Chalifour The 2004 U.S. Ocean Report and Its Implications for Land Use Reform to Improve Ocean Water Quality Linda A. Malone Historical Overview of the American Land Use System: A Diagnostic Approach to Evaluating Governmental Land Use Control John R. Nolon	



Contributors

Patryck de Araújo Ayala Attorney of Mato Grosso State; Law PhD student, Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil

Mekete Bekele Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Addis Adaba University, Ethiopia

Karen Bubna-Litic Senior Lecturer in Law in the Faculty of Law at UTS, Australia

Nathalie J. Chalifour Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Ed Couzens Attorney, RSA, and Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban, South Africa

Heline Sivini Ferreira Law PhD student, Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil

Nyokabi Gitahi Legal Associate, African Wildlife Association, Kenya

Jose Juan Gonzalez President of the Mexican Institute for Environmental Law Research and Professor of Environmental Law at the Universidad Autonoma Metropolitana, Mexico

Ian Hannam Member, IUCN Commission on Environmental Law; Chair, IUCN CEL Specialist Working Goup on Sustainable Soil; Environmental Law and Policy Specialist, Asian Development Bank, Beijing, China

Parvez Hassan Senior Partner, Hassan & Hassan, Lahore, Pakistan, and President, Pakistan Environmental Law Association

David R. Hodas Professor of Law, Widener University School of Law, Wilmington, Delaware, USA

Michael I. Jeffery Professor of Law and Director, Centre for Environmental Law, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia; Deputy Chair of the IUCN Commission on Environmental Law

Patricia Kameri-Mbote Associate Professor and Chair, Department of Private Law, Faculty of Law, University of Nairobi, Kenya

Nuntapol Karnchanawat Thailand

Emmanuel Kasimbazi Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, Makerere University Uganda, and Partner, Kasimbazi & Co. Advocates, Uganda



X CONTRIBUTORS

Michael Kidd Professor of Law, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg, South Africa

Kheng-Lian Koh Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore; Director, Asia-Pacific Centre for Environmental Law; IUCN CEL Regional Vice Chair for South and East Asia

W. J. Kombe Professor of Urban Land Management and Planning at the University College of Land and Architectural Studies, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Louis J. Kotzé Faculty of Law, North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, South Africa

Muhammed Tawfiq Ladan Head, Department of Public Law, Faculty of Law, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Kaduna State, Nigeria

José Rubens Morato Leite Professor of the Undergraduate and Postgraduate Courses, Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil

Lin Heng Lye Associate Professor and Deputy Director, Asia-Pacific Centre for Environmental Law, Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore; and Visiting Associate Professor, Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, USA

Sunee Mallikamarl Professor of Law, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand

Linda A. Malone Marshall-Wythe Foundation Professor of Law, William and Mary Law School, Williamsburg, Virginia, USA

Akio Morishima Chair of the Board of Directors, Institute for Global Environmental Strategies, Japan

Albert Mumma Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya

John R. Nolon Professor of Law, Pace University School of Law, and Counsel to the Law School's Land Use Law Center; Visiting Professor, Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, USA

Charles Odidi Okidi University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya

George Okoth-Obbo United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) for Kenya, Nairobi, Kenya

H. W. O. Okoth-Ogendo Professor of Public Law, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya

Bibobra Bello Orubebe Faculty of Law, Delta State University Abraka, Nigeria

Amber Prasad Pant Professor of Law, Tribhuvan University, Faculty of Law, Nepal Law Campus, Kathmandu, Nepal

Gabriella Pavon L.L.M., Pace University School of Law, USA

Willemien du Plessis Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, North-West University, Potchefstroom, South Africa



CONTRIBUTORS xi

Michel Prieur Professor of Environmental Law, Limoges University, and President of the International Center of Comparative Environmental Law, France

Du Qun Professor, Research Institute of Environmental Law, Law School of Wuhan University, Wuhan City, Hubei Province, China; Member, IUCN Commission on Environmental Law; and Deputy Chair, IUCN CEL Specialist Working Group on Sustainable Soil

Lana Roux North-West University, Potchefstroom, South Africa

Nchunu Sama Executive Director of the Foundation for Environment and Development in Cameroon and Part-Time Lecturer in environmental law at the Regional College of Agriculture Bambili, Cameroon

Juan Rodrigo Walsh Senior Partner at Estudio Walsh, Consultares Ambientales, Buenos Aires, Argentina



UNITED NATIONS



NATIONS UNIES

THE SECRETARY-GENERAL

MESSAGE TO THE SECOND COLLOQUIUM OF THE IUCN ACADEMY OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW Nairobi, 4 October 2004

It gives me great pleasure to send my greetings to everyone who has gathered at the University of Nairobi for this timely colloquium of the IUCN Academy of Environmental Law on the theme of land use and environmental law.

