

The Brussels I - Regulation (EC) No. 44/2001

The Heidelberg Report on the Application of Regulation Brussels I in 25 Member States (Study JLS/C4/2005/03)

von

Prof. Dr. Burkhard Hess, Prof. Dr. Thomas Pfeiffer, Peter Schlosser

2. Auflage

[The Brussels I - Regulation \(EC\) No. 44/2001 – Hess / Pfeiffer / Schlosser](#)

schnell und portofrei erhältlich bei beck-shop.de DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

Thematische Gliederung:

[Internationales Zivilverfahrensrecht](#)



Verlag C.H. Beck München 2008

Verlag C.H. Beck im Internet:

www.beck.de

ISBN 978 3 406 57842 7

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Preface | V |
| List of Contributors | XIII |
| Bibliography | XV |
| List of Abbreviations | XXIII |
| A. Summary | 1 |
| B. Introduction | 3 |
| I. Methodology, Scope and Aim of the Study | 3 |
| II. Outline of the Study | 4 |
| 1. The Different Parts | 4 |
| 2. The Comparative Research | 4 |
| C. Statistical Data on the Application of the Judgment Regulation in the Member States . | 11 |
| I. Availability of Statistical Data | 11 |
| II. Available Information on the Application of the Judgment Regulation | 11 |
| 1. The Application of the Jurisdictional Rules of the Judgment Regulation by National Courts | 11 |
| 2. Decisions on the enforceability of foreign judgments | 13 |
| D. Report on the Application of the Judgment Regulation in the Member States | 17 |
| I. The Judgment Regulation in the Present European Law | 17 |
| 1. The Judgment Regulation in the European Judicial Area | 17 |
| 2. New Instruments in European Procedural Law | 18 |
| 3. New Challenges for the Judgment Regulation in the European Judicial Area ... | 19 |
| II. Scope of Article 1 JR | 22 |
| 1. Civil and Commercial Matters | 22 |
| 2. Excluded Matters, Article 1 (2) JR | 24 |
| a) Family and Inheritance Matters | 25 |
| b) Insolvency Proceedings | 26 |
| c) Arbitration and Mediation | 31 |
| aa) The Comprehensive Exclusion of Arbitration, Article 1 (2) (d) JR | 31 |
| bb) Information Obtained from the National Reports | 32 |
| cc) Possible Ways Forward | 33 |
| dd) The Judgments Regulation and Mediation | 40 |
| 3. Relationship to Special Conventions, Article 71 JR | 41 |
| III. Jurisdiction | 43 |
| 1. General Issues | 43 |
| a) Overall Satisfaction | 43 |
| b) Sufficiency of the Fact-Specific Grounds for Jurisdiction | 44 |
| c) Applicability of national law under Article 4 (2) JR | 45 |
| aa) Discrimination of Non-Member State Parties | 45 |
| bb) Effect on EU claimants | 46 |
| d) Examination ex officio | 47 |
| aa) General Aspects | 47 |
| bb) Relation between Article 26 JR and Article 19 of the Service of Documents Regulation 1348/2000 | 48 |
| e) Infrastructural and organisational questions | 49 |
| aa) Time and Money | 49 |
| bb) Procedural Framework – Separate and Preliminary Determination of Jurisdiction | 49 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 2. | Specific Issues | 50 |
| a) | Domicile – Determination Pursuant to Articles 2, 59 JR | 50 |
| aa) | General Evaluation | 50 |
| bb) | Domicile of Companies | 52 |
| b) | Contractual Obligations. In particular: the Delineation from Matters relating to Torts and Quasi-Delicts | 53 |
| c) | In particular: The Place of Performance | 53 |
| aa) | General Aspects | 53 |
| bb) | Place of Performance under Article 5 (1) (b) – indent 1 JR | 54 |
| cc) | Place of Performance under Article 5 (1) (b) – indent 2 JR | 55 |
| d) | Matters relating to Torts and Quasi-Delicts | 56 |
| aa) | General Aspects | 56 |
| bb) | Multi-State Cases and the Shevill-Jurisdiction | 57 |
| e) | Jurisdiction in adhesion to criminal proceedings | 59 |
| f) | Co-defendants under Article 6 (1) JR | 60 |
| aa) | Article 6 (1) JR too wide? | 60 |
| bb) | Article 6 (1) JR too narrow? | 61 |
| g) | Inapplicability of Article 6 (2) and Article 11 JR in Austria, Germany and Hungary (Article 65 JR) | 62 |
| aa) | The Different Systems in the Member States | 62 |
| (1) | Third Party Proceedings under Article 6 (2) JR | 62 |
| (2) | Third Party Notice | 62 |
