

Contents

Table of Cases

xiii

1 Introduction

1. Background	1
2. The <i>Lockerbie</i> Case	2
2.1. The Provisional Measures Phase	2
2.2. The Preliminary Objections Phase	6
2.2.1. Objections Relating to Jurisdiction	7
2.2.2. Objections Relating to Admissibility	9
2.3. The Current State of Affairs	11
3. The Case of <i>Bosnia and Herzegovina v Serbia and Montenegro</i>	12
4. Issues Identified for Analysis	15
4.1. Chapter Overview	17

Part I: Judicial Review

2 Advisory Opinions of the International Courts of Justice (ICJ) as a Mechanism for Judicial Review

1. Introduction	25
2. Exercising Review through Advisory Opinions	30
2.1. Legitimizing the Concept of Peace-Keeping (<i>Certain Expenses</i> Opinion)	30
2.2. Termination of Mandates (<i>Namibia</i> Opinion)	34
2.2.1. Did the Security Council Enforce Termination under Chapter VII?	37
3. Questions Relating to Judicial Review through Advisory Opinions	42
3.1. The Political Question Doctrine	43
3.1.1. The Competence of the General Assembly and Security Council to Request Advisory Opinions	43
3.1.2. The ICJ's Discretion to Refrain from Rendering Advisory Opinions	47
3.1.3. The ICJ's Reluctance to Refrain from Rendering Advisory Opinions	48
3.2. Abusing the Advisory Opinion Procedure to Address Disputes between States	53

4.	Legal Effects of Advisory Opinions	55
4.1.	General	55
4.2.	The Consequences of a Determination of (Il)legality of a binding Security Council Resolution	58
5.	The Reluctance of the United Nations Organs to Request Advisory Opinions	61
6.	The Secretary-General and Advisory Opinions	63
7.	Conclusion	67
3	Judicial Review as an Emerging General Principle of Law and its Implications for Contentious Proceedings Before the ICJ	
1.	Introduction	69
2.	Legal Implications of the <i>Lockerbie</i> Case for Judicial Review in Contentious Proceedings	72
2.1.	Legal Implications of the Rejection of Provisional Measures	72
2.2.	Legal Implications of the Rejection of the Preliminary Objections	74
3.	The Meaning of 'General Principles of the Law Recognised by Civilised Nations'	79
3.1.	Identifying the Transferable Elements of General Principles in Municipal Law	84
3.2.	The ICJ's Approach to General Principles of Law	87
3.3.	The Significance of Municipal Analogies for International Organisations	90
4.	The Constitutional Character of the Charter	92
4.1.	The Charter as a Normative Framework	94
4.2.	Supremacy and Inclusivity of a Constitution	97
4.3.	The Dynamic and Evolutionary Nature of the Charter	100
4.3.1.	Charter Evolution and the Travaux Préparatoires	104
4.4.	The Separation of Powers	109
4.4.1.	Characterising the Powers of the Security Council	112
5.	The Growing Significance of Judicial Review in Municipal Orders Since the 1990s	116
5.1.	Legitimation of Political Discretion as the Motivating Rationale of Judicial Review	119
5.2.	Difference in Implementation of Judicial Review and its Consequences	123
6.	Conclusion	127

**Part II: Limitations to the Security Council's
Chapter VII Powers**

4	Limits to the Security Council's Discretion under Article 39 of the Charter	
1.	Introduction	133
2.	The Nature of the Security Council's Discretion Under Article 39	134
2.1.	A Threat to Peace	138
2.2.	A Breach of the Peace	144
2.3.	An Act of Aggression	145
3.	The Existence of a Threat to Peace According to Security Council Practice	149
3.1.	The Double Strategy	150
3.2.	(Possible) Deviations from the Double Strategy?	155
3.2.1.	Somalia	155
3.2.2.	Haiti	158
3.2.3.	Angola	162
3.2.4.	East Timor	164
3.2.5.	International Terrorism	167
3.2.6.	HIV/AIDS	172
4.	Conclusion	174
5	An Overview of the Substantive Limits to the Security Council's Discretion under Articles 40, 41 and 42 of the Charter	
1.	Introduction	178
2.	The Nature of the Security Council's Discretion Under Articles 40, 41 and 42 of the Charter	182
3.	<i>Ius Cogens</i> as a Substantive Limit to Security Council Discretion	187
4.	The Purposes and Principles of the Charter as a Substantive Limit to Security Council Discretion	191
4.1.	The Meaning of the Principle of Good Faith	195
4.2.	The Interaction between the Principle of Good Faith and Respect for Fundamental Human Rights	198
4.2.1.	The Limitation of Human Rights by the Security Council	200
4.3.	The Interaction between the Principle of Good Faith and Respect for Basic Norms of International Humanitarian Law	204
4.3.1.	The Limitation of International Humanitarian Law by the Security Council	207

