

# Contents

<i>List of Contributors and Editors</i>	xv
---	----

Introduction	1
<i>Dominic McGoldrick and Peter Rowe</i>	

## Part I The Origins and Development of the Permanent International Criminal Court

1. Criminal Trials Before International Tribunals:	
Legality and Legitimacy	9
<i>Dominic McGoldrick</i>	
1. Introduction	9
2. National and International War Crimes Trials: An Overview	10
2.1 The Purposes of War Crimes Trials	10
2.2 National Trials	11
2.3 International Trials	13
3. Nuremberg, Tokyo, Yugoslavia, Rwanda:	
A Comparative Analysis	14
3.1 Nuremberg	14
3.2 Tokyo	20
3.3 The International Criminal Tribunal for Yugoslavia (ICTY)	22
3.4 Principal Legal Features	25
3.5 Problems of Implementation	28
3.6 Co-operation with the ICTY	32
3.7 Legality and Legitimacy	34
3.8 The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR)	36
4. The Permanent International Criminal Court (ICC)	40
4.1 Development	40
4.2 The Principal Legal Features of the ICC	43
5. Conclusions	45
2. Politics, Sovereignty, Remembrance	47
<i>Gerry Simpson</i>	
1. Introduction	47
2. Law and Politics	48
2.1 Impressions of Rome	48
2.2 Political Trials	48
2.3 The International Criminal Court	51
3. Sovereignty and the International	52
3.1 Complementarity	55
3.2 Content	56

3.3	Consent	56
4.	Remembering and Forgetting	59
5.	Conclusion	60

## Part II Jurisdiction and Admissibility

3.	Jurisdiction and Admissibility Issues Under The ICC Statute <i>Iain Cameron</i>	65
1.	Introduction	65
2.	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	66
2.1	Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	67
3.	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Temporis</i>	70
4.	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Personae</i>	70
5.	The Effect of the Territoriality and Nationality Conditions on Jurisdiction	72
6.	Universal and Representation Jurisdiction: Differing Conceptions	76
7.	Triggering Mechanisms and Admissibility Procedure	81
7.1	Admissibility	83
7.2	Procedures for Challenges to Jurisdiction and Admissibility	86
8.	Complementarity in Practice	86
9.	Complementarity and Amnesties	89
10.	Conclusion	91
4.	The Peace and Justice Paradox: The International Criminal Court and the UN Security Council <i>Dan Sarooshi</i>	95
1.	Introduction	95
2.	Security Council Referral of Cases to the ICC	96
3.	The Problem of the Enforcement of ICC Decisions	102
4.	The Potential Clash Between Peace and Justice: The Security Council Versus The ICC Statute	105
5.	The Issue of the Crime of Aggression and the Potential for Review of Security Council Decisions	110
5.1	The Potential for ICC Review of State Action Pursuant to Security Council Resolutions	110
5.2	The Potential for ICC Review of Security Council Resolutions	113
6.	The Legal Consequences of Security Council Resolution 1422	115

## Part III The Crimes

5.	The Unfinished Work of Defining Aggression: How Many Times Must The Cannonballs Fly, Before They Are Forever Banned? <i>William A Schabas</i>	123
----	---	-----

1.	Introduction	123
2.	How Aggression Became The Supreme Crime	124
3.	From Nuremberg to Rome	127
4.	A Way Forward?	135
5.	The Changing Context of the Debate	139
6.	The Crime of Genocide	143
	<i>Christine Byron</i>	
1.	Background to the Crime of Genocide	143
2.	Analysis of Article 6 of the Rome Statute	145
2.1	The <i>Mens Rea</i> of Genocide — The ‘Intent To Destroy, in Whole or in Part, a National, Ethnical, Racial or Religious Group, as Such’	145
2.2	Origins	145
2.3	Development	146
2.4	The Rome Statute	149
2.5	Can the Intent to Destroy be Inferred from the Actions of the Accused?	150
3.	‘Group, As Such’	151
3.1	Origins	151
3.2	Development	153
3.3	The Rome Statute	155
4.	‘National, Ethnical, Racial or Religious’	156
4.1	Origins	156
4.2	Development	157
4.3	The Rome Statute	160
5.	The <i>Actus Reus</i> of Genocide	162
	‘(a) Killing Members of the Group’	
5.1	Origins	163
5.2	Development	164
5.3	The Rome Statute	165
	‘(b) Causing Serious Bodily or Mental Harm to Members of the Group’	
5.4	Origins	166
5.5	Development	167
5.6	The Rome Statute	168
	‘(c) Deliberately Inflicting on the Group Conditions of Life Calculated to Bring about its Physical Destruction in Whole or in Part’	
5.7	Origins	169
5.8	Development	170
5.9	The Rome Statute	171
	‘(d) Imposing Measures Intended to Prevent Births Within the Group’	
5.10	Origins	172
5.11	Development	172

