

Catherine M. Manley

# The Trademark Paradox

Trademarks and Their Conflicting Legal  
and Commercial Boundaries

20

**Schriften zum Medien-, Urheber-  
und Wirtschaftsrecht**

Hrsg. v. Georgios Gounalakis

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	13
0. Introduction .....	15
0.1 The Trademark Paradox.....	15
(a) The Problem: Where are we?.....	17
(b) The Reasons: How did we get here? .....	19
(c) The Consequences: Where are we headed? .....	21
(d) The Future: What alternatives do we have? .....	22
0.2 Scope & Overview.....	23
(a) Trademarks & Society .....	23
(b) Trademarks & Competition .....	23
(c) Conflicting Commercial & Legal Boundaries.....	24
(d) Striking a Balance .....	25
0.3 Sources, Citations & Legal Framework.....	25
(a) Sources & Citations.....	25
(b) U.S. Federal Laws, Courts & Precedence.....	27
(c) EU Treaties, Courts & Legislation .....	36
1. Trademarks & Business: The Protection of Brand Assets.....	47
1.1 Overview: Trademarks in Transition .....	47
1.2 Trademarks Today .....	47
(a) Competitive Business Assets .....	47
(b) Brand: <i>n.</i> A living business asset.....	49
(c) The iPad Trademark Saga in China .....	54
1.3 Historical Overview.....	57
(a) Practical Beginnings: Ownership, Origin & Quality.....	57
(b) The Trademark (R)Evolution: Goodwill & Advertising.....	59
(c) Modern Significance and Function .....	61
1.4 Chapter Observations.....	62
2. U.S. Trademark Protection:	
Common Law Roots & Commerce.....	63
2.1 Overview .....	63
2.2 Early Protection.....	65
(a) 1772–1825: Early Beginnings .....	65
(b) 1845–1860: New York State Trademark Statute.....	67

(c) 1870–1880: Federal Trademark Laws, Registration & Unconstitutionality .....	68
(d) United States Trademark Association (INTA) .....	71
(e) 1881–1920: New Federal Trademark Laws .....	71
(f) Concurrent International Developments: Paris Convention & Madrid Agreement .....	72
2.3 The Lanham Act and the Beginning of the Modern Phase .....	73
(a) The Lanham Trademark Act .....	73
(b) Trademark Trial and Appeal Board .....	74
(c) Modern Amendments: Enhanced Protection .....	75
(d) Further International Developments: TRIPS .....	78
2.4 Modern U.S. Trademark Law .....	80
(a) Scope & Duration of Protection .....	80
(b) Jurisdiction & Responsibilities .....	81
(c) Registration Application & Process .....	82
(d) Requirements for Protection .....	85
(e) Loss of Rights: Genericness .....	88
(f) Causes of Action .....	91
(g) Defenses .....	96
(h) Remedies .....	102
2.5 Chapter Observations .....	102
3. EU Trademark Protection: Tension Between Competing Interests .....	105
3.1 Early Beginnings .....	105
(a) France .....	106
(b) United Kingdom .....	106
(c) Austria .....	108
(d) Germany .....	108
(e) International Protection .....	111
3.2 National Rights v. EU Common Market Principles .....	113
(a) Territorial Protection .....	113
(b) Free Movement: The Problem with Trademarks .....	114
(c) TFEU: Protection of Intellectual Property Rights .....	114
(d) Case Law: Priority of Intellectual Property Rights .....	116
(e) Differing National Rights within the EU .....	118
(f) Balancing Act: Exhaustion of IP Rights .....	120
3.3 Modern EU Trademark Law .....	124
(a) Goals & Challenges .....	124
(b) Trademark Harmonization .....	124

