

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxiii

PART ONE: THE CREATION OF TRANSNATIONAL TRUSTS: LAUNCHING THE ROCKET

1. Introduction	3
(A) General	3
(B) Creation and Transfer	4
(C) <i>Inter vivos</i> Trusts—Matters to be Considered	5
2. To What Extent are Matters of Capacity and Essential Validity Excluded from the Hague Trusts Convention?	5
(A) Capacity	5
(i) <i>Whose capacity?</i>	5
(ii) <i>Declarations of oneself as trustee</i>	6
(B) Constitution of Trusts	7
3. Capacity	7
(A) What is Capacity?	7
(i) <i>Status and capacity</i>	7
(ii) <i>Essential validity and capacity</i>	7
4. The Choice of Law Rule for Capacity Questions	10
(A) Capacity and other Branches of the Conflict of Laws	11
(i) <i>Contracts</i>	11
(ii) <i>Capacity to transfer property</i>	15
(B) Trusts and Capacity	16
(i) <i>One question or two?</i>	17
(ii) <i>The transfer of property</i>	17
(iii) <i>The creation of the trust structure</i>	18
(iv) <i>Declarations of oneself as trustee</i>	19
(v) <i>Corporate trustees</i>	19
(vi) <i>Foreign penal rules and rules which infringe English public policy</i>	20
(C) Conclusion	20
5. The Capacity of the Trustee	21

6. The Capacity of the Beneficiary	21
7. The Vesting of Property in the Trustee <i>Inter Vivos</i>	23
(A) Introduction	23
(i) <i>One question or two?</i>	24
(ii) <i>Declarations of oneself as trustee</i>	25
(iii) <i>Intention to create the trust</i>	25
(B) Immovable Property	26
(i) <i>The general rule</i>	26
(ii) <i>Renvoi</i>	26
(C) Tangible Movable Property	28
(i) <i>What does “lex situs” mean?</i>	28
(ii) <i>Exceptions</i>	29
(iii) <i>Renvoi</i>	29
(D) Intangible Movable Property	30
(i) <i>The situs</i>	30
(ii) <i>Assignment of debts: the issues raised</i>	31
(iii) <i>Assignability of debts</i>	31
(iv) <i>The assignment of the debt</i>	32
(v) <i>Title to the chose in action</i>	32
(E) Conclusion	33
8. Perpetuities and Accumulations	33
9. The <i>Situs</i> of Equitable Interests and Dealings with Subsisting Equitable Interests	34
(A) General	34
(B) Trusts and Unadministered Estates	34
(C) Beneficial Interests and Rights to Enforce a Trust	35
(D) A Principled Answer	38
10. Transfers of Subsisting Equitable Interests	39
11. Sub-trusts	41
12. Incompletely Constituted Trusts and Trusts of the Benefit of a Covenant	41
13. Testamentary Trusts: Administration of Estates	43
(A) The Need for an English Grant	43
(B) The Jurisdiction of the English Courts	44
(C) Grants obtained in Scotland, Northern Ireland and the Commonwealth	45
(D) Applicable Law	45
(E) Delimiting the Administration of Estates and the Trust	45

14. Testamentary Trusts: the Law Applicable to Succession	46
(A) Testate Succession	47
(i) <i>Movables</i>	47
(B) Intestate Succession	50
(i) <i>Movables</i>	50
(ii) <i>Immovables</i>	51
(C) Renvoi and Succession	51
15. Capacity to Create a Testamentary Trust	52
16. Essential Validity and Testamentary Trusts	52
(A) General Rule	52
(B) Executor Trustees	53
17. Forced Heirship	54
18. The Potential Impact of the Hague Convention on the Law Applicable to Succession to the Estates of Deceased Persons of 1 August 1989	56
(A) General	56
(B) Forced Heirship, Claw-back and the Hague Trusts and Succession Conventions	57
19. Testamentary Powers of Appointment	59
(A) General	59
(B) Essential Validity	59
(C) Construction	60
(D) Capacity	60
(E) Formal Validity	61
(F) Revocation	61
(i) <i>Subsequent will or codicil</i>	61
(ii) <i>Act of revocation</i>	61
(iii) <i>Subsequent marriage</i>	61
20. Matrimonial Property Regimes	61
(A) General	61
(B) Choice of Law Rules	62
(i) <i>No ante-nuptial contract</i>	62
(ii) <i>Ante-nuptial contracts</i>	63
(C) Matrimonial Property Regimes and the Law Applicable to Succession: Double Recovery and No Recovery	64
21. The Creation of Transnational Trusts in Offshore Jurisdictions	65
(A) The Cayman Islands	66

