

Protecting and Enforcing Life Science Inventions in Europe

under EPC and EU Law - From Antibodies to Zebrafish

von

Dr. rer. nat. Franz-Josef Zimmer, Steven Zeman, Steven M. Zeman, Dr. Jens Hammer, Dr.-Ing. Klara Goldbach, Dr.
Bernd Allekotte

2nd edition, completely revised and updated



Verlag C.H. Beck München 2015

Verlag C.H. Beck im Internet:

www.beck.de

ISBN 978 3 406 47351 7

Zu [Leseprobe](#) und [Sachverzeichnis](#)

schnell und portofrei erhältlich bei beck-shop.de DIE FACHBUCHHANDLUNG

beck-shop.de

Zimmer • Zeman • Hammer • Goldbach • Allekotte
Protecting and Enforcing Life Science Inventions in Europe

beck-shop.de

Protecting and Enforcing
Life Science Inventions
in Europe

under EPC and EU Law
– From Antibodies to Zebrafish –

By

Dr. Franz-Josef Zimmer

Patentanwalt, European Patent Attorney
European Trade Mark Attorney, Munich

Steven M. Zeman, Ph.D.

Patentanwalt, European Patent Attorney
European Trade Mark Attorney, Munich

Dr. Jens Hammer

Patentanwalt, European Patent Attorney
European Trade Mark Attorney, Munich

Dr. Klara Goldbach

Patentanwältin, European Patent Attorney
European Trade Mark Attorney, Munich

Dr. Bernd Allekotte, LL.M. (Columbia)

Rechtsanwalt, Attorney-at-Law (New York), Munich

2nd edition, completely revised and updated,
2015

C.H. Beck · Hart
Nomos · Helbing Lichtenhahn

beck-shop.de

The opinions expressed by the authors in this book are personal opinions. They do not represent the position of Grünecker as a firm, nor need they apply in matters which any of the authors represent for their clients.

Published by

Verlag C.H.BECK oHG, Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany,
e-mail: bestellung@beck.de

Co-published by

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW, United Kingdom, online at: www.hartpub.co.uk; published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing, c/o International Specialized Book Services, 930 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300, Portland, OR 97213-3786, USA, eMail: orders@isbs.com

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG, Waldseestraße 3–5, 76530 Baden-Baden, Germany,
e-mail: nomos@nomos.de

and

Helbing Lichtenhahn Verlag, Elisabethenstrasse 8, 4051 Basel, Switzerland,
e-mail: info@helbing.ch

ISBN 978 3 406 47351 7 (C.H.BECK)
ISBN 978 1 84946 911 1 (Hart)
ISBN 978 3 8487 1781 1 (Nomos)
ISBN 978 3 7190 3546 4 (Helbing Lichtenhahn)

© 2015 Verlag C.H.BECK oHG
Wilhelmstraße 9, 80801 München, Germany

Typeset by: Textservice Zink, 74869 Schwarzach
Printed and bound in Germany by Beltz Bad Langensalza GmbH
Neustädter Straße 1–4, 99947 Bad Langensalza

Printed on acid-free non-aging paper
(made from cellulose bleached without using chlorine)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without prior permission of C.H.BECK, or as expressly permitted by law under the terms agreed on with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction should be addressed to C.H.BECK under their address mentioned above.

Preface to the second edition

Eighteen years have passed since the first edition of this book was published in 1997. This period has witnessed rapid development in the life sciences. Many biotechnology companies then on the cutting edge of research and development no longer exist, while others have taken their place to push that edge yet further. The sequencing of the human genome, completed several years after the first edition of this book appeared, has ushered in a new era of therapeutics, based not only on the elucidation of the many new genes made available, but also on the genes belonging to any one particular individual. The result has been the dawn of personalized medicine. Biologics now make up a significant proportion of today's blockbuster drugs and of these, many are antibody-based therapeutics. Embryonic stem cells bear the potential to raise the standard of health in society, while simultaneously challenging that society with serious ethical questions. Advances in the genetic engineering of plants are rapidly changing our answers to one of the most ancient and fundamental questions of human survival: What do we and our children eat? Finally, transgenic animals have become indispensable tools in modeling diseases which threaten our health. Yet how do we strike an ethically defensible balance between our desire for better health and potential animal suffering?

These and other issues continue to occupy both researchers and Legislators at the beginning of the 21st century. Legislators and Boards of Appeal in the European Patent Office have invested considerable effort over the last two decades to adjust the law and practice governing life science inventions to the rapidly changing technological landscape. The number of changes in law and its interpretation during this period stands as testament to what an active field life science research continues to be. Motivated by these changes since this book's first edition, and encouraged by repeated inquiries from friends and colleagues around the world, we felt the time had come for an updated edition of our handbook on patenting in the life sciences.

