

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>page</i> xv
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	xviii
1 An overview of crimes under international law	1
1.1 Legal sources for definitions of crimes under international law	5
1.2 Structure of crimes under international law	9
2 Crimes against humanity	14
2.1 Evolution of crimes against humanity	18
2.1.1 Development through the Second World War	18
2.1.2 Post-Second World War development	22
2.1.3 Developments through the <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunals and beyond	26
2.2 Elements of crimes against humanity	31
2.2.1 Requirements unique to the <i>ad hoc</i> tribunals	32
2.2.1.1 ICTY: armed conflict as a jurisdictional requirement	32
2.2.1.2 ICTR: discriminatory basis as a jurisdictional requirement	33
2.2.2 General requirements	35
2.2.2.1 Preliminary question: whose conduct and mental state may satisfy the contextual general requirements?	35
2.2.2.2 The attack requirement	41
2.2.2.3 The targeting requirement	42
2.2.2.3.1 The definition of a ‘civilian’	43
2.2.2.3.2 The definition of a ‘civilian population’	49
2.2.2.3.3 The meaning of ‘directed against’	50

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

2.2.2.4	The ‘widespread or systematic’ requirement	51
2.2.2.5	The first contextual requirement: the underlying offence as part of the attack	53
2.2.2.6	The second contextual requirement: the knowledge that the offence is part of the attack	54
2.2.3	Underlying offences	56
2.2.3.1	Murder	57
2.2.3.2	Extermination	60
2.2.3.3	Enslavement	65
2.2.3.4	Deportation	68
2.2.3.4.1	The displacement of persons was caused by expulsion or other coercive acts	69
2.2.3.4.2	The persons displaced were lawfully present in the area	70
2.2.3.4.3	The displacement occurred without grounds permitted under international law	71
2.2.3.4.4	Is intent that the removal be permanent an element of forcible displacement?	72
2.2.3.4.5	Additional element for deportation	73
2.2.3.5	Imprisonment	75
2.2.3.6	Torture	78
2.2.3.6.1	The severity requirement	80
2.2.3.6.2	The prohibited purpose requirement	83
2.2.3.7	Rape	84
2.2.3.8	Persecution on political, racial, and religious grounds	88
2.2.3.8.1	Specific requirements for persecution as a crime against humanity	89
	The equal gravity requirement	90
	The requirement of discrimination ‘in fact’	91
	The discriminatory intent requirement	94

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		vii
2.2.3.8.2	Underlying offences qualifying as persecution as a crime against humanity	97
2.2.3.9	Other inhumane acts	99
2.2.3.9.1	Specific requirements for inhumane acts as crimes against humanity	99
	The suffering or attack on dignity requirement	100
	The similar gravity requirement	101
	The requirement of direct or indirect intent	102
2.2.3.9.2	Underlying offences qualifying as inhumane acts as crimes against humanity	102
2.3	Crimes against humanity in the International Criminal Court and Internationalised Tribunals	104
2.3.1	The International Criminal Court	104
2.3.1.1	The Rome Statute	104
2.3.1.2	The elements of crimes	110
2.3.2	The Internationalised Tribunals	115
2.3.2.1	Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL)	115
2.3.2.2	East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC)	120
2.3.2.3	The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC)	128
2.3.2.4	Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) (also known as the Iraqi High Tribunal (IHT))	132
3	Genocide	138
3.1	Evolution of genocide as an international crime	144
3.1.1	Development through the Second World War	144
3.1.2	Post-Second World War development	146
3.1.3	Developments in the <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunals and beyond	153
3.2	Elements of genocide	154
3.2.1	General requirements	156
3.2.1.1	Preliminary question: who must have the genocidal intent?	157
3.2.1.2	Genocidal intent	159
3.2.1.2.1	Specific intent	160
3.2.1.2.2	Material destruction	164

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
	3.2.1.2.3	Definitions of the protected group and the targeted group 168
	3.2.1.3	Requirement of actual membership in the group? 173
3.2.2		Underlying offences 176
	3.2.2.1	Killing 178
	3.2.2.1.1	Physical elements 178
	3.2.2.1.2	Mental element 178
	3.2.2.2	Causing serious bodily or mental harm 181
	3.2.2.2.1	Physical elements 181
	3.2.2.2.2	Mental element 183
	3.2.2.3	Deliberate infliction of eventually destructive conditions of life 183
	3.2.2.3.1	Examples of qualifying conduct 183
	3.2.2.3.2	Mental element? 186
	3.2.2.4	Prevention of births 186
	3.2.2.4.1	Examples of qualifying conduct 186
	3.2.2.4.2	Mental element? 187
	3.2.2.5	Forcible transfer of children 187
	3.2.2.5.1	Mental element? 188
3.3		Elements of conspiracy to commit genocide 188
3.4		Elements of direct and public incitement to commit genocide 191
3.5		Elements of attempt to commit genocide 197
3.6		Genocide in The International Criminal Court and Internationalised Tribunals 198
	3.6.1	The International Criminal Court 198
	3.6.1.1	The Rome Statute 198
	3.6.1.2	The Elements of Crimes 201
	3.6.2	The Internationalised Tribunals 206
	3.6.2.1	Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 206
	3.6.2.2	East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 206
	3.6.2.3	The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 207
	3.6.2.4	Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) (also known as the Iraqi High Tribunal (IHT)) 210
4		War crimes 213
	4.1	Evolution of war crimes 219
	4.1.1	Ancient to modern conceptions of war crimes 219