5.12	The Rome Statute	173
	‘(e) Forcibly Transferring Children of the Group to Another Group’	
5.13	Origins	174
5.14	Development	175
5.15	The Rome Statute	176
6.	Conclusion	177
7.	Crimes Against Humanity	179
	<i>Timothy LH McCormack</i>	
1.	Introduction	179
2.	General Issues	182
2.1	Altering the Order of the Article Within the Statute	182
2.2	Eliminating the Requirement of a Nexus With Armed Conflict	184
2.3	Eliminating the Requirement of a Discriminatory Motive	185
3.	The ‘Chapeau’ and Threshold Requirements	186
4.	The Enumerated Specific Acts	189
4.1	Murder	189
4.2	Extermination	190
4.3	Enslavement	191
4.4	Deportation or Forcible Transfer of Population	191
4.5	Imprisonment or Other Severe Deprivation of Liberty	193
4.6	Torture	194
4.7	Sexual Offences	195
4.8	Persecution	196
4.9	Enforced Disappearances	197
4.10	Apartheid	198
4.11	Other Inhumane Acts	200
5.	Conclusion	201
8.	War Crimes	203
	<i>Peter Rowe</i>	
1.	Introduction	203
2.	War Crimes and Crimes of War	204
3.	War Crimes Before The ICC	206
3.1	International Armed Conflicts	206
3.2	Non-International Armed Conflicts	207
3.3	Armed Conflicts	207
3.4	War Crimes under Customary International Law	208
4.	New Treaty Law	208
5.	The Impact of Human Rights	212
5.1	War Crimes as Human Rights Violations	212
5.2	The Jurisdictional Limitations of Human Rights Treaties	214
5.3	Human Rights in Non-International Armed Conflicts	216
6.	The Role of Previous Treaties	217
7.	War Crimes During an International Armed Conflict	220
7.1	Targeting Crimes	222

7.2	Use of Prohibited Weapons	223
7.3	Prohibitions on Particular Means of Combat	225
7.4	Status of Civilians	225
8.	War Crimes in Non-international Armed Conflicts	225
9.	Conclusion	230

## Part IV Liability and Defences

9.	General Principles of Liability in International Criminal Law	233
	<i>Robert Cryer</i>	
1.	Introduction	233
2.	The General Principles of Liability in the Rome Statute	235
2.1	Conduct	235
2.2	Acts and Omissions	236
2.3	Perpetration	240
2.4	Ordering and Soliciting	242
2.5	Aiding and Abetting	247
2.6	Complicity	249
3.	Inchoate Crimes	251
3.1	Inciting Genocide	252
3.2	Attempts	253
4.	<i>Mens Rea</i>	254
5.	Superior Responsibility	257
6.	Conclusion	261
10.	Defences in International Criminal Law	263
	<i>Ilias Bantekas</i>	
1.	Theoretical Underpinnings of Criminal Defences	263
1.1	The Concept of Defence	263
1.2	Distinguishing Between Substantive and Procedural Defences	263
1.3	The Burden of Proof	264
1.4	Justification and Excuse	266
2.	Is There a Place for Domestic Defences in the ICC Statute?	266
3.	Substantive Defences	269
3.1	Superior Orders	269
3.2	Duress and Necessity	274
3.3	Self-Defence	277
3.4	Intoxication	280
3.5	Mistake of Fact or Mistake of Law	281
3.6	Mental Incapacity	282
4.	Inadmissible Defences	283
5.	Conclusion	284

## Part V Evidence and Victims

11.	Evidence Before the ICC	287
	<i>Kevin R Gray</i>	

1.	Introduction	287
2.	Evidence Before International Tribunals	288
2.1	Drafting of Rules	289
2.2	Flexibility versus Prescription	292
2.3	Restrictions on Admissibility	294
3.	Evidence and Human Rights	299
3.1	Presumption of Innocence	300
3.2	Fair Trial	301
3.3	Victims' Rights	302
3.4	Anonymous Witnesses	304
3.5	Prior and Subsequent Sexual Conduct	309
3.6	Video-Link Testimony	310
4.	Appeals on Matters of Evidence	312
5.	Conclusions	313
12.	Victim Participation at the International Criminal Court: A Triumph of Hope Over Experience? <i>Emily Haslam</i>	315
1.	Introduction	315
2.	The Experience of Victim-Witnesses: Objectification?	317
3.	The Development of Victim Participation	320
4.	The Operation of the Victim Participation Scheme	322
4.1	Restraints and Uncertainties	323
5.	Instrumental Participation	324
5.1	The Purpose of Participation	324
5.2	Establishing a Personal Interest in Participation	326
5.3	Distinguishing Between Victims and Victim-Witnesses	327
6.	The Form of Participation	327
6.1	Legal Truth	328
6.2	Legal Story-Telling and the Individual Victim	330
7.	Responding to Participation	332
8.	Conclusion	334
 <b>Part VI National Implementation and Political Responses</b>		
13.	Aspects of National Implementation of the Rome Statute: The United Kingdom and Selected Other States <i>David Turns</i>	337
1.	Introduction	337
1.1	National Implementation of International Criminal Law	337
1.2	The Principle of Complementarity	338
1.3	'Internationalisation' and 'Nationalisation'	339
2.	The United Kingdom	341
2.1	Genocide	341
2.2	War Crimes	342