Despite the many developments mentioned above, the basic nature and intended audience of our book remain unchanged. As for the first edition, the present second edition is intended as a practical handbook to assist those active in the life sciences who are interested in converting the fruits of their research into protective, enforceable rights in Europe. This book does not intend to present an exhaustive account of all legal developments and decisions within the life science field; other existing books admirably meet this call. Rather, we intend to convey a sense of the requirements for patentability as well as the issues influencing patent enforcement by presenting illustrative examples of relevant decisions and claims. In this way, we intend this book to serve as a starting point for those readers who may not have attorney training, but still require general

guidance as to the factors influencing patent protection for life science inventions, and examples of claim language used to capture them. As in the first edition, each section of the book contains both generic and specific examples of claim language to this end.

At the same time, the content of the second edition differs in several important aspects from its predecessor. In December 2007, the EPC-2000 went into force. The EPC-2000 represented the most comprehensive overhaul of the European Patent Convention since its inception in 1973, and included the incorporation of many new material provisions relevant to the life sciences. In fact, many major changes in the EPC related to the European Directive 98/44/EC on the Legal Protection of Biotechnological Inventions. This Biotech Directive was not yet in force when the first edition went to press, and was only implemented in the EPC in 1999. Such fundamental statutory changes would alone have warranted an update of any book based on the old provisions of 1973.

Where the first edition focused primarily on biotechnological subject matter, the present edition addresses the broader field of life sciences. This includes a more detailed treatment of chemistry, particularly as relevant to small molecule therapeutics not offered in the first edition.

A further important difference between this second edition and its predecessor is the choice to now omit all treatment of German national law and practice. While Germany indeed continues to lead the European pharmaceutical market, Applicants increasingly prefer obtaining patent protection in Germany via a European patent application examined and granted centrally in the European Patent Office. By virtue of the simple volume of cases handled by the EPO, this office has become the clear trendsetter in the development of new case law relating to life science inventions. Under these circumstances an exclusive focus on Europe in the present edition seemed appropriate.

Finally, this second edition adds a chapter on the enforcement of patent rights throughout Europe. It is said that the real value of a patent becomes clear only when it is enforced. True to this notion, the new chapter addresses issues of enforcement both within and – especially important in Europe where borders are so close together – between European states. It is our hope that this new chapter will provide a helpful impression of the scope in which a patent may be enforced against a putative Infringer, as well as the factors to consider so that such enforcement has the best chances of succeeding.

The further development of life science technology and law will not cease with the publication of this second edition; the field is in constant flux, and this flux is a good thing. For the purposes of preparing the present manuscript, however, we were forced to draw a line, beyond which further developments could no longer be considered. We drew this line at August 1, 2014. Legal developments and case law after this date could not be taken into account in this edition.

The present book thus represents a practical snapshot of the legal landscape surrounding the patenting and enforcement of life science inventions in Europe up to late 2014. It is our hope that this book will assist the interested reader with his or her entry into this exciting field.

Munich, September 2014

Franz-Josef Zimmer
Steven M. Zeman
Jens Hammer
Klara Goldbach
Bernd Allekotte

beck-shop.de

Table of Contents

Preface to the second edition	V
Abbreviations	XVII
A. Life Science Matter	1
A.I. Summary of historical development	1
A.II. Definition of life science matter	2
B. Legal Provisions	3
B.I. European Patent Convention (EPC)	3
B.II. EU Law	5
B.II.1. EU Biotech Directive and its Implementation into the EPC	5
B.II.2. EU Regulations Concerning the Creation of a Supplementary Protection Certificate (SPC) for Medicinal Products (MSPC), Pediatric Extension of Duration for Medicinal Products (PE) and Plant Protection Products (PSPC)	5
B.II.3. Council Regulation on Community Plant Variety Rights (CPVR)	6
B.II.4. EU Bolar Directive	6
C. General Aspects on Protection	7
C.I. Protection under the EPC	7
C.I.1. Non-patentable matter	7
C.I.1.a. Discoveries	7
C.I.2. Exceptions to patentability	9
C.I.2.a. Inventions contrary to “ordre public” or morality	9
C.I.2.b. Plant and animal varieties	14
C.I.2.b.a. Plant Varieties	14
C.I.2.b.b. Animal Varieties	15
C.I.2.c. Essentially biological processes for the production of plants or animals	16
C.I.2.d. Methods for treatment of the human or animal body by surgery or therapy and diagnostic methods practised on the human or animal body	20
C.I.3. Requirements for grant	27
C.I.3.a. Novelty, inventive step and industrial application	27
C.I.3.a.a. Naturally occurring products	27
C.I.3.a.b. Products for use in methods for treatment of the human or animal body by surgery, therapy or diagnostic methods practiced on the human or animal body	28
C.I.3.a.c. Processes of analogy	28
C.I.3.b. Sufficiency of disclosure	29
C.I.3.b.a. Nucleotide and amino acid sequences	37
C.I.3.b.b. Microorganisms	38