(c) The Trademark Directive.....	128
(d) The Community Trade Mark Regulation.....	129
(e) Interaction with National Trademark Laws.....	130
(f) Scope of Protection .....	131
(g) Jurisdiction: National Courts, OHIM & EU Courts .....	135
(h) Categories of Protectable Subject Matter.....	138
(i) Infringement & Causes of Action.....	142
3.4 Chapter Observations.....	146
(a) From <i>Sirena</i> to <i>HAG II</i> .....	146
(b) The EU Perspective .....	148
(c) Differences between U.S. & EU Laws.....	149
4. Trademarks & Competition: Competition's Role in Resolving the Tension between Proprietary Rights & Market Competition.....	151
4.1 Chapter Overview.....	151
(a) Interim Summary.....	151
(b) Basic Considerations .....	152
4.2 Areas of Conflict Between Trademark Laws and Competition Principles .....	153
(a) Competition Law: Key Objectives .....	153
(b) Intellectual Property Rights: Key Objectives.....	154
(c) Legal Collision.....	154
(d) Anti-Competitive Behaviors .....	158
(e) Ongoing Efforts.....	161
(f) The Trouble with Trademarks .....	167
4.3 Chapter Observations.....	168
(a) Comparison of U.S. and EU Approaches.....	168
(b) Reconciliation Challenges .....	169
(c) Chapters 5 and 6.....	172
5. Application of U.S. Antitrust Laws to Intellectual Property Rights: Deference to Proprietary Rights.....	173
5.1 Legal Framework.....	173
(a) The Sherman Antitrust Act .....	173
(b) The Clayton & FTC Acts .....	175
(c) The <i>Per se</i> Rule vs. the <i>Rule of Reason</i> .....	177
5.2 Historical Overview.....	179
(a) Early Decisions: IP Rights Paramount .....	179

(b)	The <i>Nine No-No's</i> : Stringent Scrutiny – IP Rights Narrowly Construed.....	180
(c)	Modern Economic Focus: Encourage Innovation and Competition .....	181
(d)	1995 Guidelines: Three Principles.....	182
(e)	2000 Guidelines: Collaboration.....	184
(f)	Modern Application of the Guiding Principles.....	184
(g)	The Trademark Analysis.....	190
5.3	Chapter Observations.....	190
(a)	Goal of Antitrust: Enhancing Consumer Welfare .....	190
(b)	Application of U.S. Antitrust Laws to Intellectual Property Licenses.....	191
(c)	Conclusion: IP Rights Dominate .....	193
6.	Application of EU Principles to Intellectual Property Rights: Deference to Competition & The Internal Market .....	195
6.1	Historical Perspectives & Overview .....	195
(a)	A Two-Dimensional Challenge.....	195
(b)	EU Principles & Intellectual Property Rights .....	197
6.2	Articles 34-36 TFEU .....	199
(a)	Quantitative Restrictions .....	199
(b)	Principle 1: Existence v. Exercise of Intellectual Property Rights .....	200
(c)	Principle 2: Specific Subject Matter .....	203
(d)	Principle 3: Principle of Exhaustion.....	205
(e)	Application of Free Movement of Goods Rules to Trademarks.....	205
6.3	Articles 101 and 102 TFEU.....	206
(a)	Competition Law Framework & Enforcement .....	206
(b)	Authority to Enforce Competition Rules: Regulation No 1/2003 .....	207
(c)	Legislative Tools: Block Exemptions & Guidelines.....	211
(d)	Article 101 TFEU.....	215
(e)	Article 102 TFEU .....	217
6.4	EU Competition Rules Applicable to Trademarks .....	224
(a)	Application of Article 101 to Trademark Licensing.....	224
(b)	Application of Technology Transfer Block Exemption to Trademark Licensing .....	226

(c)	Application of Vertical Restraints Block Exemption to Trademark Licensing.....	229
(d)	Application of Article 102 to Trademark Ownership & Licensing.....	231
6.5	Chapter Observations.....	234
(a)	EU Principles & Goals: Competitive Market .....	234
(b)	Intellectual Property Rights: Additional Challenges.....	236
7.	Commercial Boundaries: Significance & Strategies.....	239
7.1	Interim Summary.....	239
(a)	Trademarks – Competition – Collision .....	239
(b)	Trademarks’ Commercial and Legal Boundaries .....	240
7.2	Intellectual Property Rights: Creativity v. Commerce .....	241
(a)	The Intellectual Property Umbrella.....	241
(b)	Foundations of Legal Protection & Historical Perspectives .....	242
(c)	Rationales for Protection .....	243
(d)	Scope of Rights & Protectable Subject Matter .....	247
(e)	<i>Existence</i> versus <i>Use</i> .....	251
7.3	Commercial Power: Predatory Practices (and the Rise of the Trademark Bully).....	252
(a)	Aggressive Policing and Over-Enforcement of Rights.....	253
(b)	Non-Meritorious Litigation.....	255
(c)	Aggressive Bullying Tactics <i>Outside</i> of the Courtroom .....	256
(d)	Trademark Turf Wars.....	258
(e)	Dilution Claims Run Amok.....	270
7.4	Chapter Observations.....	273
8.	Trademark’s Legal Boundaries: Conflict Between Private Rights & Public Interests.....	275
8.1	Interim Summary.....	275
(a)	Commercial Significance.....	275
(b)	Legal Failures.....	276
8.2	Expanding Legal Rights .....	276
(a)	Overview.....	276
(b)	Rationales for Protection .....	279
(c)	Protected Categories.....	282
(d)	Infringement Standards & Causes of Action .....	289
(e)	Priority of Rights.....	301