2.3	Crimes Against Humanity	342
2.4	The UK's International Criminal Court Act 2001	343
3.	Different Approaches within the Common Law Tradition:	
	The Examples of New Zealand and Canada	353
3.1	New Zealand	353
3.2	New Zealand's International Crimes and International Criminal Court Act 2000	354
3.3	Canada	356
3.4	Canada's Crimes Against Humanity and War Crimes Act 2000	358
4.	Comparative Experiences in the Civil Law Tradition:	
	The Examples of Belgium, France and Germany	361
4.1	Belgium	361
4.2	France	366
4.3	Germany	378
5.	Conclusions	387
14.	Political and Legal Responses to the ICC	389
	<i>Dominic McGoldrick</i>	
1.	Introduction	389
1.1	Political and Legal Responses to the ICC	389
1.2	Voting on the Statute	389
1.3	Legal Issues	390
2.	Political Support for the ICC	391
2.1	Regional and Geographical Responses	391
2.2	European Union Member States [15 States]	392
2.3	EU Applicant States (10 Invited States, Plus Turkey)	394
2.4	NATO (19 Member States and 7 Invited States)	394
2.5	Council of Europe	394
2.6	OSCE	395
2.7	Russian Federation	395
2.8	Canada	395
2.9	South America	396
2.10	Central America	396
2.11	Arab States	397
2.12	Africa	397
2.13	Asia	397
2.14	Australia	399
3.	Political Opposition to the ICC — The United States	400
3.1	The US Position Up to the Rome Conference	400
3.2	The US Position on the Statute	402
3.3	Responses to US Objections to the Statute	404
3.4	US Policy Subsequent to the Rome Conference	408
3.5	The US Proposals for a Rule of Procedure and Evidence on Article 98 and on the Relationship Agreement	409
3.6	US Government Departments and the ICC	413
3.7	The US's 'Unsigning' of the Statute	414

3.8	Operations Established or Authorised by the United Nations Security Council: Security Council Resolution 1422 (2002)	415
3.9	The US and Article 98 Agreements	423
3.10	Article 98 Agreements and EU Member States	429
3.11	US Legislative Responses	433
3.12	The American Servicemembers' Protection Act (2002)	435
3.13	US Policy after The Establishment of The ICC — The 'War' on Terrorism	437
4.	Political Opposition to The ICC — Other States	437
4.1	China	437
4.2	Libya	438
4.3	Iraq	438
4.4	Israel	439
4.5	Other States which Voted Against The Statute or Abstained	440
4.6	India	440
5.	Sovereignty, Democracy and Accountability	441
5.1	Sovereignists versus Interdependence	441
5.2	US Ideology and Exceptionalism	442
5.3	US Versus Europe — The Place of International Institutions	445
5.4	Political Accountability	447
5.5	Is the ICC a Delegation of State Powers?	448
6.	Conclusions	449

## Part VII The Significance of the International Criminal Court

15.	The Legal and Political Significance of a Permanent International Criminal Court	453
	<i>Dominic McGoldrick</i>	
1.	Introduction	453
2.	Permanence	453
3.	Ensuring International Justice	456
3.1	Deterrence	456
3.2	Ending the Culture of Impunity	459
3.3	Justice as Legitimacy	460
3.4	Justice as Legality	464
3.5	Justice for Victims	464
3.6	Gender Justice	465
3.7	Justice as Accountability: Recording History and the Search for the Truth	466
3.8	National and International Justice: The Relationship of the ICC with National Investigations and Prosecutions	468
4.	The ICC and The International Institutional Peace And Security Structure	469



5.	The International Legal Order	472
5.1	Historic Step	472
5.2	Public International Law	472
5.3	The Effect of the Attacks on the US on 11 September 2001	474
6.	Conclusions	476
<i>Appendices</i>		479
<i>Index</i>		487