(B) Bermuda	69
(C) Jersey	72
(D) The Isle of Man	75
22. Conclusion	77

**PART TWO: THE HAGUE CONVENTION ON THE LAW
APPLICABLE TO TRUSTS AND ON THEIR RECOGNITION**

I Evolution and Application	81
1. Background	81
2. The Desirability of an International Trusts Convention	83
3. A Convention Evolves	86
4. Current Status of the Convention	88
5. The Status of the von Overbeck Report	89
6. The Implications of Ratification for Non-Trust States and their Domestic Legal Systems	90
7. An Open-Ended Convention	93
8. Application of the Convention in the United Kingdom: the Time Factor	94
II The Convention's Provisions	99
Preamble	99
Article 1—Functions of the Convention	100
1. Choice of Law	100
2. The Recognition of Trusts	101
Article 2—Characteristics of the Trust	103
1. Introduction	103
2. The General Characteristics	105
3. The Specific Characteristics	107
4. The Characteristics Considered: the “Shapeless” Trust	111
5. Characterisation	116
6. Trusts and the Rome Convention	120
Article 3—Types of Trust Governed by the Convention	123
1. Formalities	123
2. Which Types of Trust are within the Convention?	124
(A) Voluntary Trusts	124
(B) Resulting Trusts	125
(C) Constructive Trusts	128

(D) Statutory Trusts	133
(E) Hayton's Views Considered	133
3. Why Exclude Judicially Created Trusts?	134
(A) General	134
(B) The "Problem" of Recognition of Foreign Judgments in Relation to Trusts	135
(C) "Remedial" Judicial Trusts	137
(D) Trusts Imposing a Continuing Obligation	138
4. The Statutory Extension of the Convention Rules in the United Kingdom	139
(A) The Relevant Provisions	139
(B) A Choice of Law Rule for Resulting and Constructive Trusts?	140
(C) Trusts Arising under the Law of Any Part of the United Kingdom	141
(D) Trusts "Arising" by Judicial Decision	145
(i) <i>A source of complexity</i>	145
(ii) <i>Constructive trusts</i>	145
(iii) <i>Presumed resulting trusts</i>	148
(E) Judgments Entitled to Recognition	148
(F) Conclusion	149
Article 4—Exclusion of Preliminary Matters; the Rocket-Launcher and the Rocket	151
1. Preliminary Matters Excluded from the Convention	151
2. Distinguishing between the "Rocket" and the "Rocket-Launcher"	153
Article 5—Non-trust Jurisdictions	158
1. Application	158
2. <i>Dépeçage</i>	161
3. Categories of Trusts	163
Article 6—Express or Implied Choice of Law	166
1. The Triumph of Settlor Autonomy	166
2. Trusts of Land	169
(A) A Need for the <i>Lex Situs</i> ?	169
(B) The Trusts of Land and Appointment of Trustees Act 1996	171
(C) Trusts for Sale	172
(D) Other Interests in Land	174
(E) A Look Offshore	175
(F) Where no Law is Chosen to Govern the Trust	175
(G) Trusts of Movable and Immovable Property	178
3. A Need for an Objective Connection to the Chosen Law?	179
4. "International" Trusts	182
5. Choice of the Law of a State Comprising Several Territorial Units	184
6. The Need to Choose the Law of a Recognised Legal System	185
7. Multiple Settlements	186
8. Contracts and Trusts	186

