

Salzburger

Studien

zum

Europäischen

Privatrecht

Band 34

Martin Lilja

Transfer of Movable Property under U.S. Law

Discussed from a Functional Perspective

Overview of contents

Preface	5
Overview of contents.....	7
Table of contents	9
I. Introduction	19
A. Coverage and approach.....	19
B. Purposes pursued with this study, including argumentation analysis.....	25
C. The model law concept of the U.C.C., its relation to other bodies of law, and the irrelevance of “title”	27
D. Development and revisions of the U.C.C.	31
E. The various Articles of the Code	33
II. Buyer's protection in the seller's insolvency.....	37
A. The state of Louisiana	37
B. All other states.....	39
III. Seller's protection in the buyer's insolvency	143
A. The state of Louisiana	143
B. All other states.....	145
IV. The conflict between a person with older rights and a buyer from a non-owner (good faith acquisition).....	203
A. The state of Louisiana	203
B. All other U.S. states	208
Table of cases	255
American cases.....	255
Foreign cases.....	267
Table of literature	269

Table of contents

Preface	5
Overview of contents.....	7
Table of contents	9
I. Introduction	19
A. Coverage and approach.....	19
B. Purposes pursued with this study, including argumentation analysis	25
C. The model law concept of the U.C.C., its relation to other bodies of law, and the irrelevance of “title”	27
D. Development and revisions of the U.C.C.	31
1. The Code’s historical predecessor: The Uniform Sales Act (U.S.A.)	31
2. Development and revisions of the U.C.C.	32
E. The various Articles of the Code	33
II. Buyer's protection in the seller's insolvency	37
A. The state of Louisiana	37
1. Buyer’s protection under the rules in Louisiana Civil Code	37
2. The buyer’s protection under other sources of law	38
B. All other states.....	39
1. An orientation into the rules	39
2. The buyer’s protection against the seller’s unsecured creditors (protection before delivery of the goods to the buyer)	42
2.1. <i>The buyer’s protection under sections 2-310, 2-507(1)</i> <i>and 2-511(1)</i>	42
2.2. <i>The buyer's right to adequate assurance under section 2-609</i> ...	44
2.3. <i>The buyer’s protection under section 2-502</i>	48
2.3.1. Introduction.....	48

2.3.2.	Requirements for a right to separate under 2-502 (1) U.C.C.	51
2.3.2.1.	<i>Goods must be identified according to 2-501</i>	51
2.3.2.2.	<i>Pre-payment of the price of the goods</i>	57
2.3.2.3.	<i>Tender of any unpaid portion of the contract price</i>	58
2.3.2.4.	<i>Alternative 1: Seller becomes insolvent within 10 days after receiving the first installment on the price</i>	59
2.3.2.5.	<i>Alternative 2: Goods bought for personal, family, or household purposes, and seller repudiates or fails to deliver</i>	60
2.3.3.	Effects under section 2-502 and relation to other rights.....	60
2.3.3.1.	<i>Effects of the buyer fulfilling the requirements of 2-501 and 2-502</i>	60
2.3.3.2.	<i>Buyer's right vis-à-vis third parties</i>	62
2.4.	<i>Buyer's protection in the seller's insolvency under 2-716(1): The concept of specific performance</i>	66
2.4.1.	Introduction.....	66
2.4.2.	The requirements of uniqueness or in other proper circumstances.....	67
2.4.3.	Specific performance in the seller's insolvency.....	70
2.4.3.1.	<i>Pre-Code law</i>	70
2.4.3.2.	<i>The law under the U.C.C.</i>	72
2.5.	<i>Buyer's protection in the seller's insolvency under 2-716(3): The concept of replevin</i>	74
2.5.1.	Introduction.....	74
2.5.2.	Alternative 1: The buyer's right to replevin when he or she is unable to effect cover.....	77
2.5.3.	Alternative 2: The buyer's right of replevin with the buyer's satisfaction of seller's security interest in goods which was reserved by the seller upon shipment.....	78
2.6.	<i>Limitations of the buyer's right under 2-502 and 2-716</i>	79
2.6.1.	Fraudulent retention of possession under state law.....	79