8.3	The Legal System's Failure to Establish Limits .....	303
	(a) Basic Observations.....	303
	(b) Protection of Trademarks as Property .....	303
	(c) Protection of Trademarks' "Commercial Magnetism" .....	305
	(d) Availability of Overlapping (and Supplementary) Protection .....	307
	(e) Lack of Guidance Under Competition Laws .....	310
	(f) No Measurable Tools to Gauge Market Power or Abuse .....	311
	(g) Lack of Applicable Remedies.....	319
8.4	Chapter Observations.....	319
	(a) Trademarks & Commerce.....	319
	(b) Trademarks & Competition .....	321
	(c) Chapter Summary.....	322
9.	Solutions: Striking a Balance.....	323
9.1	Interim Summary.....	323
	(a) Trademarks: "You've Come a Long Way, Baby" .....	323
	(b) The Competitive and Non-Competitive Effects of Trademarks .....	324
	(c) Private Rights v. Public Interests.....	327
	(d) The Trademark Paradox .....	328
	(e) Establishing a Balanced Trade-Off .....	331
9.2	Prune the Trademark Tree.....	333
	(a) Stop Analogizing: Let Trademarks be Trademarks .....	333
	(b) Prioritize Trademarks' "Information Role" .....	335
	(c) Reapply Unfair Competition Principles.....	336
	(d) Reign in Dilution: Apply Carefully (if at all).....	337
	(e) Implement a Meaningful Use Requirement .....	338
	(f) Balance Injury v. Harms .....	339
9.3	Practice Statutory & Regulatory Humility.....	340
	(a) Implementation of " <i>sui generis</i> " Laws: Be prudent.....	341
	(b) Reconsider Competition's Role.....	342
	(c) Proceedings: Act Timely .....	344
	(d) Articulate Confusion.....	345
	(e) Deter Meritless Litigation .....	348
	(f) Be Governed by <i>Sic Utere Tuo</i> .....	349
9.4	Chapter Observations.....	351
	(a) Intellectual Property Protection.....	351
	(b) Trademarks & the Global Economy.....	352
	(c) Fundamental Changes to Trademark Protection.....	354
	(d) Achieving Reasonable (and Effective) Competition.....	354

10. Summary in the Form of 10 Theses .....	357
Bibliography.....	361
Schedule 1 – 2014 Ranking of the Top 100 Brands.....	437
Schedule 2 – U.S. Circuit Court Map.....	442
Schedule 3 – Generic Trademarks.....	443
Schedule 4 – Treaty of Lisbon: New Terminology & Numbering.....	446
German Summary ( <i>Deutsche Zusammenfassung</i> ).....	449
1. Einführung in das Thema.....	449
1.1 Das Markenparadoxon .....	449
1.2 Das Problem: Wo stehen wir? .....	451
1.3 Die Gründe: Wie sind wir an diesem Punkt angelangt?.....	453
1.4 Die Folgen: Wohin bewegen wir uns?.....	455
2. Die Kapitel im Überblick .....	457
2.1 Kapitel 1–3: Marken und die Gesellschaft.....	457
2.2 Kapitel 4–6: Marken und Wettbewerb .....	459
2.3 Kapitel 7–8: Wirtschaftliche und rechtliche Grenzen von Marken und ihre Konflikte.....	462
2.4 Kapitel 9: Der richtige Mittelweg.....	464
3. Ergebnisse .....	464