9. Consent to the Choice of Law Clause	188
10. Choice of a Legal System minus its Mandatory Rules	190
11. Implied Choice of Law	191
(A) Nature of Implied Choice	191
(B) Implied Choice and the Law of Closest Connection	194
(C) Implied Choice and “The Circumstances of the Case”	196
(D) The Settlor’s Purpose—Implied Choice of a Law by which the Trust is Valid?	198
12. Common Law Authorities on Implied Choice and the Objective Proper Law	198
(A) Relevance	198
(B) Testamentary Trusts	199
(C) <i>Inter Vivos</i> Trusts	201
(D) Implied Intention to Create a Valid Trust?	208
13. The Common Law Cases Evaluated	209
14. Conclusions on Implied Choice of Law	209
15. Which Law Determines whether a Choice can be Inferred?	212
16. Time for Ascertaining an Implied Choice of Law	213
Article 7—The Applicable Law in the Absence of Choice	215
1. Origin and Application	215
2. The Four Factors Considered	218
(A) Place of Administration	218
(B) The <i>Situs</i> of the Trust Assets	220
(C) The Place of Residence or Business of the Trustee	221
(D) The Objects of the Trust and their Place of Fulfilment	222
3. The Relevance of the Place of Residence of the Settlor and Beneficiaries	224
4. Testamentary Trusts	225
5. Objective Factors Pointing to a Non-Trust State	226
6. Validity and the Law of Closest Connection	227
7. Reflections on the Application of Article 7	227
8. Time for Assessing the Law of Closest Connection	228
9. What if the Law of Closest Connection States that Certain Terms of the Trust are not Valid?	229
10. Law of Closest Connection and the Brussels Convention	232
Article 8—Scope of the Applicable Law	233
1. Article 8(1)	233
2. Article 8(2)	235
(A) The Appointment, Resignation and Removal of Trustees, the Capacity to Act as a Trustee and the Devolution of the Office of Trustee	235
(i) <i>Appointment and removal</i>	235
(ii) <i>Capacity of the trustee</i>	237

(B) The Rights and Duties of Trustees among Themselves	239
(C) The Right of Trustees to Delegate in Whole or in Part the Discharge of their Duties or the Exercise of their Powers	240
(D) The Power of Trustees to Administer or to Dispose of Trust Assets, to Create Security Interests in the Trust Assets, or to Acquire New Assets	241
(i) <i>Administration</i>	241
(ii) <i>The trustee's power to deal with and acquire trust property</i>	242
(E) The Powers of Investment of Trustees	243
(F) Restrictions upon the Duration of the Trust, and upon the Power to Accumulate the Income of the Trust	244
(G) The Relationships between the Trustees and the Beneficiaries including the Personal Liability of the Trustees to the Beneficiaries	245
(i) <i>Personal and vicarious liability</i>	245
(ii) <i>Who is a "beneficiary"?</i>	245
(iii) <i>Fiduciary duties owed by the trustee to the beneficiary</i>	246
(iv) <i>Liability and remedies</i>	253
(v) <i>Trustees' liability to third parties</i>	254
(vi) <i>Third parties' liability to trustees: personal and proprietary claims</i>	254
(H) The Variation or Termination of the Trust	256
(i) <i>Variation of trusts</i>	256
(ii) <i>Termination of trusts</i>	270
(iii) <i>Variation, termination and administration</i>	270
(I) Distribution of the Trust Assets	271
(J) The Duty of Trustees to Account for their Administration	271
3. Formal Validity of the Trust	272
(A) The Need for a Choice of Law Rule to Determine the Formal Validity of a Trust	272
(B) The Choice of Law Rule	274
4. Formation and Essential Validity of the Trust	276
(A) Essential Validity of the Trust	276
(B) Existence of the Trust	278
(C) The Terms of the Trust	280
Article 9—Splitting the Applicable Law; the Administration of Trusts	281
1. The Right to Split the Trust	281
2. Severable Parts of the Trust	282
3. Distinguishing Validity from Administration	283
4. Splitting the Law in the Absence of Choice	289
5. Choice of the Law of a Non-Trust State to Govern Part of the Trust	289
6. Matters which Cannot be Controlled by the Terms of the Trust	290
7. The Administration and Validity of Charitable Purpose Trusts	291
(A) Validity	291
(B) Administration	292
(C) Settling a Charitable Scheme; the <i>Cy-près</i> Doctrine	293
8. Non-Charitable Purpose Trusts	295