<i>Contents</i>		ix
4.1.2	The birth of modern international humanitarian law sanctioning war crimes	223
4.1.3	The distinction between international and non-international armed conflict in war crimes law	227
4.1.4	Contribution of the <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunals to the development of war crimes law	230
4.2	Elements of war crimes	232
4.2.1	General requirements for war crimes	232
4.2.1.1	Existence of an armed conflict	233
4.2.1.1.1	Is knowledge of the existence of the armed conflict an element of war crimes?	236
4.2.1.2	Nexus between the underlying offence and the armed conflict	239
4.2.1.3	Additional general requirements for grave breaches of the Geneva conventions: war crimes committed in international armed conflict	243
4.2.1.3.1	The requirement of an international armed conflict	244
	Knowledge of the nature of the armed conflict	248
4.2.1.3.2	The protected persons or property requirement	250
4.2.1.4	Additional general requirement for violations of Common Article 3 and Additional Protocol II under Article 4 of the ICTR Statute: war crimes committed in non-international armed conflict	256
4.2.1.5	Additional general requirements for violations of the laws or customs of war under Article 3 of the ICTY Statute: war crimes committed in any armed conflict	258
4.2.1.5.1	The alleged underlying offence infringes a rule of customary or conventional international humanitarian law	260
4.2.1.5.2	The violation is ‘serious’	262

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

Contents

4.2.1.5.3	The violation of the rule entails the individual criminal responsibility of the person breaching the rule	262
4.2.1.5.4	Knowledge of status of targets of underlying offences	263
4.2.2	Underlying offences	263
4.2.2.1	Destruction of property	264
4.2.2.1.1	Extensive destruction under Article 2(d) of ICTY Statute	264
4.2.2.1.2	Wanton destruction and unjustified devastation under Article 3(b) of the ICTY Statute	266
4.2.2.1.3	Destruction or wilful damage to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science under Article 3(d)	268
4.2.2.2	Hostage-taking	270
4.2.2.3	Inhuman treatment or cruel treatment	271
4.2.2.4	Murder or wilful killing	273
4.2.2.5	Outrages upon personal dignity	275
4.2.2.6	Plunder, pillage, or extensive appropriation	278
4.2.2.7	Rape	280
4.2.2.8	Slavery or unlawful labour	281
4.2.2.9	Terror	281
4.2.2.10	Torture	284
4.2.2.11	Unlawful attack on civilians and civilian objects	285
4.2.2.12	Unlawful confinement	287
4.2.2.13	Unlawful deportation or transfer	288
4.2.2.14	Violence to life and person	288
4.2.2.15	Wilfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health	290
4.2.2.16	Other underlying offences	290
4.3	War crimes in the International Criminal Court and Internationalised Tribunals	291
4.3.1	The International Criminal Court	291
4.3.1.1	The Rome Statute	291
4.3.1.2	The Elements of Crimes	297

<i>Contents</i>		xi
4.3.2	The Internationalised Tribunals	304
4.3.2.1	Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL)	304
4.3.2.2	East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC)	310
4.3.2.3	The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC)	312
4.3.2.4	Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) (also known as the Iraqi High Tribunal (IHT))	314
5	Cumulative convictions and sentencing	318
5.1	Cumulative and alternative charging	319
5.2	Cumulative convictions	324
5.2.1	Pre- <i>Čelebići</i> jurisprudence	324
5.2.2	The February 2001 <i>Čelebići</i> appeal judgement	326
5.2.3	Application of the <i>Čelebići</i> test to different statutory crimes ('inter-article' convictions)	331
5.2.4	Application of the <i>Čelebići</i> test to different underlying offences of the same statutory crime ('intra-article' convictions)	334
5.2.4.1	Intra-article convictions for crimes against humanity	335
5.2.4.2	Intra-article convictions for war crimes	348
5.2.4.3	Intra-article convictions for genocide	349
5.2.5	Effect of trial chamber error in failing to convict cumulatively when cumulative convictions are available	354
5.3	Sentencing	356
5.3.1	No coherent sentencing practice	359
5.3.2	No hierarchy of crimes	363
5.3.3	The Appeals Chamber's interference in sentence determination by trial chambers	367
6	Conclusion	370
6.1	The content and context of international crimes	371
6.1.1	Definitions of the crimes should not refer only to the accused or the physical perpetrator	372
6.1.2	The elements of the crimes and the elements of the forms of responsibility answer separate legal inquiries	373
6.1.3	Judgements should specify, in their dispositions, the precise conduct for which the accused has been convicted	374
6.2	The relative importance of the crimes in the different courts and tribunals	375