| (3) | Evaluation of the Different Models | 64 |
| bb) | Third Party Proceedings under the Judgment Regulation | 65 |
| (1) | The Legal Regime of Articles 6, 11 and 65 JR | 65 |
| (2) | Practical Impacts of Article 65 JR | 66 |
| cc) | Possible Improvements | 68 |
| h) | Maritime Matters | 70 |
| aa) | Introduction | 70 |
| bb) | Jurisdiction for General Limitation Proceedings | 71 |
| (1) | Jurisdiction for Setting up a Liability Fund | 71 |
| (2) | Limitation of Liability and Recognition of Foreign Judgments | 71 |
| (3) | Rules for Limitation Proceedings Ancillary to Individual Claims | 73 |
| cc) | The Remaining Issues | 74 |
| (1) | Bills of Lading | 74 |
| (2) | Provisional Seizure of Seagoing Vessels | 77 |
| (3) | Consolidation of Litigations | 78 |
| (4) | Actions based on Tort and Contract in particular | 78 |
| (5) | Collision, Salvage and General Average | 78 |
| (6) | Provisional and Protective Measures | 78 |
| (7) | Principal Place of Business of Ship Owners | 79 |
| (8) | Forum Arresti | 79 |
| i) | Insurance, Consumer and Employment Matters | 79 |
| aa) | Introduction | 79 |
| bb) | Section 3, Insurance Matters | 79 |
| cc) | Section 4, Consumer Protection | 80 |
| dd) | Section 5, Employment Matters | 85 |
| 3. | Exclusive Jurisdiction | 89 |
| a) | General Aspects | 89 |
| b) | Rights in Rem as to Immovable Property | 89 |
| aa) | Exclusive Jurisdiction | 89 |
| bb) | Holiday Homes | 90 |
| c) | Exclusive Jurisdiction over Company Matters (Article 22 (2) JR) | 90 |
| aa) | General Aspects | 90 |
| bb) | Definition of the Seat | 90 |
| 4. | Choice of Forum Agreements | 91 |
| a) | Law Applicable to a Choice of Forum Agreement | 91 |
| b) | Judicial Control of Standard Terms | 92 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| c) National Practice in Determining Usages of International Trade or Commerce under Article 23 (1) (c) JR | 93 |
| d) Applicability of Article 23 JR vis-à-vis Third States | 95 |
| e) Precedence of Article 27 JR over Exclusive Choice of Forum Agreements . | 95 |
| f) Hague Convention on Choice of Forum Agreements | 95 |
| aa) General Remarks | 95 |
| bb) Possible effect on Art. 23 JR | 96 |
| 5. Jurisdiction by Appearance (Article 24 JR) | 97 |
| 6. Summary of Questions of Jurisdiction | 98 |
| IV. Lis Pendens and Similar Proceedings | 100 |
| 1. The Framework of the Regulation | 100 |
| a) The Underlying Policy | 100 |
| b) Cornerstones in the Case Law of the ECJ | 101 |
| aa) The “same cause of action” under Article 27 JR | 101 |
| bb) The “same persons” under Article 27 JR | 101 |
| cc) Exclusion of Any Exceptions to the Priority under Article 27 JR | 102 |
| dd) Exclusion of Anti-suit Injunctions to Enforce Jurisdictional Rules by the Court Second Seized | 103 |
| ee) The Exercise of Discretion under Article 28 JR | 103 |
| 2. The Implementation in the Member States | 104 |
| a) “Proceedings” under Articles 27 and 28 JR | 104 |
| b) The “same cause of action” under Article 27 JR | 105 |
| c) The “same persons” under Article 27 JR | 107 |
| d) Exclusion of Any Exceptions to the Priority under Article 27 JR | 107 |
| aa) Tensions in the Implementation of the Member States | 108 |
| (1) Corporate Loan Litigations | 108 |
| (2) Patent Litigations | 109 |
| (3) Purely Domestic Litigations | 109 |
| bb) Legal Evaluation | 110 |
| cc) Policy Considerations | 112 |
| (1) Exclusive Choice-of-Court Agreements | 112 |
| (2) Other Grounds of Exclusive Jurisdiction | 116 |
| (3) General Public Policy Exception | 116 |
| (4) Limitation in Time of Priority | 116 |
| e) Exclusion of Anti-Suit Injunctions – Exclusion of Damages? | 117 |
| f) The Exercise of Discretion under Article 28 JR | 117 |
| g) The Interpretation of Article 30 JR | 120 |
| h) The Resolution of Negative Competence Conflicts | 122 |
| 3. Summary of Policy Considerations and Recommendations | 124 |
| V. Free Movement of Judgments | 126 |
| 1. Exequatur Proceedings | 126 |
| a) The Framework of the Regulation | 126 |
| b) The Implementation of the Judgment Regulation in the Member States ... | 128 |
| c) The Efficiency of Exequatur Proceedings | 130 |