Article 10—Changing the Applicable Law	297
1. Motivation for, and Permissibility of a Change of Governing Law	297
2. A New Law of Closest Connection	298
3. Change of Law and Variation of Trusts	299
4. The Role of the Law Initially Governing the Trust	299
5. Particular Issues Relating to Change of Law	301
(A) Retrospective Change	301
(B) Other Relevant Laws	301
(C) Severable Elements of the Trust	303
(D) Changing the Law Applicable to a Charitable Purpose Trust	304
6. One Trust or Two?	304
7. Changes to the Content of the Law Applicable to the Trust	306
8. Determining and Changing the Place of Administration	308
 Article 11—The Recognition of Trusts	 311
1. The Need for Article 11	311
2. Article 11(2)—a Uniform Law?	313
3. The Specific Requirements of Recognition: Article 11(3)(a)–(c)	314
(A) Uniform Law?	314
(B) Trusts Assets and Claims against the Settlor	314
4. The Inter-Relationship of Articles 11, 15 and 16	315
5. Italian Courts and the Separate Fund	315
6. Does the Convention Require a Contracting State to Acknowledge the Separate Status of the Trust Assets from the Trustee’s Personal Assets?	317
(A) The Issue	317
(B) Interpretation in Italy	319
(C) The Netherlands	319
7. Following and Tracing the Trust Assets: Article 11(3)(d)	321
(A) The Dominance of the Law Governing the Trust	321
(B) Third Parties and the Residual Role of the Conflicts Rules Designated by the Law of the Forum	322
(C) Tracing Trust Assets or their Value into a Mixed Fund Held by a Third Party	323
(D) The Position of Third Party Purchasers of Trust Property Acting in Good Faith	324
(E) Consequences in the United Kingdom	326
(F) Constructive Trusts and Third Parties; Proprietary Effects of the Convention; Application in The Netherlands	326
(G) Reflection on Article 11(3)(d)	329
8. “Translating” the Trust into Civil Law Systems	330
(A) Scope of Discussion	330
(B) Possible Approaches	331
(C) Contractual Approaches	331
(D) The Trust as a Company	332

(E) Agency and Mandate	334
(F) Testamentary Trusts and Powers of Revocation	335
9. The Hague Convention—the Death of Translation	335
Article 12—Registration of the Trust	337
1. Registration Permissible	337
2. Prohibition of Registration	337
3. English Reaction	338
4. Registration in Italy	339
5. Facility or Obligation?	340
Article 13—Right to Refuse Recognition to Trusts Objectively Connected to Non-trust States	341
1. The Purpose of Article 13: A Necessary Compromise?	341
2. The United Kingdom	342
3. Application of Article 13	343
(A) General	343
(B) “Significant Elements”	346
(C) The Time Factor	348
(D) Partial Recognition	349
(E) The Consequences of Non-recognition	349
(F) Application in Italian Courts	350
Article 14—Freedom to Adopt more Liberal Recognition Rules	354
Article 15—Preservation of Mandatory Rules in Related Areas of Law	355
1. Function	355
2. Nature of Mandatory Rules	355
3. Domestic and International Mandatory Rules	356
4. Characterisation, the Trust and Article 15: is Mutual Exclusivity Impossible?	357
5. Article 15 and the “Rocket-Launcher”	360
6. Must a Judge Apply the Mandatory Rules of the Law Designated by the Conflicts Rules of the Forum?	361
7. Application of Article 15	363
8. Particular Matters Specified in Article 15	363
(A) The Protection of Minors and Incapable Parties	363
(B) The Personal and Proprietary Effects of Marriage	364
(C) Succession Rights, Testate and Intestate, especially the Indefeasible Shares of Spouses and Relatives	365
(i) <i>Forced heirship and the law applicable to the trust</i>	365
(ii) <i>Types of forced heirship rules</i>	367
(iii) <i>Claw-back claims and inter vivos trusts</i>	368
(iv) <i>Civilian perspective</i>	370
(v) <i>The offshore dimension</i>	371
(vi) <i>Administration of estates</i>	373