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii	<i>Contents</i>	
6.3	Variations in the definitions of crimes in the different courts and tribunals	379
6.4	The need for a more coherent conviction and sentencing practice	383
	<i>Annex: Elements of core international crimes and sample combinations with forms of responsibility</i>	387
1.	Common underlying offences	390
1.1	Arbitrary deprivation of liberty	390
1.2	Destruction of real or personal property	390
1.3	Forcible displacement	390
1.4	Murder	391
1.5	Rape	391
1.6	Torture	391
2.	Crimes against humanity	391
2.1	General requirements for crimes against humanity	391
2.2	Murder as a crime against humanity	392
2.3	Extermination as a crime against humanity	392
2.4	Enslavement as a crime against humanity	392
2.5	Deportation as a crime against humanity	393
2.6	Imprisonment as a crime against humanity	393
2.7	Torture as a crime against humanity	393
2.8	Rape as a crime against humanity	393
2.9	Persecution as a crime against humanity	394
2.10	Other inhumane acts as crimes against humanity	396
3.	Genocide and related crimes	397
3.1	General requirements for genocide	397
3.2	Genocide by killing	397
3.3	Genocide by causing serious bodily harm	397
3.4	Genocide by causing serious mental harm	398
3.5	Genocide by deliberate infliction of eventually destructive conditions of life	398
3.6	Genocide by prevention of births	398
3.7	Genocide by forcibly transferring children to another group	399
3.8	Conspiracy to commit genocide	399
3.9	Direct and public incitement to commit genocide	399
3.10	Attempt to commit genocide	399
4.	War crimes	399
4.1	General requirements for all war crimes	399
4.2	Additional general requirements for grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 1949	400

<i>Contents</i>		xiii
4.3	Additional general requirements for war crimes arising from breaches of Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions ('Common Article 3') or Additional Protocol II to the Geneva Conventions ('Additional Protocol II')	400
4.4	Additional general requirements for violations of the laws or customs of war under Article 3 of the ICTY Statute	400
4.5	'Extensive destruction of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly' as a grave breach	401
4.6	'Wanton destruction' of property as a violation of the laws or customs of war	401
4.7	'Unjustified devastation' of property as a violation of the laws or customs of war	402
4.8	'Destruction or wilful damage to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science' as a violation of the laws or customs of war	402
4.9	Hostage-taking as a grave breach	403
4.10	Hostage-taking as a violation of the laws or customs of war	403
4.11	Inhuman treatment as a grave breach	403
4.12	Cruel treatment as a violation of the laws or customs of war	404
4.13	Wilful killing as a grave breach	404
4.14	Murder as a violation of the laws or customs of war	404
4.15	Outrages upon personal dignity as a violation of Additional Protocol II / the laws or customs of war	405
4.16	'Extensive appropriation of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly' as a grave breach	405
4.17	Plunder as a violation of the laws or customs of war	406
4.18	Rape as a grave breach	406
4.19	Rape as a violation of the laws or customs of war	406
4.20	Slavery as a violation of the laws or customs of war	407
4.21	Unlawful labour as a violation of the laws or customs of war	407
4.22	Terror as a violation of the laws or customs of war	407
4.23	Torture as a grave breach	408
4.24	Torture as a violation of the laws or customs of war	408
4.25	Unlawful attack on civilians as a violation of the laws or customs of war	408

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87830-2 - Elements of Crimes under International Law

Gideon Boas, James L. Bischoff and Natalie L. Reid

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xiv

Contents

4.26	Unlawful attack on civilian objects as a violation of the laws or customs of war	409
4.27	Unlawful confinement of a civilian as a grave breach	409
4.28	Unlawful confinement as a violation of the laws or customs of war	409
4.29	Unlawful deportation or transfer as a grave breach	410
4.30	Wilfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health as a grave breach	410
5.	Sample combinations of elements of crimes and forms of responsibility	410
5.1	Torture as a crime against humanity	411
5.2	Murder as a form of persecution as a crime against humanity	415
5.3	Genocide by killing	421
5.4	Extensive destruction of property as a grave breach	424
5.5	Plunder as a violation of the laws or customs of war	429
	<i>Index</i>	435