2.6.2.	Exceptions: Exclusion of fraud under the Code	81
2.6.3.	Fraudulent identification or delivery under the Code and other laws	84
2.6.3.1.	<i>Regarding voidable preference</i>	85
2.6.3.2.	<i>Regarding fraud</i>	86
2.6.4.	The effects of the rights under sections 2-502 and 2-716 in bankruptcy	87
2.6.4.1.	<i>The view that the buyer's rights under sections 2-502 and 2-716 are not enforceable in the seller's bankruptcy..</i>	87
2.6.4.2.	<i>Consequence of that view: buyer's right is subject to trustee's right to assume or reject executory contract</i>	89
2.6.4.3.	<i>The opposite view (2-502 and 2-716(1) and (3) provide effective protection in bankruptcy), and the effect of a mere "special property" interest under 2-501</i>	93
2.7.	<i>The buyer's protection under the Bankruptcy Code 507</i>	95
2.8.	<i>Protection of the buyer under section 2-401: Passing of title</i>	97
3.	The buyer's protection against the seller's unsecured creditors (protection of the buyer upon delivery) by acquiring title under section 2-401	97
3.1.	<i>Introduction</i>	97
3.2.	<i>Requirements of passing of title</i>	102
3.2.1.	The requirement of identification	102
3.2.2.	The seller has completed its performance with reference to the physical delivery of the goods	104
3.2.3.	The parties have agreed on the passing of title.....	105
3.3.	<i>The consequences of the buyer obtaining title</i>	106
3.4.	<i>When do matters concerning title become material?</i>	107
4.	The buyer's protection by acquisition free of existing security interest of the seller's creditors (protection before/after delivery of the goods to the buyer) under section 9-320(a)	110
4.1.	<i>Introduction</i>	110
4.2.	<i>The requirements for the buyer to fulfill</i>	111

4.2.1.	The buyer buys in good faith	111
4.2.2.	The buyer buys without knowledge that the sale violates the rights of secured creditors	113
4.2.3.	The buyer purchases goods in ordinary course from a person in the business of selling goods of that kind, other than a pawnbroker	115
4.2.4.	The buyer takes possession of the goods or has a right to recover the goods under Article 2.....	115
4.2.5.	The buyer does not acquire the goods in a transfer in bulk	115
4.2.6.	The buyer does not acquire goods as security for or in total or partial satisfaction of a money debt	116
5.	The buyer's protection by acquisition free of existing security interest of the seller's creditors (protection after delivery of the goods to the buyer)	117
5.1.	<i>Buyer's protection against seller's secured creditor where a consumer buys goods from another consumer – section 9-320(b)</i>	117
5.1.1.	Introduction.....	117
5.1.2.	The requirements for the buyer to fulfill	117
5.1.3.	The effect of fulfilling these requirements	119
5.2.	<i>Buyer's protection against the seller's creditors under 9-317(b): Acquisition free of security interest by taking delivery under certain requirements</i>	120
5.2.1.	Introduction.....	120
5.2.2.	The requirements for the buyer to fulfill	121
5.2.3.	Effect if the buyer fulfills these requirements	123
6.	The buyer's protection against seller's unsecured (and sometimes secured) creditors – after creating a security interest in the goods (protection before delivery of the goods to the buyer).....	124
6.1.	<i>Buyer's protection against the seller and the seller's unsecured creditors by acquiring a general security interest in the goods</i>	124

6.1.1.	Introduction.....	124
6.1.2.	The requirements for the buyer to fulfill – attachment of the security interest.....	126
6.1.2.1.	<i>Value has been given</i>	127
6.1.2.2.	<i>Debtor has rights in the collateral</i>	127
6.1.2.3.	<i>The debtor has authenticated a security agreement that provides a description of the collateral – or alternative conditions</i>	128
6.1.3.	The requirements for the buyer to fulfill – perfection of the security interest.....	131
6.1.4.	The effect of a perfected security interest	133
6.1.4.1.	<i>Assets to which the security interest extends</i>	133
6.1.4.2.	<i>Relation to third party rights which limit the security interest's effect</i>	134
6.1.4.3.	<i>Enforcement</i>	135
6.2.	<i>Buyer's protection in the seller's insolvency by creating a purchase money security interest</i>	135
6.2.1.	Introduction.....	135
6.2.2.	The requirements for obtaining a purchase money security interest.....	138
6.2.3.	The effect of obtaining a purchase money security interest.....	139
7.	The buyer's protection against seller's unsecured (and sometimes secured) creditors (protection after delivery of the goods to the buyer) on rightful rejection or justifiable revocation of acceptance (sections 2-711(3) and 9-110).....	140
7.1.	<i>Introduction</i>	140
7.2.	<i>The requirements for the buyer to fulfill in order to gain protection</i>	140
7.3.	<i>The effect of the buyer fulfilling the requirements</i>	141
III.	Seller's protection in the buyer's insolvency	143
A.	The state of Louisiana	143
1.	The seller's protection under the Civil Code.....	143