Land use is at the heart of our hopes of achieving truly sustainable development. Yet in urban and rural areas alike, the pressures are immense.

According to the latest projections of UN-Habitat, the world's urban slums will double in population over the next 30 years, meaning that in just one generation, we could see 2 billion people living in conditions that deny their inhabitants the basic dignities of housing, health care, sanitation, education, transport, and employment. Already, nearly half the developing world's urban population lives in unplanned squatter settlements.

The challenges in rural areas are just as formidable. Deforestation and desertification are threatening ecosystems, biodiversity, and food security. Nearly 2 billion hectares of land are affected by human-induced degradation of soils, putting the livelihoods of nearly 1 billion people at risk. Safeguards must be put in place to ensure that intensification of agricultural production and increased use of agrochemicals, needed to satisfy the growing population in many developing countries, do not lead to further decline in environmental quality. Moreover, there is a need to regularize the tenure of the rural poor so they have the long-term security that comes with living on titled land.

Environmental law has a special role to play in addressing these issues. Law professors and legal experts can help national and local authorities devise legal regimes that enhance sustainable development instead of hindering it. You can help map out realistic and concrete land law reforms. You can share best practices and successful legal models. And through your teaching you can instill in new generations of legal practitioners an appreciation for the rule of law and its essential place in human affairs.

Both the Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro and the World Summit on Sustainable Development in Johannesburg recommended strengthening the law for environment and development. I would like to thank you for your support of this cause, and also for timing your meeting to coincide with this year's observance of World Habitat Day. Please accept my best wishes for a successful colloquium.

Kofi A. Annan

xiii



Foreword

Human settlements have been both the home and the hallmark of civilization since the first human beings congregated. This history of each part of the Earth is told through the cultural, economic, and social settings of cities, towns, and villages. City states continue to this day, and often the commercial and political life of large cities defines the policies of states. The world's cultural heritage is bound up in its human settlements. So, too, is the world's future.

In the latter years of the 20th century, the emergence of megacities signaled a reshaping of all aspects of both national life and international relations. There are models of planned urban growth, such as the brilliant development of the Pudong New Area in Shanghai, China, or the transformation of Singapore after the Second World War into a clean and green city, with extraordinary provisions guaranteeing the well-being of its citizens. These examples demonstrate that the environmental and social and economic pillars of sustainable development can be coordinated and advanced in tandem. Unfortunately, these examples are the exceptions. Many of the megaconurbations of millions of city inhabitants lack clean water, sewage systems, decent housing, educational opportunities, jobs, and parks and recreation. Despite major social and urban planning programs in cities across Brazil, favelas persist and grow in many states. Slums and shantytowns are a defining feature of major cities in many African, Asian, and South American nations.

Megaconurbations today produce air pollution, chronic health problems, water pollution, and a host of inevitable social problems. Their demand for electricity, food, potable water, and shelter extends deeply into the countryside. No city can be deemed self-sufficient, even if its local laws stop at its borders. Its economy imports most of what it needs to exist and is dependent on the effectiveness of laws in other localities that protect the watersheds that feed its water supply, or the farms that feeds its people, or the fuel that supplies its energy. Such urban centers export their chemical and hazardous wastes, their air pollutants, and their social problems far beyond their borders.

In a world of global trade, communications, and interdependent environmental needs, all regions have a shared stake in understanding how to guide land use and development so that it becomes sustainable. Yet, our regimes of nation states and intergovernmental relations mean that each stakeholder usually ignores the land use and environmental problems of other stakeholders. We live with a legal fiction that each nation must solve its own environmental degradation issues of its cities. Since land use laws are essentially national and local, and traditionally law has always been the principal instrument governing land use decisions, most legal scholarship about land use and



xvi FOREWORD

cities is national. Little attention is paid to instances where the legal infrastructure is overwhelmed by rapid migration into slums or the emergency of civil strife. Little comparative legal analysis exists to let governments in one nation learn from the successes of others.