C.I.3.c.	Priority	40
C.I.3.d.	Person skilled in the art	43
C.I.3.e.	Claims	45
C.I.3.e.a.	Claim categories	46
C.I.3.e.b.	Clarity of claims	47
C.I.3.e.c.	Support of claims by description	49
C.I.3.e.d.	Claims for medicinal products	51
C.I.3.e.e.	Unity of invention	52
C.I.3.f.	Description	54
C.I.3.f.a.	Selection inventions	54
C.I.3.f.b.	Divisional applications	56
C.I.3.f.c.	Quality and filing of data	58
C.II.	Protection under the EU Regulations	61
C.II.1.	SPCs	61
C.II.2.	Protecting plants under the CPVR	66
C.II.2.a.	General background	66
C.II.2.b.	Formal and substantive requirements for grant of a new plant variety right; legal recourse	67
C.II.2.c.	Form and duration of the Community Plant Variety Right	68
D.	Protectable Matter in the Life Sciences	71
D.I.	Small Molecules and Polymers	71
D.I.1.	Product claims for low molecular products and polymers	73
D.I.2.	Process claims for low molecular products and polymers	77
D.I.3.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for low molecular products and polymers	78
D.II.	Nucleic acids	79
D.II.1.	Introduction	79
D.II.2.	Protecting nucleic acids under the EPC	80
D.II.2.a.	Discoveries	80
D.II.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public”	81
D.II.2.c.	Methods of treatment	82
D.II.2.d.	Novelty	82
D.II.2.e.	Inventive Step	87
D.II.2.f.	Industrial application	96
D.II.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure	97
D.II.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims	106
D.II.2.i.	Product claims for nucleic acids	109
D.II.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by functional terms	111
D.II.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by part or all of the amino acid sequence of the encoded protein	117
D.II.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by part or all of the nucleic acid sequence itself	119
D.II.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by parameters	122
D.II.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by reference to a deposited microorganism or deposited DNA	124
D.II.2.i.f.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by a process for its preparation	125
D.II.2.i.g.	Product claims comprising nucleic acids as essential elements	127

D.II.2.i.h.	Product claims for certain types of nucleic acids and methods of using same	129
D.II.2.j.	Process claims for nucleic acids	131
D.II.2.j.a.	Process claims involving genetic engineering or synthesis	132
D.II.2.j.b.	Process claims involving isolation from a nucleic acid source	132
D.II.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for nucleic acids	135
D.III.	Proteins	137
D.III.1.	Introduction	137
D.III.2.	Protecting proteins under the EPC	137
D.III.2.a.	Discoveries	138
D.III.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public”	139
D.III.2.c.	Methods of treatment	139
D.III.2.d.	Novelty	139
D.III.2.e.	Inventive step	145
D.III.2.f.	Industrial application	154
D.III.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure	156
D.III.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims	161
D.III.2.i.	Product claims for proteins	166
D.III.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing a protein by functional terms	166
D.III.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing a protein by parameters	168
D.III.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing a protein by the coding capacity of a certain DNA	171
D.III.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing a protein by its structure	172
D.III.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing a protein by a process for its preparation	175
D.III.2.i.f.	Product claims comprising proteins as essential elements	177
D.III.2.j.	Process claims for proteins	179
D.III.2.j.a.	Process claims involving isolation from a natural environment	179
D.III.2.j.b.	Process claims involving synthesis by recombinant host cells	180
D.III.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for proteins	183
D.IV.	Antibodies	184
D.IV.1.	Introduction	184
D.IV.2.	Protecting antibodies under the EPC	184
D.IV.2.a.	Discoveries	185
D.IV.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public”	186
D.IV.2.c.	Methods of treatment	186
D.IV.2.d.	Novelty	186
D.IV.2.e.	Inventive Step	189
D.IV.2.f.	Industrial application	195
D.IV.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure	195
D.IV.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims	200
D.IV.2.i.	Product claims for antibodies	203
D.IV.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by functional terms	205
D.IV.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by parameters	209
D.IV.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by the coding sequence of a certain DNA	210
D.IV.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by its structure	210
D.IV.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by a process for its preparation	213
D.IV.2.i.f.	Product claims comprising antibodies as essential elements	215
D.IV.2.j.	Process claims for antibodies	216
D.IV.2.j.a.	Process claims involving isolation from a natural environment	216

