

# Multilevel Regulation against Trafficking in Human Beings

A Critical Application Analysis of International, European and German Approaches

Bearbeitet von  
Sarah Krieg

1. Auflage 2014. Buch. 402 S. Kartoniert  
ISBN 978 3 8487 1320 2  
Format (B x L): 15,3 x 22,6 cm  
Gewicht: 604 g

[Recht > Europarecht , Internationales Recht, Recht des Auslands > Internationales  
Recht > Völkerrecht](#)

schnell und portofrei erhältlich bei

  
DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

Die Online-Fachbuchhandlung [beck-shop.de](http://beck-shop.de) ist spezialisiert auf Fachbücher, insbesondere Recht, Steuern und Wirtschaft. Im Sortiment finden Sie alle Medien (Bücher, Zeitschriften, CDs, eBooks, etc.) aller Verlage. Ergänzt wird das Programm durch Services wie Neuerscheinungsdienst oder Zusammenstellungen von Büchern zu Sonderpreisen. Der Shop führt mehr als 8 Millionen Produkte.

Sarah Krieg

# Multilevel Regulation against Trafficking in Human Beings

A Critical Application Analysis of International, European and German Approaches



**Nomos**

Schriften zum Migrationsrecht

Herausgegeben von

Klaus Barwig, Akademie der Diözese Rottenburg-Stuttgart

Prof. Dr. Ulrike Davy, Universität Bielefeld

Prof. Dr. Andreas Fischer-Lescano, Universität Bremen

Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Kay Hailbronner, Universität Konstanz

Prof. Dr. Winfried Kluth, Universität Halle-Wittenberg

Band 16

Sarah Krieg

# Multilevel Regulation against Trafficking in Human Beings

A Critical Application Analysis of International,  
European and German Approaches



**Nomos**

**Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Berlin, Univ., Diss., 2013

ISBN: HB 978-3-8487-1320-2  
ePDF 978-3-8452-5414-2

#### **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: HB 978-3-8487-1320-2

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Krieg, Sarah

Multilevel Regulation against Trafficking in Human Beings

A Critical Application Analysis of International, European and German Approaches

Sarah Krieg

402 p.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-1320-2

1. Edition 2014

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2014. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, re-cording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the autor.

## Content

Abbreviations	13
Tables	15
A. Introduction	13
B. Reading Problem Representations in Law (Critical Application Analysis)	32
I. Critical Policy Analysis Approaches	33
1. Constructing Reality and Social Problems through Policy Formulations: Problem Representation and Framing	34
2. Reading Problem Representations	36
II. Reading Problem Representations in Law	38
1. The Power of Law	38
2. Reading Problem Representations in a Multilevel Context	42
3. Sensitising Questions: Prognosis and Diagnosis	48
4. Underlying Presuppositions and Gender Analysis	52
4.1 Law, Women, Sex and Gender	52
4.2 Preliminary Conclusions: Gender Analysis	60
5. 'Historical Constitution'	64
6. Preliminary Conclusions: Critical Application Analysis of Multilevel Regulation Against Trafficking in Human Beings	65
C. International Law of the United Nations	68
I. Historical Constitution	69
1. Early Anti-Slavery and Forced Labour Efforts	72
2. Initial Efforts for Women's Rights and Gender Equality	74
3. International Cooperation in Crime Prevention against Organized Crime	78
4. The UN Palermo Protocol in Historical Context	84
II. The UN Palermo Protocol	85
1. The Drafting Process	86
2. Subject Matter ( <i>What's the problem?</i> ): The New Exploitation Paradigm	90