| d) Possible Improvements | 135 |
| 2. Enforceable Decisions | 135 |
| a) The Concept of Article 32 JR | 135 |
| b) The Application of Article 32 JR in the Member States | 136 |
| 3. Reasons for Non-Recognition | 137 |
| a) The Concept of Articles 34 and 35 JR | 138 |
| b) Public Policy | 139 |
| c) Practical Problems with other Grounds for Non-Recognition | 146 |
| 4. Remedies (Articles 43 and 44 JR) | 147 |
| a) Appeal Procedures | 147 |
| b) The Admissibility of Defences against the Substantive Claim | 148 |
| c) Efficiency | 150 |
| d) Costs and Fees | 150 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 5. | Provisional Measures in Chapter III of the Judgment Regulation | 152 |
| a) | Protection of the Debtor, Articles 46 and 47 (3) JR | 152 |
| b) | Article 47 JR | 153 |
| 6. | Free Movement of Injunctions | 156 |
| 7. | The Cross-border Enforcement of Court Settlements and Notarial Deeds | 159 |
| a) | Court Settlements, Article 58 JR | 160 |
| b) | Authentic Instruments | 161 |
| 8. | Proposals for Further Improvements | 163 |
| a) | The First Alternative: Developing the Existing System | 163 |
| b) | The Second Proposal: Abolition of Exequatur Procedures | 165 |
| c) | Cross-border Injunctions | 167 |
| VI. | Provisional Measures | 167 |
| 1. | Introduction | 167 |
| 2. | Case Law | 167 |
| a) | The Case Law provided by the Court of Justice | 167 |
| b) | Case Law of National Courts (in alphabetical order) | 169 |
| aa) | Austria | 169 |
| bb) | Belgium | 169 |
| cc) | France | 170 |
| dd) | Germany | 170 |
| ee) | Greece | 171 |
| ff) | Ireland | 171 |
| gg) | Italy | 172 |
| hh) | The Netherlands | 172 |
| ii) | The United Kingdom (England and Wales) | 172 |
| 3. | Crucial Issues in the Context of Provisional Measures | 176 |
| a) | The Diversity of Provisional Measures provided for in Domestic Legislation | 176 |
| b) | International Jurisdiction for Provisional Measures | 177 |
| c) | Extraterritorial Effect of Measures (including Recognition and Enforcement abroad) | 180 |
| d) | Interaction of the Court seized or to be seized for the Substance of the Matter with the Court issuing Provisional Measures | 182 |
| e) | Anti-Suit Injunctions | 184 |
| f) | “Provisional” Measures given simultaneously- or even subsequent – to the Rendering of the Final Judgment. | 184 |
| g) | Measures for obtaining Information | 185 |
| h) | Does an Arbitration Agreement really have an Impact on the Courts’ Jurisdiction to Order Provisional or Protective Measures? | 187 |
| i) | Protective trans-border attachment of bank accounts | 187 |
| 4. | Policy Recommendations | 187 |
| VII. | Intellectual Property Rights | 189 |
| 1. | The Problem of Preventive Torpedo Actions | 190 |
| 2. | The Defence based on the Alleged Invalidity of a Patent the Issue of which is Claimed to be for the Exclusive Jurisdiction under Article 22 (4) JR | 193 |
| 3. | Consolidation of Proceedings against Several Alleged Infringers of Segments of a Munich Patent Bundle | 195 |
| 4. | Taking Point 4 (Enforcement of Cross-Border Interim Injunctions) and Point 5 (Efficient Provisional Relief to outweigh the Deficiencies of a Multitude of Litigation Proceedings?) together | 196 |
| a) | Interim Restraining Injunctions | 197 |
| b) | Provisional Damages | 199 |
| 5. | Measures for Obtaining Information | 199 |
| 6. | Concluding Recommendations | 201 |
| E. | Overview Policy Recommendations | 203 |
| I. | Function and Scope of Application | 203 |
| II. | Jurisdiction | 204 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| III. Lis Pendens | 205 |
| IV. Free Movement of Judgments | 207 |
| 1. The First Alternative: Evolving the Existent System | 208 |
| 2. The Second Proposal: Abolition of Exequatur Procedures | 209 |
| 3. Cross-border Injunctions | 210 |
| V. Provisional Measures | 210 |
| VI. Intellectual Property | 211 |
| Annex | 213 |
| I. Questionnaire No. 1: Collection of Statistical Data | 213 |
| II. Questionnaire No. 2: Collection of Empirical Data | 215 |
| III. Questionnaire No. 3: Legal Problem Analysis | 217 |
| Index | 225 |