D.IV.2.j.b.	Process claims involving synthesis by a recombinant host cell	216
D.IV.2.j.c.	Process claims involving secretion by hybridomas	217
D.IV.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for antibodies	218
D.V.	Microorganisms	219
D.V.1.	Introduction	219
D.V.2.	Protecting microorganisms under the EPC	219
D.V.2.a.	Discoveries	220
D.V.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public”	221
D.V.2.c.	Methods of treatment	221
D.V.2.d.	Novelty	221
D.V.2.e.	Inventive step	222
D.V.2.e.a.	Inventive step in cases where the microorganism is a hybridoma	222
D.V.2.e.b.	Inventive step in cases where the microorganism is not a hybridoma	224
D.V.2.f.	Sufficiency of disclosure	226
D.V.2.f.a.	Necessity of a deposit	226
D.V.2.f.b.	Other requirements for sufficiency of disclosure	229
D.V.2.f.c.	Reproducibility with certainty	233
D.V.2.g.	Clarity and support of claims	235
D.V.2.g.a.	Functional features in claims	235
D.V.2.g.b.	Clarity and the view of the skilled person	236
D.V.2.h.	Product claims for microorganisms	238
D.V.2.h.a.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by functional terms	239
D.V.2.h.b.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by a certain DNA or plasmid	240
D.V.2.h.c.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by parameters	242
D.V.2.h.d.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by a process for its preparation	243
D.V.2.h.e.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by its deposit number	244
D.V.2.i.	Process claims for microorganisms	245
D.V.2.i.a.	Process claims for preparing a microorganism	245
D.V.2.i.b.	Process claims involving use of a microorganism	248
D.V.2.j.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for microorganisms	251
D.VI.	Plants	252
D.VI.1.	Introduction	252
D.VI.2.	Protecting plants under the EPC	253
D.VI.2.a.	Morality and “ordre public”	253
D.VI.2.b.	Plant varieties and essentially biological processes	253
D.VI.2.b.a.	Plant varieties	254
D.VI.2.b.b.	Essentially biological processes	256
D.VI.2.c.	Sufficiency of disclosure	260
D.VI.2.d.	Clarity and support of claims	264
D.VI.2.e.	Natural plants	266
D.VI.2.e.a.	Product claims for natural plants	266
D.VI.2.e.b.	Process claims for natural plants	270
D.VI.2.e.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for natural plants	273
D.VI.2.f.	Hybrid plants	274
D.VI.2.f.a.	Product claims for hybrid plants	274
D.VI.2.f.b.	Process claims for hybrid plants	276
D.VI.2.f.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for hybrid plants	278

D.VI.2.g.	Transgenic plants	278
D.VI.2.g.a.	Product claims for transgenic plants	278
D.VI.2.g.b.	Process claims for transgenic plants	284
D.VI.2.g.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for transgenic plants	288
D.VI.2.h.	Parts of plants	288
D.VI.2.h.a.	Highly differentiated parts of plants	290
D.VI.2.h.a.a.	Product claims for highly differentiated parts of plants	290
D.VI.2.h.a.b.	Process claims for highly differentiated parts of plants	292
D.VI.2.h.a.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for highly differentiated parts of plants	294
D.VI.2.h.b.	Undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants	295
D.VI.2.h.b.a.	Product claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants	295
D.VI.2.h.b.b.	Process claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants	298
D.VI.2.h.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants	299
D.VI.2.i.	Summary	299
D.VII.	Animals	300
D.VII.1.	Introduction	300
D.VII.2.	Protecting animals under the EPC	301
D.VII.2.a.	Sufficiency of disclosure	302
D.VII.2.b.	Natural animals	303
D.VII.2.b.a.	Product claims for natural animals	303
D.VII.2.b.b.	Process claims for natural animals	305
D.VII.2.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for natural animals	309
D.VII.2.c.	Transgenic animals	311
D.VII.2.c.a.	Product claims for transgenic animals	311
D.VII.2.c.a.a.	Morality and “ordre public”	311
D.VII.2.c.a.b.	Animal varieties and essentially biological processes	315
D.VII.2.c.b.	Process claims for transgenic animals	318
D.VII.2.c.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for transgenic animals	321
D.VII.2.d.	Parts of animals	322
D.VII.2.d.a.	Product claims for parts of animals	322
D.VII.2.d.b.	Process claims for parts of animals	324
D.VII.2.d.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for parts of animals	327
D.VII.2.e.	Summary	328
D.VIII.	Human Body	329
D.VIII.1.	Introduction	329
D.VIII.2.	Protecting the human body under the EPC	329
D.VIII.2.a.	Human body	330
D.VIII.2.a.a.	Product claims for the human body	330
D.VIII.2.a.b.	Process claims for the human body	330
D.VIII.2.a.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for the human body	332
D.VIII.2.b.	Parts of the human body	333
D.VIII.2.b.a.	Product claims for parts of the human body	333
D.VIII.2.b.b.	Process claims for parts of the human body	335
D.VIII.2.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for parts of the human body	337
D.VIII.2.b.d.	Human stem cells	337
D.VIII.2.b.d.a.	Introduction	337