4.3.2.	Core Elements of International Humanitarian Law	211
5.	Conclusion	215
6	Limits to the Security Council's Discretion to Impose Economic Sanctions	
1.	Introduction	217
2.	Human Rights Limitations to Economic Sanctions	219
2.1.	The Right to Life	219
2.2.	The Right to Health	222
2.3.	Monitoring Human Rights Obligations	225
3.	Implications for Security Council Practice	226
3.1.	Iraq	226
3.1.1.	The Impact on the Right to Life and the Right to Health	227
3.1.2.	Monitoring	233
3.2.	Former Yugoslavia	236
3.2.1	The Impact on the Right to Life and the Right to Health	240
3.2.2.	Monitoring	242
3.3.	Haiti	243
3.3.1.	The Impact on the Right to Life and the Right to Health	243
3.3.2.	Monitoring	245
3.4.	Summary	247
4.	The Right to Self-Defence as a Limitation to Economic Sanctions	248
5.	Conclusion	250
7	Limits to the Security Council's Discretion to Authorise States and Regional Organisations to use Force	
1.	Introduction	256
2.	Authorising Individual States to Engage in Military Enforcement Operations	260
2.1.	Legal Basis for the Mandate	260
2.2.	The Necessity of Overall Command and Control by the Security Council	265
2.3.	The Meaning of Overall Command and Control by the Security Council	268
3.	Security Council Practice vis-à-vis Individual States	273
3.1.	North Korea	275
3.1.1.	The Implications of North-Korea's Non-Membership of the United Nations	275

3.1.2.	The Transferral of the Overall Control to the General Assembly	278
3.2.	Iraq	280
3.2.1.	The Basis and Scope of the Mandate	280
3.2.2.	The Absence of a Mandate for the Military Interventions Following Resolution 687 (1991)	284
4.	Authorising Regional (Defence) Organisations to Engage in Military Enforcement Operations	290
4.1.	The Legal Basis for the Mandate	290
4.2.	The Necessity of Prior Authorisation by the Security Council	294
5.	Security Council Practice vis-à-vis Regional (Defence) Organisations	297
5.1.	ECOMOG in Liberia	298
5.2.	ECOMOG in Sierra Leone	301
5.3.	NATO in Former Yugoslavia	304
5.3.1.	The Absence of a Security Council Mandate for the Kosovo Air-Campaign	305
6.	Conclusion	308
8	Limits to the Security Council's Discretion to Authorise the Civil Administration of Territories	
1.	Introduction	311
2.	The Legal Basis of the Mandates	315
3.	The Obligation of the United Nations (Authorised) Civil Administration to Respect Human Rights	319
3.1.	The Monitoring of Human Rights Obligations	322
3.2.	The Implications of the Right to Self-Determination for United Nations Civil Administrations	326
3.2.1.	Implications for Kosovo	329
3.2.2.	Implications for East Timor	332
3.2.3.	Implications for Iraq	335
4.	Conclusion	336
9	Limits to the Security Council's Discretion to Adopt (Quasi-) Judicial Measures	
1.	Introduction	338
2.	(Quasi-) Judicial Measures Pertaining to Individual Criminal Proceedings	341
2.1.	The Creation of the ICTY and the ICTR	341
2.1.1.	The Legal Basis of the Mandates	341
2.1.2.	The Procedural Fairness Guaranteed by the Mandates	342

2.1.3.	The Scope of the Mandates	346
2.2.	The Extradition of Suspected Terrorists	348
2.3.	The Freezing of Assets of Individuals Associated with International Terrorism	352
2.4.	Creating an <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunal for Investigating Persons Suspected of Involvement in International Terrorism	354
3.	(Quasi-) Judicial Measures Pertaining to the Rights of States	357
3.1.	The United Nations Compensation Commission for Iraq	357
3.1.1.	The Nature and Scope of the Mandate	357
3.1.2.	The Lack of Independence of the Compensation Commission	359
3.2.	The Iraq-Kuwait Boundary Demarcation Commission	362
3.2.1.	The Implications of the Territorial Integrity of States for the Powers of the Security Council	362
3.2.2.	The Implications of the Territorial Integrity of States for the Decisions of the Demarcation Commission	366
4.	Conclusion	368
10	Conclusion	
1.	Recapturing the Limitations to the Security Council's Chapter VII Powers	369
2.	Recapturing the Role of the ICJ in Enforcing the Limitations to the Security Council's Chapter VII Powers	372
3.	The Right of States to Reject Illegal Security Council Resolutions as a 'Right of Last Resort'	375
3.1.	The Meaning of Article 25 of the Charter	375
3.2.	The Responsibility of Member States Pertaining to their Human Rights Obligations	378
3.3.	Enforcing the Limitations to the Security Council's Chapter VII Powers through the "Right of Last Resort"	382
	<i>Bibliography</i>	387
	<i>Index</i>	409