Environmental law encompasses the law that governs the uses of land, water, soils, air, forests, and all the natural resources that urban settlements require. The contributors to this book examine legal issues that are common across all nations. They inaugurate here a comparative environmental law analysis of the law of land use for sustainable development.

This volume contains reflections from scholars representing the legal systems from all regions of the world. The authors gathered, along with many other environmental law scholars whose papers and contributions could not be published in this volume, at the University of Nairobi, in Kenya, for the Second Colloquium of the IUCN Academy of Environmental Law. Without prompting, these legal experts volunteered papers that cover land use comprehensively. Topics include land use planning, settlement, implications of climate change, and food security. Although addressing land use locally, clearly these titles indicate that this book provides what amounts to a careful scholarly analysis of issues central to planetary sustainability.

The chapters of this book, and the primary materials published in its companion volume, ably edited by John Nolon, provide guidance for attaining the Millennium Development Goals adopted by the United Nations. Its themes illuminate how states can use legal tools to help realize the Millennium Development Goals of poverty alleviation and environmental sustainability. The book at the same time contributes to the foundations of learning and education about the law of land use for sustainable development.

Kenya and Africa broadly know well the need to enhance land use planning as a foundation for economic, social, and environmental development. The University of Nairobi selected the theme for the Second Colloquium, and the Planning Committee reached out to scholars in each part of Africa and around the world to make the Colloquium a solid success. There are many who deserve thanks for making this book possible. We were honored that Wangari Maathai, as Assistant Minister of the Environment of Kenya, opened the Colloquium; by the final day of our deliberations, she had become the Nobel Peace Prize Laureate for that year. The UN-Habitat program and the United Nations Environment Programme were key sponsors, whose financial and expert support is much appreciated. The fine support and cooperation of the Government of Kenya included the Kenya Wildlife Services, National Environment Management Agency, and other offices. The Vice Chancellor of the University of Nairobi, the Principal of the College, and the environmental experts on the Faculty of Law were strong and steadfast supporters of the Colloquium during the two years of time that went into preparing it. Their contributions are gratefully acknowledged. The assistance of the African Wildlife Foundation and that of the International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN) Environmental Law Centre were essential to the success of the colloquium. Above all, thanks are due to the many individuals from Kenya on the University of Nairobi organizing committee and the host committee, including Dr. Patricia Kameri-Mbote. Space precludes commending the many additional contributions. Their support underpins this book, without which it would not be.



FOREWORD xvii

This book, then, is a forceful message to every level of readership in all regions of the world. Its publication underscores the credibility and growing legitimacy of the IUCN Academy of Environmental Law as a learned society, filling what has hitherto been a special gap, the absence of a global network of scholars engaged across all regions in the development of environmental law.

It has been a privilege to have cochaired the Second Colloquium of the IUCN Academy of Environmental Law on the Law of Land Use for Sustainable Development and to extend these heartfelt thanks to all involved.

Charles Odidi Okidi University of Nairobi Kenya

Nicholas Adams Robinson Chair, IUCN Academy of Environmental Law Pace University, New York



Acknowledgments

The editors would like to thank and acknowledge the help of the following people. Without their contributions, the conference and book would not have been possible.

- Professor Crispus Kiamba, then Vice Chancellor of the University of Nairobi, along with his deputies, Professor George Magoha and Professor J. T. Kaimenyi
- The Principal of the University of Nairobi, Professor Isaac Mbeche
- Professor James Odek, the Dean of the Faculty of Law, University of Nairobi, and Professor Dorothy McCormick, Director of IDS, University of Nairobi
- Academics from the University of Nairobi who loyally attended the colloquium with or without papers together with seventy academic colleagues and students who volunteered their time to ensure that the Colloquium succeeded
- Ms. Elizabeth Mbebe and Professors Mohamed Jama, Isaac Nyamongo, and Priscilla Kariuki, of the University of Nairobi, who headed planning and logistics
- Ms. Winni A. Mbeche and the Secretariat staff who took care of all the conference details with great diligence
- Katerina Sarafidou, CEL Liaison Office, IUCN Environmental Law Centre, Bonn, Germany
- Katrina Anders, Sean Bawden, Gilles Comeau, Celine Délorme, Dereck Eby, Jahmiah Ferdinand-Hernandez, Preet Gill, John Georgakopoulous, Martin Kreuser, and Yolanda Saito, all students at the Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, for their help with editing
- Susan Moritz, Research Consultant to the Land Use Law Center at Pace University School of Law, for her help in editing