D.VIII.2.b.d.b.	Totipotent human stem cells	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.c.	Pluripotent human stem cells	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.d.	Cells obtained by somatic cellular nuclear transfer (SCNT)	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.e.	Stem cells obtained by parthenogenesis	340
D.VIII.2.b.d.f.	Adult stem cells	340
D.VIII.2.b.d.g.	Examples for allowed claims in the field of human stem cells	340
D.VIII.2.c	Summary	342
E.	Patent Infringement	343
E.I.	Introduction	343
E.I.1.	Pre-Suit Considerations	343
E.I.2.	Cross-Border Issues	345
E.I.2.a.	General Principles – limited territorial reach	345
E.I.2.b.	Cross-Border Injunction	346
E.I.2.c.	Torpedo Actions	347
E.II.	Scope of Protection	348
E.II.1.	Claim Construction and Literal Infringement	348
E.II.2.	Equivalent Infringement and Purposive Construction	350
E.II.3.	Specific Claim Categories	355
E.II.3.a.	Product Claims/Compound Claims	355
E.II.3.b.	Composition claims	356
E.II.3.c.	Product-by-Process Claims	357
E.II.3.d.	(Second Medical) Use Claims/“Off label” Use	358
E.II.3.e.	Companion Diagnostic Claims	361
E.II.3.f.	Screening Processes and Reach Through Claims	356
E.II.3.g.	SPCs	365
E.II.3.h.	Plant Variety Rights	366
E.II.4.	Effects of the Patent – Overview	367
E.II.5.	Issues particular to the life sciences	368
E.II.5.a.	Bolar Provision	368
E.II.5.b.	Experimental Use	371
E.II.5.c.	Research Tools	372
E.II.5.d.	EU Biotech Directive	373
E.II.5.e.	Limitations of patent protection available to gene sequences – the Monsanto decision	374
E.III.	Enforcement options	375
E.III.1.	Introduction	375
E.III.2.	Cease and Desist Letter	375
E.III.3.	Criminal Proceedings	375
E.III.4.	Border Seizure	376
E.III.5.	Decision on the merits	377
E.III.5.a.	Bifurcation	377
E.III.5.b.	Discovery	378
E.III.5.c.	Preliminary Relief/Preliminary Injunctions	379
E.IV.	Antitrust	382
E.IV.1.	Introduction	382
E.IV.2.	Sector Inquiry (Pharmaceuticals)	383
E.IV.3.	“Pay-for-delay”/Lundbeck decision	384
E.V.	Unitary Patent and Unified Patent Court	385
E.V.1.	Introduction	385
E.V.2.	Language	385

E.V.3.	Unified Patent Court	386
E.V.3.a.	Introduction	386
E.V.3.b.	Structure	386
E.V.3.c.	Jurisdiction	387
E.V.3.d.	Transitional Period and “opt out”	388
E.V.3.e.	Panels	389
E.V.4.	Sources of Law	389
E.V.5.	Provisional Measures	390
E.V.6.	Parties and their Representation before the UPC	390
E.V.7.	Procedural Issues	391
Annexes		
Annex 1	EPC: Articles	393
Annex 2	EPC: Rules – Patentability	400
Annex 3	EPC: Rules – Biological sequences	402
Annex 4	EPC: Rules – Biological deposits	410
Annex 5	EPC: Rules – Form of claims	413
Annex 6	EU-Directive 98/44/EC – Biotech Directive	415
Annex 7	EU Regulations on SPCs (Medicinal products/Plant protection products)	419
Annex 8	EU and international regulations relating to plant varieties	421
Annex 9	Bolar Directives	433
Annex 10	Register of cited decisions	434
Index		443