(D) The Transfer of Title to Property and Security Interests in Property	373
(E) The Protection of Creditors in Matters of Insolvency	376
(F) The Protection, in other Respects, of Third Parties Acting in Good Faith	377
9. Article 15(2)—Otherwise Giving Effect to the Objects of the Trust	378
Article 16—International Mandatory Rules of the Forum	380
1. Scope	380
2. Article 16(2)—Mandatory Rules of a State of Close Connection; Exclusion in the United Kingdom	381
3. Determining whether a Rule has an International Mandatory Application	383
4. Interaction with Article 15	384
5. Do the Mandatory Rule Provisions of Articles 15 and 16 Fatally Undermine the Convention?	385
Article 17—Exclusion of <i>Renvoi</i>	387
1. The Case for Exclusion Evaluated	387
2. Express Choice of a State’s Private International Law Rules	388
3. <i>Renvoi</i> and Related Areas of Law	389
Article 18—Public Policy	390
1. Scope	390
2. The Inter-Relationship of Articles 18 and 15	392
3. Public Policy of a State of Close Connection	393
4. STAR Trusts	395
Article 19—Exclusion of Fiscal Matters	397
1. A Neutral Approach	397
2. The United Kingdom	397
(A) Article 19 Not Enacted	397
(B) Refusal to Enforce Foreign Revenue Laws	398
3. Taxation and Civil Law States	399
(A) General Comment	399
(B) The Netherlands	400
(C) Italy	400
Article 20—Right to Extend Convention to other Types of Trust	402
Article 21—Right to Restrict Recognition to Trusts Governed by the Law of a Contracting State	404
1. A Compromise	404
2. Time for Ascertaining the Contracting Status of the State whose Law is Applicable	405

3. Change of the Applicable Law from that of a Non-Contracting State to that of a Contracting State	405
Article 22—Time-frame of the Convention	406
Article 23—States Consisting of Several Territorial Units	409
Article 24—Application of Convention between Territorial Units of a State	410
1. The Permissibility and Desirability of Excluding the Convention’s Application to Disputes between a State’s Territorial Units	410
2. Intra-United Kingdom Conflicts	411
Article 25—Relationship to other International Conventions	412
Article 26—Reservations to the Convention’s Scope	414
1. Final Clauses—Chapter V	414
2. Application of Article 26	414
Article 27—Accession of Member States	415
Article 28—Accession of Non-member States	416
Article 29—Application of the Convention to Selected Territorial Units of a State	417
Article 30—Entry into Force	418
Article 31—Denouncing the Convention	419
Article 32—Notification Process	420
Signature Clause	420
III CONCLUSION	
1. Much Ado about Little?	421
2. The Criticisms Evaluated	422
3. Looking Back and Looking Forward	425

PART THREE: CONCLUSION	429
Conclusion	431
Table of Current Ratification Status of the Convention	432
<i>Appendices</i>	435
1. The Convention on the Law Applicable to Trusts and on Their Recognition	435
2. The Recognition of Trusts Act 1987	443
3. The Explanatory Report to the Convention by Professor A von Overbeck	449
<i>Bibliography</i>	497
<i>Index</i>	511