Content

2.1 From Prostitution to Exploitation	93
2.2 Defining Prostitution and Sexual Exploitation	96
2.3 The Question of Consent	97
2.4 Other Forms of Exploitation: Forced Labour or Services, Slavery or Practices Similar to Slavery, Servitude and Removal of Organs	98
2.5 Special Link between Trafficking and Prostitution	101
2.6 Transnationality and Organized Crime Involvement	103
2.7 Preliminary Conclusions	104
3. Affected Subjects ( <i>For whom?</i> ): Victims versus Agents	105
3.1 UN High Commissioner for Human Rights' Principles and Guidelines	109
3.1.1 Recommended Principles	110
3.1.2 Recommended Guidelines	111
3.1.3 Preliminary Conclusions	113
3.2 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees	114
3.2.1 Persecution in the Home Country	114
3.2.2 Member of a Particular Social Group	115
3.3 Preliminary Conclusions	115
4. Summary: Problem Diagnosis in UN Palermo Protocol	118
5. Problem Prognosis in UN Palermo Protocol	119
5.1 Human Rights Provisions	119
5.2 Prevention, Cooperation and other Measures	122
5.3 Summary: Problem Prognosis	123
6. Preliminary Conclusions	124
III. The UNCTOC Approach: Anti-Slavery, Women's Rights and Organized Crime	127
1. Anti-Slavery and Forced Labour as a Concern	128
2. Women's and Human Rights Concerns	129
3. International Cooperation to Address Organized Crime	130
D. European Union and Communities	132
I. Historical Constitution	133
1. Cross-Border Cooperation in Justice and Home Affairs	135
2. The 'Fight Against Illegal Immigration'	137
3. Violence against Women, Women's Rights and Gender Equality	141
II. Contemporary Regulation and Programmes: An Overview	143
III. The EU FD 2002/629/JHA against Trafficking in Human Beings	144

1. Subject-matter ( <i>What's wrong?</i> ) and Affected Subjects ( <i>For whom?</i> ): Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual and Non-Sexual Exploitation	145
1.1 Organized Crime	146
1.2 From Trafficking in Women for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation to Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual and Labour Exploitation	147
1.3 Special Link between Trafficking in Human Beings and Prostitution	150
2. Cause of Concern ( <i>Why is it a problem?</i> ) and Attribution of Causation and Responsibility ( <i>Who/ What is responsible?</i> ): Relative Silence	151
3. Prescribed Action ( <i>What should be done?</i> ): Criminalization	151
4. Actor(s) ( <i>Who should do something?</i> ): Member States	152
5. Objective ( <i>What is the objective?</i> ): Fight and Prevent Trafficking in Human Beings and Foster Cooperation	152
6. Target and Beneficiaries	153
7. Preliminary Conclusions	154
7.1 Prostitution	155
7.2 Undocumented Work, Labour Standards and (Employment) Inequalities	157
7.3 Illegal Immigration as the Problem: Framework Decision versus Directive	159
7.4 Why EU Internal and External Action?	163
8. Summary	171
IV. The EU Directive 2011/36/EU on Trafficking in Human Beings	172
1. Subject-Matter ( <i>What's wrong?</i> ) and Affected Subjects ( <i>For whom?</i> ): Organized Crime, Victim's Rights, Migration and International Law	174
1.1 Organized Crime as the Problem	175
1.2 Infringement of Victim's Rights and Interests	177
1.3 Judicial Cooperation in Criminal Matters (Art 82, 83 TFEU) versus Immigration (Art 79 TFEU)	177
1.4 Keeping Pace with International Developments: The CoE Convention	178
1.5 Particularly Vulnerable Victims	180
2. Cause of Concern ( <i>Why is it a problem?</i> ): Human Rights, Rule of Law and Harmonization	182
3. Attribution of Causation and Responsibility ( <i>Who/ What is responsible?</i> ): The 18 'drivers'	183



Content

4. Prescribed Action ( <i>What should be done?</i> ) by Member States	184
5. (Operational) Objectives	186
6. Target and Beneficiaries	188
7. Preliminary Conclusions	189
7.1 The Attribution of Causation in the Impact Assessment's 18 'drivers'	190
7.2 Root Causes	191
7.2.1 Poverty, Migration and Development	193
7.2.2 Gender Equality in Countries of Origin	197
7.2.3 Criminalize Demand	202
7.3 Victims' Rights and Rising the Numbers of Reports, Investigations and Prosecutions	203
7.4 Particularly Vulnerable Victims	206
7.5 Why EU Internal and External Action?	208
8. Summary	210
V. The EU Directive 2004/81/EC on Short-Term Residence Permits	210
1. Subject-Matter ( <i>What is wrong?</i> ) and Affected Subjects ( <i>For whom?</i> ): Illegal Immigration	211
2. Cause of Concern ( <i>Why is it a problem?</i> ): Relative Silence	211
3. Attribution of Causation and Responsibilities ( <i>Who/ what is responsible for the problem?</i> ): Ineffective Prosecution	212
4. Prescribed Action and Actor(s) ( <i>What should be done? By whom?</i> ): Granting Residence Permits	214
5. Objective ( <i>What is the objective?</i> ): 'Combating Illegal Immigration'	215
6. Target and Beneficiary	217
7. Preliminary Conclusions: Trafficking, Smuggling and Illegal Immigration	218
7.1 Trafficking in Human Beings, Human Smuggling and Illegal Immigration	219
7.2 Who to Blame?	223
8. Summary	223
VI. The EU Approach: Between Criminal Law, Human Rights and Border Control	224
1. Law Enforcement versus Human Rights	224
2. Human Rights against Illegal Immigration	227
3. The EU Approach and Multi-Disciplinary Perspectives	228
4. Dimensions of Gender and Gender Equality	230
5. Summary	233