2.	The seller's protection under other sources of law	144
B.	All other states.....	145
1.	An orientation into the rules	145
2.	Seller's protection before delivery of the goods to the buyer ..	147
2.1.	<i>Seller's protection in sales where no specific agreement about payment exists, sections 2-310(a), 2-507(1) and 2-511(1)</i>	147
2.2.	<i>Seller's protection by shipment under reservation – sections 2-505 and 2-310(b)</i>	152
2.2.1.	Seller's protection under the procurement of a negotiable document.....	152
2.2.2.	Seller's protection under the procurement of a nonnegotiable document.....	153
2.2.3.	General rules applicable to both types of documents	153
2.3.	<i>Seller's right to adequate assurance of performance – section 2-609</i>	155
2.3.1.	The requirement of “reasonable grounds”	157
2.3.2.	The requirement of “adequate assurance”	160
2.4.	<i>Seller's protection by stoppage in transit – section 2-705</i>	161
2.4.1.	The right of stoppage in transit.....	161
2.4.2.	Until when can a right of stoppage be exercised?	163
2.4.3.	The exercising of the stoppage in transit and its effects... ..	168
2.5.	<i>Seller's protection by refusal to deliver when buyer is discovered to be insolvent before delivery: section 2-702(1) (and sections 2-703(a) and (f))</i>	172
3.	Seller's protection after delivery of the goods to the buyer	174
3.1.	<i>Seller's protection under a sale on approval – section 2-326.</i> ..	174
3.2.	<i>The seller's protection under consignment</i>	176
3.3.	<i>Seller's protection in cash sales – sections 2-507(2) and 2-511(3)</i>	177
3.4.	<i>The seller's right to reclaim goods delivered under U.C.C. 2-702(2) and Bankruptcy Code 546(c)</i>	180

3.4.1.	The requirements the seller has to fulfill under U.C.C. 2-702.....	180
3.4.2.	The seller's right vis-à-vis third parties and right in bankruptcy	183
3.4.3.	The seller's protection under Bankruptcy Code section 546(c).....	184
3.4.3.1.	<i>Changes of section 546(c) and effects thereof</i>	184
3.4.3.2.	<i>The requirements for protection in bankruptcy</i>	186
3.5.	<i>Seller's protection under a retention or reservation of title according to U.C.C. section 2-401</i>	187
3.6.	<i>The seller's protection by acquiring a purchase money security interest</i>	187
3.6.1.	The requirements to acquire a purchase money security interest.....	189
3.6.2.	Consolidation and refinancing.....	192
3.6.3.	Purchase-money secured creditors vs. other secured parties	193
3.7.	<i>The seller's protection after creating an ordinary security interest</i>	196
3.8.	<i>Seller's protection under Bankruptcy Code section 503</i>	197
IV.	The conflict between a person with older rights and a buyer from a non-owner (good faith acquisition)	203
A.	The state of Louisiana	203
1.	Goods lost or stolen	203
2.	Transfer under "vice" of consent.....	205
3.	The good faith requirement.....	207
B.	All other U.S. states	208
1.	An orientation into the rules	208
2.	The "traditional concept" of good faith purchase for value under the law of equity, still applicable under section 1-103 ...	209
2.1.	<i>Introduction</i>	209
2.2.	<i>The question of value</i>	212

2.3. <i>The question of good faith</i>	214
2.4. <i>Clarifications as to the “requirement” of acquiring title</i>	217
2.5. <i>The consequences of attaining, or not attaining, the status of a good faith purchaser for value</i>	218
2.6. <i>A third requirement to acquire the status of a good faith purchaser for value?</i>	219
3. The concept of good faith purchase for value under the U.C.C. section 2-403	223
3.1. <i>The main rule under section 2-403: nemo dat quod non habet</i>	223
3.2. <i>First exception: Good faith acquisition under the “voidable title rule”, section 2-403(1)</i>	224
3.2.1. Requirements relating to the transfer between the transferor and the transferee	225
3.2.2. Requirements regarding the transferee	226
3.2.3. The requirements regarding the good faith purchaser	227
3.3. <i>Specific situations where a transferee has the power to transfer a good title to a good faith purchaser</i>	229
3.3.1. The transferor was deceived as to the identity of the purchaser.....	229
3.3.2. Delivery was in exchange for a check which is later dishonored.....	230
3.3.3. It was agreed that the transaction was to be a “cash sale”	231
3.3.4. The delivery was procured through fraud punishable as larceny under the criminal law.....	231
3.4. <i>Second exception: Good faith acquisition under the “entrustment rule” and doctrine of “estoppel”</i>	232
3.4.1. General.....	232
3.4.2. Requirements for good faith acquisition	233
3.4.2.1. <i>A buyer in the ordinary course of business</i>	233
3.4.2.2. <i>Entrustment</i>	237
3.5. <i>Effects of a bona fide purchase under section 2-403</i>	238

4.	A look at other provisions in the U.C.C. governing the same conflict situation	240
4.1.	<i>Section 2-702(3)</i>	240
4.2.	<i>Section 2-706</i>	241
4.3.	<i>Section 9-617(b)</i>	242
5.	Section 550 of the Bankruptcy Code	243
5.1.	<i>First element: The transferee must have taken the property for value</i>	246
5.2.	<i>Second element: The transferee must have taken the property in good faith</i>	247
5.3.	<i>Third element: The transferee must have taken the debtor's property without knowledge of the voidability of the transfer avoided</i>	249
6.	Related issues: Statutes of limitations limiting the power of the owner to recover his or her goods	250
Table of cases	255
American cases	255
Foreign cases	267
Table of literature	269