

Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and  
National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

von  
Dr. Charity Wibabara

1. Auflage

Nomos Baden-Baden 2014

Verlag C.H. Beck im Internet:  
[www.beck.de](http://www.beck.de)  
ISBN 978 3 8487 1247 2

Wibabara • Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Schriften zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

13

Charity Wibabara

# Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft



Stämpfli Verlag



13



Nomos



Stämpfli Verlag

Schriften zum Internationalen und  
Europäischen Strafrecht

Edited by

Professor Dr. Martin Heger, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Professor Dr. Florian Jeßberger, Universität Hamburg

Professor Dr. Frank Neubacher, M.A., Universität zu Köln

Professor Dr. Helmut Satzger, LMU München

Professor Dr. Gerhard Werle, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Vol. 13

Charity Wibabara

## Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches  
to Genocide



**Nomos**



**Stämpfli Verlag**

This project was supported by the German Academic Exchange Service/  
Deutschen Akademischen Austauschdienst (DAAD).

**Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the  
Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data  
is available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Kapstadt (South Africa)/Berlin (Germany), South African-German Centre for  
Transnational Criminal Justice, Faculty of Law of the University of the Western Cape  
in cooperation with the Faculty of Law of Humboldt-University zu Berlin, Diss., 2013

ISBN: HB 978-3-8487-1247-2(Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden)  
978-3-7272-7744-3 (Stämpfli Verlag, Bern)

ePDF 978-3-8452-5360-2

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: HB 978-3-8487-1247-2

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Wibabara, Charity

Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and  
National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

Charity Wibabara

298 p.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-1247-2

1. Edition 2014

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2014. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, re-cording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the autor(s)/editor(s).

## Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	13
Abstract	17
Chapter One: General Introduction of the Study	19
A. Background of the Study	19
B. Statement of the Problem	21
C. Objectives of the Study	22
D. Significance of the Study	23
E. Methodological Approach	23
F. Scope of the Study	24
G. Definitions of Concepts used within the Chapters	25
Chapter Two: Historical Background to the Internecine Conflict in Rwanda	28
A. Introduction	28
B. Pre-Colonial Accounts of Rwandan History	29
I. Origin of the Twa, Hutu and Tutsi	29
II. The Relationship between Tutsi and Hutu	32
C. The Colonial Period	36
I. The German Colonial Rule	36
II. The Belgian Colonial Rule	39
III. The Fall of the Tutsi Monarchy	42
D. Post-Colonial Period	46
I. The First Republic	46
II. The Second Republic	48
E. Formation of the Rwandese Patriotic Front (RPF)	50
F. The Genocide Period	53

*Table of Contents*

Chapter Three: The Legacy of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	61
A. Introduction	61
B. Generalities about the Tribunal	63
I. Genesis of the ICTR	63
II. Legal Basis of the ICTR	64
III. Organization of the Tribunal	67
IV. Relationship between Rwanda and the Tribunal	68
C. Status of the ICTR Cases	74
D. Analysis of Important Jurisprudence before the ICTR	76
I. Prosecutor versus Akayesu	77
II. Prosecutor versus Kayishema	79
III. Prosecutor versus Kambanda	81
IV. Prosecutor versus Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze	83
V. Prosecutor versus Ntagerura, Bagambiki, and Imanishimwe	87
VI. Prosecutor versus Colonel Bagosora	89
VII. Prosecutor versus Nyiramasuhuko	91
E. Achievements of the Tribunal	93
I. Development of International Criminal Law	94
II. Accountability for Leaders	96
III. Creation of a Historical Record	98
F. Major Shortcomings of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	99
I. Delayed Justice	100
II. Location of the ICTR	102
III. Limited Impact on Rwanda	104
Chapter Four: Prosecution of Genocide in National Courts	107
A. Introduction	107
B. Generalities on Rwanda National Courts	108
I. Genesis of Genocide Prosecutions	108
II. Organisation of Ordinary Courts	109
III. Reparations	111
C. Status of Case Law within the Ordinary Court System	112

*Table of Contents*

D. Analysis of the National Court Case Law	114
I. Prosecutor versus Captain Twagiramungu	118
II. Prosecution versus Private Gataza	120
III. Prosecutor versus Corporal Gatorano	123
IV. Prosecutor versus Major Nyirahazimana and Pasteur Ngirinshuti	124
V. Prosecutor versus Harelimana <i>et al.</i>	127
VI. Prosecutor versus Nzirabatinyi	128
VII. Prosecutor versus Nzisabira	130
VIII. Prosecutor versus Pandasi, Bugeru and Nzajyibwami	132
IX. Prosecutor versus Rurangirwa, Bimenyimana, and Ntawangaheza	133
X. Prosecutor versus Sibomana	135
E. Achievements of National Court Trials	138
F. Major Shortcomings of Domestic Prosecutions	142
I. Congested Prisons and Insufficient Infrastructure	142
II. Violation of Fair Trial Rights	145
1. The Right to Speedy Trial	145
2. The Principle of Presumption of Innocence	146
3. The Right to Counsel of One's Choice	147
G. Excursus: Prosecution of Genocide Suspects by Third States	150
I. Extradition Matters	150
II. Third State Prosecutions: Case of Rwabukombe in Germany	154
Chapter Five: The Traditional Gacaca Court System	160
A. Introduction	160
B. Generalities on Grassroot Courts	161
I. The Evolution of Gacaca Courts	162
II. Traditional Roots of Gacaca	164
III. Legal Basis of Gacaca Courts	167
IV. A Standard Gacaca Trial	173
C. Status of Gacaca Case Law	175
D. Analysis of the Gacaca Case Law	176
1. Detailed Assessment of the above 16 Case Law	180



*Table of Contents*

E. The Nature of Gacaca Courts: Are they Retributive or Restorative?	191
I. Aims of Gacaca Courts	195
II. Sentences	196
III. Stakeholders	197
IV. Evaluation	198
F. Achievements of Gacaca Courts	199
I. Speedy Justice	199
II. Reconciliatory Mechanism	201
III. Affordable Justice	204
IV. Enhancement of Local Transitional Justice Approaches	204
G. Shortcomings of Gacaca Courts	205
I. Lack of Legal Representation	206
II. Absence of Reparations	207
III. Inadequate Protection of Witnesses	209
IV. Corruption within the System	210
V. Instability of Gacaca Laws	211
VI. Non-Prosecution of all Crimes	212
VII. Interim Remarks	214
Chapter Six: A Critical Analysis of the Relationship between the ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Courts	216
A. Introduction	216
B. Jurisdictional Relationship	217
C. Disparities among the Different Approaches	220
I. Right to Legal Counsel	222
II. Right to Silence	223
III. Right to be tried without Undue Delay	224
IV. Jurisdiction Disparities	226
V. Discrepancy in Sentences	228
VI. Unequal Detention Facilities	230
D. The Contribution of Different Trials to Reconciliation	232
I. Meaning of Reconciliation	233
II. The ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Contribution to Reconciliation	236
1. Official Acknowledgement of the Crimes	236
2. Individualization of Guilt	240

*Table of Contents*

3. Truth	244
a) Personal and Narrative Truth	245
b) Factual and Forensic Truth	247
III. Interim Conclusion	249
Chapter Seven: General Conclusions	252
A. General Conclusions	252
B. Overall Concluding Remarks and Optimal Approach	257
Bibliography	263