E. Germany	235
I. Historical Constitution of German Trafficking Offences	235
II. Human Trafficking for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation, § 232 StGB	241
1. Cause of Concern ( <i>Why is it a problem?</i> ): Protected Legal Interests and Concurrence of Offences	243
1.1 Sexual Offences	246
1.2 Offences against Personal Freedom	248
1.3 Immigration Offences	248
1.4 Personal Freedom, Sexual Self-Determination, Public Order, (Internal) Security and Morality	252
2. Subject Matter ( <i>What is wrong?</i> ): Definitional Elements	255
2.1 Exploiting Another Person's Predicament or Helplessness in a Foreign Country	255
2.2 Inducing Persons into Prostitution or Exploitative Sexual Activity	257
2.2.1 Element of 'Exploitation'	259
2.2.2 With or Without Consent	263
2.2.3 More Intense Forms of Prostitution	267
2.3 Inducing a Person under 21 Years of Age	268
2.4 Aggravated Trafficking, § 232(3) StGB	269
2.5 Aggravated Trafficking, § 232(4) StGB	271
2.6 Assisting in Human Trafficking, § 233a StGB	272
2.7 Preliminary Conclusions: Prostitution as the Problem?	274
3. Affected Subjects ( <i>For whom?</i> ): Gender and Nationality	276
3.1 Crime Statistics	276
3.2 The Term 'Victim' in the German Criminal Code: Gendered and Neutral Language	279
3.3 Human Trafficking vs Trafficking in Women	282
3.4 Where are the (Real) Victims?	285
3.5 Transnational Dimension	287
4. Attribution of Cause and Responsibility ( <i>Who/What is responsible?</i> ): Organized Crime and the Client	289
4.1 The Division of Labour in the Trafficking Chain	290
4.2 The Client	291
5. Prescribed Action and Actors ( <i>What should be done? By whom?</i> ): Punishment and Protection	293
5.1 Investigating and Punishing (Organised) Crime	293
5.1.1 Is Human Trafficking a 'Hidden Crime'?	293
5.1.2 Methods and Means of Investigation and Punishment	296

*Content*

5.2 Victim and Witness Protection	298
5.2.1 No Criminal Prosecution and Residency	299
5.2.2 Police Protection of Injured Persons and Witnesses	301
5.3 Procedural Rights and Protections	303
5.3.1 Legal Counsel Assisting Witnesses and Victims	303
5.3.2 Recorded Examinations and their Showing	304
5.3.3 Concealment and Non-Disclosure of the Victim's Identity	305
5.3.4 Proceedings In Camera and Other Measures to Limit the Right to be Present and to Inspect Files	306
5.4 Compensation	307
5.5 Further Rights Beyond Criminal Proceedings	309
6. Objective	310
7. Target and Beneficiaries	313
8. Preliminary Conclusions	313
III. The German Approach	315
1. Prostitution as the Problem or the Problem with Prostitution	316
1.1 Definitional and Regulatory Approaches to Prostitution	317
1.2 German Approach to Prostitution after the ProstG	318
2. Migration as the Problem or the Problem with Migration	323
3. The Silenced Problem of Gender and Gender Equality	324
4. The Term and Meaning of 'Human Trafficking' in Comparative Perspective	327
F. Conclusions	332
I. The UN, EU and German Approach in Context	333
1. The Nested Problem of Prostitution	333
2. The Nested Problem of Migration	336
2.1 Transnational Element	336
2.2 Human Trafficking vs Smuggling in Persons	338
2.3 The Border Control Imperative	340
3. The Crime Approach	341
II. Dimensions of Gender and Gender Equality	345
III. Multilevel Legal Interaction and the EU's Role In-Between	352
IV. Outlook: Connecting Needs and Accepting Vulnerability Beyond the Trafficking Threshold	355
List of Cases, Legislation and Documents	361
Bibliography	377